

**Graduate Council Minutes  
November 1, 2016  
Main Campus, Student Union 2582**

**Present:** Bhuiyan Alam, Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Frank Calzonetti, Ben Davis, Michael Dowd, Viviana Ferreira, Bashar Gammoh, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Jason Huntley, David Jex, Edward Janak, Andrea Kalinoski, Junghwan Kim, Anand Kunnathur, Carolyn Lee, Song-Tao Liu, Jyl Matson, Marcia McInerney, Daryl Moorhead, Madeline Muntersbjorn, Douglas Nims, Lori Pakulski, John Plenefisch, Susan Pocotte, Geoffrey Rapp, Sonmez Sahutoglu, Amal Said, Youssef Sari, Joseph Schmidt, Barbara Schneider, Martha Sexton, Zahoor Shah, Jessica Sherman (GSA), Eileen Walsh for Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Jerry Van Hoy, Richard Welsch, Kandace Williams.

**Excused:** Huey Shys-Chen, Rodney Gabel, Constance Schall, Barry Scheuermann.

**Absent:** Leigh Chiarelott, Joseph Margiotta, Jennifer Reynolds, Jason Stumbo.

**Guest:** Laurie Dinnebeil, Stephanie Sanders.

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and the roll called.

***Executive Reports***

**Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

Dr. Andrea Kalinoski, Vice Chair, reported that the GCEC discussed the report generated on the distribution of GC membership and rotations with new colleges. A review of the Graduate Council roster and eligible representatives per the current college structures effective July 1<sup>st</sup>, resulted in no additional elected representatives needed. The next guests of GC would be Executive Vice President for Finance and Administration, Mr. Larry Kelley, along with Mr. Terry Romer and Dr. Ying Liu. Questions for consideration should be sent to Chair Schall and Vice Chair by November 7<sup>th</sup>.

**Report of the Graduate Student Association**

Ms. Jessica Simpson, Vice President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

- GSA's next General Assembly meeting will take place on Tuesday, November 8, 2016, on the Main Campus, Student Union, Ingman Room from 6:00 pm – 8:00 pm.
- The GSA Social Committee is hosting a social mixer event that will take place on Friday, November 11, 2016, from 8:00 pm – 12:00 am at Table Forty4 and will be open to all graduate and professional students.
- The MGRS Steering Committee will hold its first meeting on either November 14, 2016 at 7:00 pm or November 21<sup>st</sup> at 7:00 pm. 30-40 judges who are either faculty or post-docs are needed for this event. We will be sending requests for judges.
- As a reminder, the GSA Graduate Student Research Award application is now available online under the GSA tab on the College of Graduate Studies website. The deadline for submission of an application is November 18, 2016 by 5:00 pm.

- The purpose of the GSA graduate student research award is to provide financial support up to \$2,000.00 per recipient for costs associated with approved research projects required for the degree that are not covered by other resources. Tuition, stipend, and travel expenses are excluded.

#### Report of the Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dean Amanda Bryant-Friedrich provided the following updates:

- Graduate and Professional Student Strategic Enrollment Planning work group.

The consulting group Ruffalo Noel Levitz was invited to work with UT in November 2015. Through April 2016 we were in a preparation phase determining KPI's, data sources and situational analyses. September through November 2016 was the Strategy phase developing action plans with strategy development and ROI considerations. December 2016 moves to Enrollment Goals looking at enrollment projections, goal-setting and finalization of a written plan, to be followed by implementation and continuation.

The Ruffalo Noel Levitz concept of Strategic enrollment planning involves:

- Program (academic, co-curricular, services, support)
- Place (on-site, off-site, online, hybrid)
- Price and Revenue (tuition, fees, discounts, incentives)
- Promotion (marketing, recruitment, web presence)
- Purpose and Identify (mission, distinctiveness, brand)
- Process (data-informed, integrated planning)

Key Performance Indicators for the College of Graduate Studies are:

- Enrollment headcount
- Enrollment FTE
- Undergraduate GPA
- Retention
- Graduation Rate
- Gross and net operating revenue
- Diversity

Some College of Graduate Studies Action Plans include:

- Improve GAPA Process, including IT systems support. Programs with large numbers of graduate assistants understand this is cumbersome and COGS is currently working with IT to automate the process and looking at company that works with onboarding students.
- Recruit Back. In looking at why some students are not returning we have discovered that we lost a lot of research-active faculty who took students with them, while others stopped out to work to obtain funds for school.
- COFFEE WITH COGS events are slated for Monday, November, November 14<sup>th</sup> 8:30 -11:00 am on Main Campus in University Hall 3300 and, Thursday, November 17<sup>th</sup> 8:30 -11:00 on the Health Science Campus in the Student Services lobby. This is the first time hosting an event in this format and we will evaluate its effectiveness.

Graduate Student Association officers will attend both sessions to speak directly with current and potential students about graduate school. If the sessions are well received, we will consider holding it or similar type events each semester.

Notification of these sessions will be sent to current graduate students and undergraduate seniors graduating fall semester. It will be posted on COGS website and Facebook.

Discussion:

Dr. Mike Dowd asked if consideration will be given to the cost of graduate education vs. revenue and contribution margins? Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that a lot of attention has been paid to how much it costs to deliver a program. The complexity of contributions and operations revenue as we contribute to teaching mission is a complicated mechanism.

Dr. Kandace Williams questioned the impact of undergraduate GPA of international students who are not on 4.0 scale. Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that the data is needed to understand the quality of GPA.

Dr. Sahutoglu pointed out that KPIs were decided before he arrived at UT, but noted that outcomes and placement rates are important. Outcomes can influence enrollment. Dr. Geoffrey Rapp stressed the importance of employment status. Dr. Sahutoglu replied that demand is a major factor as there may be less demand for programs where students have difficulty getting jobs.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich appreciated the comments and said she will take them into consideration.

Dr. Madeline Muntersbjorn stated that action plans with qualitative data and their placement on website is important. Philosophy, compared to industry and discipline, is doing well.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich responded that action plans take into consideration is given to demand and geography including at the national level and whether under-represented minorities make up 25%, and we should expect to get to that.

Dr. Muntersbjorn expressed concern about the cost of living and low stipend levels. Dr. Jason Huntley noted that the Graduate Council has discussed healthcare costs previously and said that UT loses students to universities who provide healthcare. Dr. Kandace Williams noted that approximately 80% of biomedical programs in the U.S. offer healthcare. Dr. Huntley also pointed out that some faculty recognize that their grants can pay for it.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich agreed that is a major issue that requires a paradigm shift that investment requires excellent students as well.

o Intersession and Shortened Semester

Dean Bryant-Friedrich requested comments from GC to share (position statement) with the Provost. She asked that they be sent to Ms. Terri Hayes-Lepiarz.

***Information and Discussion Items***

Update on the Strategic Planning Process

Dr. Laurie Dinnebeil, Strategic Planning Co-Chair, reported that she and Dr. Tony Quinn, Co-Chair, have been connecting with faculty/staff/students on campus liaising with GC for that purpose. They have been working to quickly develop the process and have already held numerous discussions and listening sessions with constituencies on campus and online.

They have collected information from about 600 people and are digesting that information into a usable format so that the Strategic Planning Council can use to move forward for development and implementation. President Gaber made it clear that this should be a grass roots process that takes into consideration the goals of the university community. The next step is to identify themes and patterns in the data to determine strategic directions.

Discussion:

Dr. John Plenefisch questioned the timing and integration of the various major ongoing planning processes including the Master Plan, Strategic Plan, and Strategic Enrollment Plan. The master plan is farther along so it seems like the cart is leading the horse.

Dr. Dinnebeil recognizes the overlap in the individual plans and stated they should be utilized and folded into the strategic plan.

Ms. Stephanie Sanders, Interim Vice President for Enrollment Management stated that she was surprised by the enrollment projection in the master plan and noted that as enrollment projections are firmed up the adjustment will be updated in the master plan. There is a session this week with the Strategic Planning group and collaboration will continue going forward.

Dr. Mike Dowd added that the current strategic planning is different than in the past. These processes will need to sync up. He indicated that Provost Hsu recognized the usable data/information (20+ pages of the more than 75 pages from the prior plan) as opposed to a visionary statement. Dr. Dinnebeil and Dr. Quinn's leadership has been phenomenal.

Dr. Dinnebeil suggested that additional input be sent to her or Dr. Quinn on the strategic plan via email at [strategicplanning@utoledo.edu](mailto:strategicplanning@utoledo.edu).

Discussion with Ms. Stephanie Sanders, Interim Vice President for Enrollment Management

Ms. Sanders displayed graduate enrollment history of fall census day headcount from fall 2012 to fall 2016. An adult student is defined as a 1<sup>st</sup> year student who does not enroll right after high school for at least one semester. Ms. Sanders began consulting with UT almost a year ago with the Ruffalo Noel Levitz enrollment consulting group that specializes in strengthening higher education. In July 2016, she was asked by the University to help address the issue of declining enrollment with a focus on targeting students with the right message to increase enrollment at both the undergraduate and graduate level. UT can do a better job marketing UT to students. At the undergraduate level, the chief strategy of discounting tuition and providing scholarships has not worked well and is not financially sustainable. We need to answer 'Why UT?' by emphasizing the academic product and outcomes. We need to tell success stories. Marketing and messaging has been a bit challenging. The admissions office should carry the message. Efforts with marketing at an institutional level can improve our recruitment publications to make sure they are on message and not leading with scholarship. Messages should be personalized. That's 45,000-50,000 prospective student inquiries that should receive our message with our efforts encouraging that they visit with us and submit an application and supporting documents. Our yield rates are lower than for similar institutions. We can improve our event programs on campus. We have a student tele-team, about relationship building. It is important to stress that we are partnering with other colleges. By the time students are admitted they need to engage with academic programs they will be going into. Participation from colleges is helpful. As a consultant, Ms. Sanders' experience was primarily focused at the undergraduate level. She is working with Dean Bryant-Friedrich and Assistant Dean Andrews in the College of Graduate Studies on graduate enrollment.

GC members and the executive committee have expressed interest in the following topics/questions:

*How does the VP's office support graduate and professional enrollment?*

Ms. Sanders stressed the importance of following up with current and potential students by promptly seeking their contact information and sending it to the College of Graduate Studies [grdsch@utoledo.edu](mailto:grdsch@utoledo.edu) so they can gather and share basic recruitment information.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich agreed indicating that COGS will input the contact information into our communication system and reach out to the individual.

*Are there focused efforts to recruit Ohio students to the graduate and professional programs at UT?*

Dr. Bryant-Friedrich said that staff from COGS have attended fairs, including military and diversity focused, and has worked collaboratively with other faculty who attend these fairs. We are compiling list of Ohio career fairs and will make it available to everyone. If your domain is represented, we want to help.

*What support is offered to develop pipeline programs / pathways from a UT undergraduate into graduate programs?*

Ms. Sanders responded that it is worthwhile to recruit at other institutions who have undergraduate programs that may feed into graduate programs at UT. In the short-term, she is working with Dean Bryant-Friedrich to learn the current practices in COGS and how we develop more focused efforts in this area.

*How is strategic enrollment planning changing strategy for the undergraduate admissions vs graduate admissions offices?*

At the undergraduate level about 30 items are being developed through SEP including identifying and marketing to undecided students. Nationally, a typical percentage say they are undecided. Institutions, including UT, can help with career exploration by improving our visit and events programs. Additionally, we need to do an analysis of why students leave and how we address that. UT conducted an extensive recruit back effort last spring and summer. Strategies used were those that have the most impact for next budget cycle. President Gaber wants higher enrollment numbers.

Ms. Sanders noted, however, that goals must be realistic. SEP is working with Institutional Research and discerning patterns of the past. We are working on developing graduate goals. We are working on projections for spring semester and working on populations shown. Numbers are assessed regularly.

*What are the specific goals for graduate enrollment?*

Ms. Sanders stated that integrating operations of undergraduate and graduate recruitment has not been discussed thus far.

Dr. Jerry Van Hoy wondered where resources for graduate recruitment would come from.

Ms. Sanders replied that the plans need to be funded and that the President supports this effort. There are other things at the University that cost money that are no longer providing a return in positive recruitment that could be used and she hopes to secure this money for new enrollment initiatives. For example, we buy ACT/SAT scores and send mailings to prospective students.

If this is not producing positive results, the money can be re-allocated to a different recruitment strategy. There may also be a need to spend some short-term money as well.

Dr. Mike Dowd asked specifically how to recruit graduate students? Since students are the best resource, he asked if the Graduate Student Association is involved in the process and whether graduate students have been surveyed. We can ask them for input on the schools they are considering looking at and what their degree program interests are, and which materials caught their eye.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich mentioned that she has a lot of contact with graduate students and she uses them as a barometer and she meets with the GSA president each month. She has been considering surveying graduate students and will discuss development of that tool with Ms. Sanders. Ms. Jessica Sherman added that Psychology majors conduct surveys and can help.

Additional Questions:

Dr. David Jex asked if advertising would continue in Tiger Stadium and Joe Louis arena? Ms. Sanders was not certain.

Dr. Lori Pakulski noted increased enrollment in the rehabilitation sciences from students in the Wayne State area most likely due to the Detroit area advertising.

Dr. Joseph Schmidt pointed out that graduate students comprise 20% of enrollment at UT without recruitment and enrollment resources. Dean Bryant-Friedrich said this it a current item of discussion.

Ms. Sanders noted that it is not uncommon to see focus turned to graduate enrollment when there is enrollment decline. At the undergraduate level, the institution is more of a draw. At the graduate level, it is the program and faculty. COGS coordinates efforts and the programs follow up. Follow up takes people and funds.

Dr. Song-Tao Liu noted that both parents and students need to like the experience.

Ms. Sanders replied that equal attention is being paid to retention as recruitment. That suggests that something should be happening. Although University College has the lowest retention with students who may be undecided and those who have lowest academic indicators coming in, we still need to help them be satisfied with their experience.

### ***Standing Committee Reports***

#### **Report of the Curriculum Committee**

On behalf of the Curriculum Committee, Vice Chair Kalinoski reported that the items in the curriculum report were alpha/numeric only and is presented for informational purposes. A vote was not necessary.

#	Type of Proposal	Coll.	Dept.	Proposal Name	Course No.	Summary of proposal
1	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Seminars in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6300	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
2	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Principles in Pharmacology	MOME 6400	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
3	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Advanced Topics in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6500	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
4	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Journal Paper Review in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6660	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
5	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Research in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6730	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
6	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Independent Study in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6890	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
7	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Thesis Research in Molecular Medicine	MOME 6990	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
8	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Seminars in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8300	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
9	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Principles in Pharmacology	MOME 8400	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
10	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Advanced Topics in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8500	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
11	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Journal Paper Review in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8600	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
12	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Research in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8730	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
13	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Independent Study in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8890	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
14	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Thesis Research in Molecular Medicine	MOME 8990	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)
15	ECM	MD	Physiology and Pharmacology	Dissertation Research in Molecular Medicine	MOME 9990	Alpha code change for courses in the old track name of Cardiovascular and Metabolic Diseases (CVMD) to MOME (Molecular Medicine)

Report of the Membership Committee

On behalf of the Membership Committee Chair, Dr. Sami Hefzy, reported on two batches of membership recommendations. The first had 44 applications of which two were returned that did not have the appropriate signatures. The second batch had 29 applications and all were reviewed with unanimous recommendations from the committee. Chair Hefzy indicated committee members review each application and include their comments. The committee has begun its review process on a third set of applications.

GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS -Spring III 2016 and Summer 2016 (April 12, 2016 - August 11, 2016)																							
College	Full			Associate			Professional			Adjunct			Special Status			APPLICATION RETURNED			TOTAL			Total	
	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal		
Business and Innovation								2			2								0	4	0	4	
Engineering		1	2								1							1	0	2	3	5	
College of Health and Human Services											3			1					1	4	0	5	
Judith Herb College of Education								1			1			1					1	2	0	3	
College of Arts and Letters		3	1					1						1	2				1	6	1	8	
College of Law																			0	0	0	0	
Medicine and Life Sciences		3						1	1					2					2	4	1	7	
Natural Sciences and Mathematics		1	1					1				1							0	2	2	4	
Nursing	1										1			2	1				1	3	1	5	
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences	1		1					1											1	1	1	3	
Honors College																			0	0	0	0	
Libraries																			0	0	0	0	
Total	2	8	5	0	0	0	0	7	1	0	8	1	5	4	1	0	1	1	7	28	9	44	

GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS -Fall I 2016 (August 11, 2016 -September 28, 2016)																							
College	Full			Associate			Professional			Adjunct			Special Status			APPLICATION RETURNED			TOTAL			Total	
	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal	Change	New	Renewal		
Business and Innovation		1									1			1					0	3	0	3	
Engineering															2				0	0	2	2	
College of Health and Human Services		4						1				1							0	5	1	6	
Judith Herb College of Education	1										1			1					1	2	0	3	
College of Arts and Letters		1						1						1					0	3	0	3	
College of Law																			0	0	0	0	
Medicine and Life Sciences		3												2					2	3	0	5	
Natural Sciences and Mathematics		4												2					2	4	0	6	
Nursing																			0	0	0	0	
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences		1																	0	1	0	1	
Honors College																			0	0	0	0	
Libraries																			0	0	0	0	
Total	1	14	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	2	1	4	3	2	0	0	0	5	21	3	29	

The committee is seeking input from GC and/or GCEC on whether a recommendation must be from an academic unit if the faculty teach in an academic area and work with students in this capacity, but he/she resides in a non-academic area. So in the case of Library faculty, we are holding this question.

They are serving students in academic capacity who are from an academic unit. A suggestion has been for Library faculty to receive the signature of recommendation from the Provost.

Dr. Dowd indicated that the Library will have a Dean, but previously had a Director. A Dean leads an academic unit. Faculty Senate has defined the Library to be a college. He suggested that GC recognize the Library as an academic unit.

Some librarians may serve on theses and dissertation committees in various departments, for example in History and Master of Liberal Studies. Vice Chair Kalinoski asked that thoughts on this issue be forwarded to her and Chair Schall.

#### Report of the Academic Programs and Regulations Committee (Missed Class Policy)

On behalf of the Academic Programs and Regulations Committee, Chair Joseph Schmidt reported that his committee was asked to look at a missed class policy for graduate students because one did not exist. Associate Dean Pocotte used the undergraduate policy as a base to begin writing the graduate level policy. Dr. Pocotte responded that she had completed the draft and sent it Dr. Schmidt a couple of weeks ago and that he had wanted to communicate with the GCEC. The final draft will be posted on the comment website <http://www.utoledo.edu/policies/> for a 30-day review period.

#### Graduate Student Missed Class Policy 3364-72-11

Discussed in September

Recommendations delivered to Associate Dean Pocotte September 23, 2016

Policy to be posted to policy website very soon (draft available)

Since the HLC has some guidelines for who can teach classes specifically related to terminal degrees and given that our current membership categories do not quite fit those guidelines, we will need to revisit the Graduate Faculty Membership application and update requirements in the Graduate Council Bylaws.

#### Faculty Qualifications (via the HLC)

Discussed in October

Recommendations delivered to Vice Provost Sawicki October 12, 2016

Policy to be posted to policy website very soon (draft available)

Will require adjustment of faculty qualifications for various levels of Graduate Faculty membership.

Proposal to be brought to Graduate Council at November 15<sup>th</sup> meeting

Dr. Dowd asked if HLC are guidelines or rules. Dean Bryant-Friedrich added that the State of Ohio will not approve a program if the faculty do not have terminal degrees. Dr. Dowd added that Faculty Senate is putting together a policy defining what a credit hour is with regard to the change in semester length from 16 weeks to 15 weeks as specified by Carnegie and state regulations, thereby establishing it as a policy at UT. Graduate Council should define a similar policy for graduate students.

#### **Old Business**

None.

#### **New Business**

Dean Bryant-Friedrich urged Council members to communicate with their program directors to encourage students to register for spring semester 2017.

Dr. Carolyn Lee announced that nursing students are giving flu vaccines, on both campuses.

Dr. Frank Calzonetti announced that the Office of Research currently located in University Hall will likely be moved to the R1 building to provide greater oversight and increased customer service. The U-Hall space may remain a satellite office. Seeking feedback on this. Send me your concerns.

***Adjournment***

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:10 p.m.