

**Graduate Council Minutes  
November 29, 2016  
Main Campus, Student Union Room 2582**

Present: Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Frank Calzonetti, Leigh Chiarelott, Michael Dowd, Viviana Ferreira, Rodney Gabel, Bashar Gammoh, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Jason Huntley, Edward Janak, Andrea Kalinoski, Junghwan Kim, Carolyn Lee, Song-Tao Liu, Jyl Matson, Joseph Margiotta, Daryl Moorhead, Lori Pakulski, John Plenefisch, Susan Pocotte, Jennifer Reynolds, Sonmez Sahutoglu, Amal Said, Youssef Sari, Constance Schall, Barry Scheuermann, Joseph Schmidt, Barbara Schneider, Zahoor Shah, Eric Simpson (GSA), Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Jason Stumbo, Jerry Van Hoy, Richard Welsch.

Absent: Bhuiyan Alam, Anand Kunnathur, Marcia McInerney, Madeline Muntersjborn, Martha Sexton.

Excused: Hueys-Shys Chen, Ben Davis, David Jex, Douglas Nims, Geoffrey Rapp.

Guests: Patricia Relue, Richard Francis.

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of October 18, 2016 were approved.

***Executive Reports***

**Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair, Dr. Connie Schall reminded Council that at the last GC meeting the revised faculty qualifications policy (Policy 3364-72-11 –draft revision) was presented. Today, Dr. Joseph Schmidt, chair of the Academic Programs and Regulations Committee, will lead the discussion on proposed changes to the GC Bylaws in membership categories consistent with this policy later in the meeting.

The University of Toledo is exploring the conversion from a 16-week semester calendar to a 15-week semester calendar. The Provost's office and Faculty Senate will hold a town hall meeting on Friday, December 2nd from 4:00 – 5:00 p.m. in Libbey Hall. The Faculty Senate will be discussing this topic at their December 6<sup>th</sup> meeting from 4:00 – 6:00 p.m. in the Health Education Building, Room 103. Dr. Schall encouraged GC members to attend these meetings in order to have an informed discussion at the next GC meeting on December 13<sup>th</sup>.

The Graduate Council Executive Committee (GCEC) reviewed GC Bylaws regarding election to the GCEC. GCEC is currently composed of five elected GC members (out of 32), plus the COGS Dean, VP for Research, GSA President and Past GC Chair. Prior to the annual election of GCEC representatives, Health Science and Main campus colleges are defined by the new GC. Discussion led to questions for the GC members questioning at ten years' post-merger whether the can language dividing the University into Main and Health Science Campuses/colleges be eliminated.

To ensure representation across colleges, should the GCEC be expanded to six or seven elected GC members, limiting each college to no more than one representative on GCEC? The section of the Bylaws pertaining to Graduate Council Officers and the Executive Committee was presented with campus designations highlighted.

**ARTICLE II. GRADUATE COUNCIL OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Section 1. The officers of the GC shall be a Chair, Vice Chair, and three GC voting members. Each GC officer will be elected by secret ballot for a one-year term of office by the members of the GC for the following

year at the last meeting of GC. A Vice Chair will also be elected by the same process, but for a two-year term. The Chair will be the Vice Chair elected in the previous year. In the event that the previous year's Vice Chair is unable to serve as Chair, a new Chair will be elected for a one-year term by the same process as above. Of these five officers at least two must be from colleges on the Main Campus and at least two from colleges on the Health Science Campus. The Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies (COGS) shall serve as Executive Secretary of the Council to review its minutes and prepare them for approval to the GC. The COGS Dean shall designate a COGS staff member to record and transcribe minutes of GC meetings.

Section 2. The Executive Committee of GC (GCEC) shall be composed of the elected officers of GC, the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of COGS, the Vice President for Research, the current President (or Vice President) of the Graduate Student Association (GSA), and the immediate past Chair of GC, ex officio. The Chair of GC shall serve as the Chair of GCEC. On an annual basis, GC will define Main Campus and Health Science Campus prior to elections.

Arts and Letters
Business and Innovation
Engineering
Health and Human Services
Judith Herb College of Education
Law
Medicine and Life Sciences
Natural Sciences and Mathematics
Nursing
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Mr. Eric Simpson, President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

- GSA's next General Assembly meeting will take place on Wednesday, December 7, 2016, on the Health Science Campus (HEB 105) from 6:00 – 8:00 p.m.
- The Midwest Graduate Research Symposium (MGRS) Steering Committee held its first meeting on November 21, 2016. MGRS Steering Committee members began planning and collaborating on assigned tasks for MGRS.
- GSA provided an update on graduate student healthcare concerns/comments. GSA is actively soliciting more feedback from graduate students regarding current plans/coverage.

Report of the Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

- Enrollment  
Registration for Fall 2016 is up 34.5%. Continued effort.  
Applications for fall 2017 are coming in. Prompt reviews and conversions to admit support efforts to increase enrollment.

Marketing and Recruitment events and conferences attended by the college and department personnel may receive some support from COGS. For example, Dr. Tony Quinn attended the Annual Biomedical Research Conference for Minority Students and COGS provided funds for travel and lodging.

- COFFEE WITH COGS

November 14<sup>th</sup> on Main Campus and November 17<sup>th</sup> on Health Science Campus. Approximately 25 UT undergraduate seniors attended seeking graduate school information. We are interacting with them and may direct them to you for more information on specific disciplines.

- Chancellor's Council on Graduate Studies (CCGS) of Ohio Department of Higher Education  
New graduate programs and program modifications recently approved by CCGS:

New Degrees

- WSU Master of Organizational Studies
- KSU Doctor of Nursing Practice

Program Modifications

- OSU Online delivery of MS in Pharmacology
- UA Request for program reactivation of MA in Secondary Education
- KSU Offsite location of M.Ed. and E.Ds. in K-12 Leadership
- UC Post Master's Principal Licensure in Ed. Leadership Program

- Program Development

In January 2017, COGS will put out request for proposals which are innovative, imaginative and high quality, and effectively use our existing resources to attract and retain high quality and diverse populations of students from around the world. Some areas of particular interest are:

- Bachelor's to Master's programs which decrease the time to degree for existing BS and MS programs
- New Bachelor's to Master's programs which include a new Bachelor's or Master's component
- Premium programs such as Executive Master's Programs or Professional Science Master's Degrees
- Interdisciplinary PhDs
- Graduate Certificates

Dr. Gabel replied that COGS has been helpful facilitating program development process.

Dr. Pocotte added that said it would be ideal if it wasn't single faculty driven. She encouraged department/college curriculum committee participation and buy-in.

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### **Research Update**

Dr. Frank Calzonetti, Vice President for Research stated that UT's research enterprise to elevate the University on a national stage while increasing the level of externally-funded research. He provided the following overview of the Office of Research along with several updates:

- Leadership

Dr. Connie Schall has joined the Office of Research as the Associate Vice President for Research  
Dr. Amy Thompson is the first Faculty Fellow in Research serving for a period of one semester.

Research and Sponsored Grants Offices | Main Campus and Health Science Campuses

Location for MC changed to: Research and Technology Complex Building (R1), Suites 2200 & 2300, MS 218

Major areas reporting to the Office are:

- Human Protections & Institutional Review Boards (IRB)
  - Animal Care and Research
  - Institutional Biosafety Committee (IBC)
  - Research Compliance & Institutional Export Control
  - Technology Transfer & Intellectual Property
  - LaunchPad Incubation
  - Rocket Innovations
- University Research Council  
Membership is comprised of a combination of appointments by the President, Faculty Senate and Graduate Council Executive Committee, as well as through *ex officio* membership

Responsibilities Include:

- University Research Funding Opportunities (URFO)
- Centers and Institutes
- Centers of Research Excellence
- Research Misconduct
- Research Policies

Dashboard Goal: June 30, 2016 we were at \$38.3M with a goal of \$42M by the same time in 2017.

Additional information provided in this PowerPoint report/presentation including the following are attached to the minutes.

- Rankings and Expenditures: UT total R&D Expenditure Ranking 2010-2015 and Ohio universities change in R&D ranking 2014 -2015, Expenditures per capita 2015 –major universities compared to UT
- UT Strengths: Interdisciplinary Teams, Research Funding by College, Success Rate Over Time, per capita \$ by Faculty Rank, Faculty numbers by rank, Top Investigators by 6 years, Technology Transfer, Incubation Facilities, Research Support, Strategic Planning, Empowering the Faculty

Discussion:

Dr. Calzonetti emphasized that the time to support research be rewarded and that the Provost supports this effort. Dr. Dowd hoped that department chairs are afforded the latitude to be proactive about course release since they oversee workload and presents to their deans. It was noted that writing grants is not possible for faculty with 3/3 load and that workload adjustment would be needed to accommodate increased grant submissions. Dr. Song Tao Liu noted that although very helpful, the Research Office had been short-staffed. Dr. Calzonetti replied that Research is a responsible unit and has recently centralized its operations to further improve its responsiveness. Other expressed concerns were the cumbersome nature of the KC system and lengthy turnaround time of the IRB system. Dr. Calzonetti responded that the administration understands these concerns

#### Update from Provost's ad hoc committee on Institutional Learning Objectives

Dr. Viviana Ferreira reported that Provost Hsu recently charged an ad hoc committee to propose a set of Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs).

We had our first meeting on Oct. 24<sup>th</sup> and went over various samples of Institutional Learning outcomes from other Universities. It was agreed overall that The Degree Qualifications Profile (DQP) would be a good model to start with. The DQP is the outcome of a national effort supported by the Lumina foundation to guide efforts to

strengthen the quality of associates, bachelors and master's degrees. Using this as a model, we agreed the need to create one set of objectives that include Undergrad, graduate and professional degrees.

A subcommittee met on Oct. 26<sup>th</sup> (Professor Holly Monsos, Dr. Susan Pocotte, Ms. Heather Huntley, Dr. Alana Malik, Dr. Angela Paprocki and Dr. Connie Shriner) and developed a draft of a survey based on the five areas of learning contained in the Degree Qualifications Profile (DQP) graphic.

The committee met on November 16<sup>th</sup> to discuss the survey draft as well as plans for distribution. This meeting was very productive with a draft document that will be distributed soon (the date is to be determined). Dr. Shriner mentioned she will work with HR to distribute the survey to all faculty, staff and students.

Dr. Connie Shriner has met with Dr. Laurie Dinnebeil, one of the co-chairs of the Strategic Planning Steering Committee and Dr. Sharon McDade, the external consultant for the planning project. They both expressed willingness to help promote completion of the survey as part of the strategic planning process. And today, we have a meeting with Dr. McDade.

### ***Standing Committee Reports***

#### Report of the Curriculum Committee

On behalf of the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (GCCC), Chair Dr. Patricia Relue reported that the GCCC reviewed and approved the following curriculum. Council approved unanimously.

#	Type of Proposal	Coll.	Dept.	Proposal Name	Course No.	Summary of proposal
1	ECM	BU	Management	Special Topics in Business	EMBA 6980	Change in cr hrs from 3 to 1-3 (variable). The new approved EMBA curriculum consists of 6 credit hours of special topics/electives courses that the students (cohort) may choose. These courses may be chosen in combinations of 3, 2 or 1 cr hrs.
2	ECM	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Internship I	PHYT 7890	Increase in cr hrs (4 to 5, the clinical experience is being increased from 8 to 10 week), change in title, pre-requisite and catalog description. The name of the course and description are being changed to reflect language used in contemporary practice and physical therapist education. Total time for clinical education in curriculum is unchanged, but is being redistributed among experiences.
3	PRR	BU	Information Operations and Technology Mgmt.	PhD in Manufacturing and Technology Management	NA	Replacement of two courses in the core (FINA 5310, MGMT 5110 replaced by BUAD 6400, 6800); major field courses changed from MFGM 8690, 8830 to MFGM 8510 and MFGM 8810 seminar increased from 2 to 4 cr hrs; dissertation hrs increased from 16 to 17 hr; no change in total hrs (60 post-Masters); Minor field and courses in minor field changed.

#### Report of the Membership Committee

On behalf of the Graduate Council Membership Committee, Chair Dr. Mohamed Samir Hefzy provided the following summary report:

The recent bath of 29 applications were reviewed. Four applications were returned for endorsement and two applications for faculty housed in the Library, one is approved and one is in progress.

A total of 112 graduate faculty membership applications will have been reviewed for fall semester 2016 (44, 29 and 29). Dr. Hefzy stated this will be his last semester serving as chair of the Membership Committee due to his new role serving as Chair of the Graduate Program Review Committee. He thanked all of the members of the Membership Committee for their work on this important committee.

GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS - Fall II 2016 (September 29, 2016 - October 25, 2016)																						
College	Full			Associate			Professional			Adjunct			Special Status			APPLICATION RETURNED/ STILL IN REVIEW			TOTAL			Total
	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	
Business and Innovation										1	1								1	1	0	2
Engineering														1					0	1	0	1
College of Health and Human Services		1	3								3	1				1		1	1	4	5	10
Judith Herb College of Education																			0	0	0	0
College of Arts and Letters		1			2										2				0	3	2	5
College of Law																			0	0	0	0
Medicine and Life Sciences			3																0	0	3	3
Natural Sciences and Mathematics													1						1	0	0	1
Nursing								1			2				1				0	0	4	4
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences														1					0	1	0	1
Honors College																			0	0	0	0
Libraries																1		1	1	0	1	2
Total	0	2	6	0	2	0	0	0	1	1	4	3	1	2	3	2	0	2	4	10	15	29

Report of the Academic Programs and Regulations Committee

Academic Programs and Regulations Committee chair, Dr. Joseph Schmidt, led a second reading of the proposed changes to Article I: Graduate Faculty Membership in the Bylaws of the Graduate Council. He emphasized that a terminal degree is required to teach graduate faculty courses and is now specified in the following membership categories in addition to Full Membership (Associate, Professional and Adjunct) in alignment with university policy and HLC guidelines. Bylaws excerpted for consideration attached for reference.

**(Excerpted for consideration)**

ARTICLE I: GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP

Current; Proposed

- a. Full Membership
  - 1. Qualifications:
    - i. Hold a terminal or earned doctoral degree;
    - ii. Hold a regular tenured or tenure track continuing faculty appointment at the University of Toledo;
    - iii. Be actively engaged in both graduate education and research and continuing scholarly activity; and,
    - iv. Consideration will be given to evidence of successful involvement with graduate students and programs, evidence of significant professional accomplishment and where appropriate, administrative responsibility in graduate education.

- v. Ex-officio membership of graduate faculty, as described in Article II, Section 1 of the Graduate Faculty Constitution.
  2. Duties and privileges of Full Membership:
    - i. Propose, design and teach graduate level courses (including thesis research, scholarly project research and dissertation research);
    - ii. May serve on, or chair, Master's and Doctoral advisory committees, comprehensive examination committees, and graduate projects or internships; and,
    - iii. May vote in elections pertaining to GC and graduate education matters and may serve on GC.
  3. Review and Renewal: Full membership is to be reviewed for renewal every seven years. The result of this review may be:
    - i. Continued Full membership;
    - ii. Associate or Professional membership; or,
    - iii. Revocation of Graduate Faculty membership.
- b. Associate Membership:
1. Qualifications:
    - i. Hold an earned Master's or Doctoral degree or terminal degree; Hold an earned terminal degree; Alternatively, hold an earned Master's degree and possess equivalent experience to a terminal degree as documented through an evaluative review process.
    - a. Hold a regular tenured or tenure track continuing faculty appointment at the University of Toledo; and,
      - ii. Demonstrated responsibility in both graduate education and research including continuing scholarly activity.
  2. Duties and privileges of Associate Membership:
    - i. May serve on, but may not chair, Master's or Doctoral advisory committees and comprehensive examination committees. However, only Graduate Faculty members with doctoral degrees may serve on Doctoral advisory committees. Exceptions to this provision may be addressed with Special Membership status;
    - ii. May serve on, or chair, Scholarly Project committees; may direct internships;
    - iii. May teach graduate level courses (excluding thesis/dissertation research); and,
    - iv. May vote in elections pertaining to GC and graduate education matters and may serve on appropriate committees of GC, but may not serve on GC.
  3. Review and Renewal: Associate membership shall be reviewed within seven years, or sooner if requested. The result of this review may be:
    - i. Promotion to Full membership;
    - ii. Continued Associate membership;
    - iii. Professional membership; or,
    - iv. Revocation of Graduate Faculty membership.
- c. Professional Membership:
1. Qualifications:
    - i. Hold an earned Master's or Doctoral degree or possess an advanced degree or earned distinction; Hold an earned terminal degree; Alternatively, hold an earned Master's degree and possess equivalent experience to a terminal degree as documented through an evaluative review process.
    - ii. Hold a regular continuing faculty appointment at the University of Toledo; and,
    - iii. Be qualified to engage in teaching and service at the graduate level.
  2. Duties and privileges of Professional Membership:

- i. May serve on, but may not chair, Scholarly Project, Master's or Doctoral advisory committees and comprehensive examination committees. However, only Graduate Faculty members with doctoral degrees may serve on Doctoral advisory committees. Exceptions to this provision may be addressed with Special Membership status;
        - ii. May teach graduate level courses (excluding thesis/dissertation research); and,
        - iii. May vote in elections pertaining to GC and graduate education matters, but may not serve on GC or its committees.
  3. Review and Renewal: Professional membership shall be reviewed within seven years or sooner if requested. The result of this review may be:
    - i. Promotion to Full membership or Associate membership;
    - ii. Continued Professional membership; or,
    - iii. Revocation of Graduate Faculty membership.
- d. Adjunct Membership:
1. Qualifications:
    - i. Possess an advanced degree or earned distinction for Adjunct membership on the Main Campus; possess an earned Master's or Doctoral degree for Adjunct membership on the Health Science Campus; Hold an earned terminal degree; Alternatively, hold an earned Master's degree and possess equivalent experience to a terminal degree as documented through an evaluative review process.
    - ii. Does not hold a regular continuing faculty appointment at the University of Toledo. Adjunct membership may be held by visiting and part-time faculty, part-time clinical or visiting appointees, and fellows; and,
    - iii. Adjunct membership must be for a specified period of time and for those professionals who would make a significant contribution to graduate education, research, and service.
  2. Duties and privileges of Adjunct Membership:
    - i. May teach graduate level courses (excluding thesis/dissertation research);
    - ii. May serve on, but may not chair Scholarly Project, Master's or Doctoral advisory committees and comprehensive examination committees. However, only Graduate Faculty members with doctoral degrees may serve on Doctoral advisory committees. Exceptions to this provision may be addressed with Special Membership status; but,
    - iii. May not vote in elections pertaining to Graduate Council or graduate education matters, nor serve on GC or its committees.
  3. Review and Renewal:
    - i. Adjunct members are appointed for a specific period of time, but in no case greater than three years; and,
    - ii. Adjunct Membership may be renewed upon recommendation of the Membership Committee.
- e. Special Membership:
1. Qualifications: The Membership Committee may grant Special Membership to professionals, including but not limited to, University of Toledo lecturers, research faculty and retired UT faculty, who would make a significant contribution to graduate education or research.
  2. Duties and privileges of Special Membership: Special members of the Graduate Faculty will be given responsibilities as enumerated by the Membership Committee from the Duties and Privileges of Full Membership. Individuals holding Special Membership will not vote in elections pertaining to GC or graduate education matters, will not propose new curriculum, and will not serve on GC or its committees.

3. Review and Renewal: Appointment will be for a specific period of time but in no case greater than three years. This membership appointment may be renewed upon recommendation of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies and the Membership Committee.

Dr. Hefzy noted that the changes are clear. The first reading of changes took place at the last GC meeting, November 15, 2016 and the reading on November 29, 2016 was considered the second reading.

[MOTION TO APPROVE THE CHANGES TO ARTICLE I: GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP IN THE BYLAWS OF THE GRADUATE COUNCIL WAS SECONDED AND UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED.]

***Old Business***

None.

***New Business***

Update from Provost's ad hoc committee on Institutional Learning Objectives

Owing to the time limitation, this item of business will be presented at the next GC meeting.

***Adjournment***

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:02 p.m.