

**Graduate Council Minutes
November 12, 2013
12:30 – 2:00 p.m.
Main Campus, Student Union, Room 2582**

Present: Brian Ashburner, Barbaranne Benjamin, Michael Dowd, Mary Ellen Edwards, Ali Fatemi, Brian Fink, Rodney Gabel, David Giovannucci, Hans Gottgens, Kay Grothaus, Dwight Haase, Susanna Hapgood, Samir Hefzy, Margaret Hopkins, Ruth Hottell, David Jex, Virginia Keil, Junghwan Kim, Jon Kirchhoff, Anand Kunnathur, Ron Opp, Susan Pocotte, Patricia Relue, Constance Schall, Rebecca Schneider, Aaron Shaw, Diana Shvydka, Cynthia Smas, Pamela Stover, William Taylor, Mark Templin, Gerard Thompson, Viranga Tillekeratne, James Trempe, Jerry Van Hoy, Deborah Vestal (substituting for Timothy Mueser).

Excused: Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Joseph Dake, April Gardner, Phillip Gribble, Patricia Komuniecki, Marcia McInerney, Holly Monsos, Douglas Nims, Nick Piazza, Dorothea Sawicki, and Kandace Williams.

Absent: Peter Andreana, Renee Heberle, Randall Ruch, Barbara Schneider, Snejana Slantcheva-Durst, Susan Sochacki.

Guests: Heather Huntley, Alana Malik.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the October 15, 2013 meeting were approved.

Executive Reports

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

Dr. Ron Opp, Graduate Council (GC) Vice Chair, reported that Chair David Giovannucci has been in contact with senior leadership to extend invitations to attend GC meetings and provide information regarding various topics of interest to the GC. Dean Komuniecki is currently attending the National Professional Science Masters Association meeting in Washington D.C. and Dr. Susan Pocotte, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs in the College of Graduate Studies (COGS) is reporting on her behalf. Candidates are being interviewed for the Vice President of Research position. Dr. James Trempe stated that six candidates were on the short list and two finalists are being interviewed and indicated that Dr. Jacobs will make the final decision. Dr. Opp also reported that Dr. Mark Templin and the Constitution and Bylaws Committee have been working to update the Bylaws for GC review and approval.

The agenda was reordered to allow the guest speakers to provide their presentation first.

Information and Discussion Items

University of Toledo Assessment and Program Review

Dr. Alana Malik, Learning Outcomes Assessment Specialist, and Heather Huntley, Senior Specialist, from the Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review were invited to Council to provide information regarding UT processes for Assessment and Program Review. Dr. Malik and Ms. Huntley provided a PowerPoint presentation, which is available on the Graduate Council webpage at

<http://www.utoledo.edu/graduate/files/Assessment%20and%20Program%20Review%20Presentation%20to%20GC%2011-12-2013.pdf>.

Dr. Malik, along with Ms. Heather Huntley, Senior Specialist, and Mr. John Barrett, Vice Provost for Faculty Relations and Accreditation, Assessment and Program Review, represent the Office of Assessment, Accreditation, and Program Review team. The office is located at 5120 University Hall.

University Assessment Update – Dr. Alana Malik

Assessment of student learning includes three categories: goals, information and action. The goal of assessment is to identify what UT would like students to be able to do when they complete the program. Information is collected to establish how well students are achieving those goals and what factors influence their learning. Finally, the action is applying how their office can use the information to improve student learning. In response to feedback from the Higher Learning Commission (HLC), the task of setting up an administrative structure to support the academic unit assessment initiatives was implemented. The University Assessment Committee (UAC) was established in 2002. The assessment process has evolved to include participation of service units that support the academic mission. A few of the Graduate Council members are on the UAC which includes liaisons from each of the colleges. The UAC is a hard-working committee that provides feedback to the academic colleges and service units. It is not a governing organization and it has no decision-making authority. The PowerPoint includes a diagram of the UAC feedback loop that details the steps of the intentional mechanism to provide feedback at many levels. The 2012-2013 assessment cycle is underway. For additional information, please visit the UAC Resources Online link at: <http://www.utoledo.edu/offices/provost/main/assessment/committees/Index.html> or contact Dr. Malik at Alana.malik@utoledo.edu.

Program Review Update – Ms. Heather Huntley

Ms. Heather Huntley discussed the purpose, structure and scope of the academic program review at UT. The purpose is to prepare for external accreditations, have commitment to continuous improvement, and meet the expectations of the HLC. All undergraduate and graduate degree programs will be reviewed at least every seven years. Faculty leaders of degree programs will participate with others in the preparation of the self-study reports. The scope of program review includes program design, program efficiency, faculty expertise, continuous improvement and financial sustainability. Prior to the most recent HLC site visit, initiatives to implement a cyclical university-wide program review process that included administrative support and oversight were underway. An inventory of all UT programs was conducted. Undergraduate program benchmark review and graduate program snapshot reviews were performed. In 2011, an ad hoc committee was formed and included personnel from Faculty Senate and the College of Graduate Studies. This committee developed the program review process including proposals and templates. In 2012, the process and templates were finalized and then distributed to the college deans. In spring 2013, the JD in Law was the first degree program reviewed by the new process. Forty programs are going through review this academic year. There is a training process that includes orientation and initial planning, self-study, external review, program review team report, and program response and implementation of improvements. Orientation took place earlier this fall for the 40 programs in the 2013-14 academic year review cycle. The deans of those colleges selected self-study team members, including professors and students (a template is provided for this self-study). An external review team selected by the Provost/Chancellor will be comprised of up to three expert members. That team is tasked with reviewing self-study documents. Then site visits will take place in the spring term. Subsequently, a report providing overview of strengths, improvements, etc. is then sent to the Provost's office. Then college deans will prepare their response to report. A copy of the program's self-study document and review team's report will also be provided to the College of Graduate Studies for appropriate review with Graduate Council. For further information please visit the website at www.utoledo.edu/aapr. Self-study templates are available for graduate and undergraduate levels.

The question arose regarding whether the graduate and undergraduate program reviews will be handled together or separately and Ms. Huntley stated that the external review team will look at them separately but they will be placed together as a whole. There may be some information overlap if a department contains both undergraduate and graduate programs. Ms. Huntley stated that in most cases the undergraduate and graduate program reviews are completed simultaneously. Regarding the accredited programs, the question of why UT program review is required in addition to accreditation self-study/external review was raised. Ms. Huntley stated that the Program Review process is accomplished to assist in and as a complement to accreditation. This will aid in addressing any issues that may arise prior to or in conjunction with accreditation. COGS Associate Dean Susan Pocotte also mentioned that HLC and the OBOR do not recognize an accreditor self-study process as an official UT program review.

Report of the Graduate Student Association (GSA)

Mr. Aaron Shaw, GSA President, reported that 85 students were in attendance at the October 17th GSA meeting. To date, approximately \$3,700 has been paid to graduate students for travel reimbursements. The GSA meetings will be no longer than 1.5 hours in length and the committees will meet biweekly to enable the students to become more active outside of the meeting schedule. This enables graduate students who are unable to attend the General Assembly meetings to attend the committee meetings and thus become an active GSA member. (Two committee meetings = one General Assembly meeting; four committee meetings to become an active status GSA member.) This proposal was adopted at the GSA assembly.

The GSA has approved \$2,600 in funding to The Council of Biomedical Graduate Students (CBGS) for support of an annual symposium that has taken place for 35 years. This year the GSA will support the CBGS to bring in Dr. Mario Capecchi, a 2007 Nobel Prize winner, as the keynote speaker. He is the molecular geneticist who discovered the method to create knockout mice. The Graduate Student Ambassador program is fully supported by the GSA and many members have already offered their support as potential ambassadors to help increase graduate student enrollment at UT. The GSA will continue to work on this program in conjunction with Mr. Corey Sampsel of COGS.

Mr. Shaw reported that engineering graduate students desire more transparency as to the allocation of the fees they are required to pay each semester. The GSA has a meeting scheduled with Dean Nagi Naganathan regarding special engineering fees such as the \$300.00 fee for Engineering Infrastructure.

The GSA has scheduled a meeting with Mr. David Morlock, Executive Vice President of Finance and Administration, to discuss the GSA mission. During November 7-10, 2013, three GSA officers and Mr. Shaw attended the National Association of Graduate and Professional Students National Conference (NAGPS) in Kalamazoo, Michigan. Some of the topics included: how GSAs are run in Europe; how to orchestrate a national grassroots campaign; negotiating TA/GA salaries; proposing legislation; and rebranding of GSAs.

The GSA Professional Development Committee is in the process of putting together a panel for: Main Campus—Ph.D., Industry vs. Academic; Health Science Campus—Case base ethics presentation. The GSA has joined a national grassroots campaign entitled “Grads Have Debt 2.” The goal of this campaign is to lower graduate student debt by almost half. The national graduate and professional student interest cap is 9.5% which is almost double the interest for undergraduates. Thus, for every dollar graduate students borrow, they owe \$1.64 back to the government. He stated that last year the federal government made more profit from graduate student loans than Apple Corporation. Mr. Shaw asked that GC members ask graduate students to join this Facebook group. The GSA has begun inviting schools to attend the Midwest Graduate Research Symposium (MGRS) which will be held on March 29, 2014.

Finally, because the date for final exams is approaching, the GSA has discussed sponsoring coffee break setups for graduate students in each college to assist in facilitating and encouraging studying efforts.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Susan Pocotte, reported on behalf of Dean Komuniecki, who is in Washington, D.C. attending the annual meeting of the National Professional Science Masters Association of which she is a board member.

- *Curriculum Tracking System (CTS) Update*

The old CTS system is live at this time. New enhancements to the old CTS system will go live in January 2014. However, COGS/Ms. Terri Hayes requests that we continue to use the paper process for a few more weeks so as to triple check the beta testing and be sure the signatory names are correct. Vice Provost Peg Traband, Ms. Marcia King-Blandford and the IT team have been beta testing the CTS enhancements and working to address suggestions. Ms. Hayes has participated in the beta testing and provided feedback specific to graduate program and course needs. In addition, the enhancements to the CTS were presented to the Council of Associate Deans last Wednesday, November 6th. Some of the new enhancements include:

- New colleges/departments,
- Previous college codes will remain in system for accurate documentation of modifications,
- Expandable boxes for text,
- Space to include rationale for changes,
- Easier print feature that captures all text in boxes,
- Security to prevent changes once the document leaves the college, and
- Email notifications to people in the flow so that one knows where the document is.

COGS will notify GC when the new system is actually live.

- *Program Review*

Dr. Pocotte emphasized that COGS and GC have a role in the process that is in alignment with the Graduate Faculty constitution and GC Bylaws. Dr. Pocotte summarized the following examples:

- Graduate faculty on self-study process at program level,
- Vice Provost of Graduate Affairs and Dean of COGS is in the review/commentary loop of the self-study, and
- The COGS Associate Dean for Academic Affairs will provide support to the process. For example, facilitate the transfer of stipend/tuition/scholarship data to the program.

Dr. Pocotte suggested that GC members log onto the program review website and read the documentation that provides specific information about the UT program review process. Last summer, Dean Komuniecki met with the college deans to report on the outcomes of the snapshot master's program review. Effective September 2013, COGS submits annual reports to OBOR and RACGS summarizing annual graduate program review activity as required.

- *Assessment*

COGS assessment annual report was submitted to the University Assessment Committee by the COGS liaison to UAC, Dr. Pocotte as COGS Associate Dean. COGS assesses academic support service outcomes. Dr. Pocotte will be a co-presenter on a panel at a workshop at the upcoming Council of Graduate Schools (CGS) annual meeting in December 2013. Her presentation will focus on best practices of how strategic assessment of services provided by a Graduate College school to graduate students can enhance the academic mission. Dr. Pocotte looks forward to presenting COGS assessment findings and news from the Annual CGS meeting to GC at an upcoming meeting.

Standing Committee Reports**Report of the Curriculum Committee**

On behalf of the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (GCCC), Dr. Patricia Relue reported that the GCCC reviewed and approved the following curriculum (with the exception of IITP 6040/8040):

New Course Proposals

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Course Description
MD	Orthopedic Surgery	Musculoskeletal Anatomy & Orthopedics Basic Science Seminar	ORTH 6500	A didactic series covering a wide variety of musculoskeletal and basic science topics. Lectures will draw from topic areas.
NU	Health Promotion	Financial Resource Management in Nursing Administration	NURS 7160	Fiscal management concepts for nurse administrators: financial reporting function, managerial issues related to finance, financial planning and control in nursing administration
NU	Health Promotion	Strategic Planning for Nursing and Health Care Systems	NURS 7150	Managerial function of planning and developing leadership skills.
MD	Medical Microbiology and Immunology	Advanced Microbiology	IITP*	Student led discussion of recent literature supporting key concepts in microbiology, emphasis on bacteria and viruses. (*Alpha course number has been requested).
HE	Health and Recreation Professions	APIE in Recreation Therapy	RCRT 5760	The processes of assessment, planning, implementation, and evaluation of recreational therapy services.
HE	Health and Recreation Professions	Interdisciplinary Seminar in Human Service Advocacy	HEAL 6950	Examination the importance of advocacy for the individual, community, and the health professions, with emphasis on developing advocacy skills.*
HE	Health and Recreation Professions	Interdisciplinary Seminar in Human Service Advocacy	HEAL 8950	Same as HEAL 6950, Ph.D. students will write a Coalition Paper in addition other requirements/ evaluation.

* Planned to be required in the Master's program: A program modification will need to be provided to incorporate this course as a program requirement.

Course Modifications

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Change in course
HS	Health and Recreation Professions	Inclusive Recreation and Recreation Therapy Services	RCRT 5300	Title change from "Recreation & Adaption for Special Education" to "Inclusive Recreation & Recreation Therapy Services" to reflect current terminology.
HS	Health and Recreation Professions	Research Methods in Recreation and Recreation Therapy	RCRT 5420	Title change from "Leisure Program Research Techniques" to "Research Methods in Recreation and Recreation Therapy" and catalog description change to align with NCTRC accepted title, and content for student certification eligibility.

HE	Health and Recreation Professions	Clinical: Intellectual Deficit/Developmental Disability	RCRT 5820	Title change from "Clinical: Mental Retardation/Developmental Disability" to "Clinical: Intellectual Deficit/Developmental Disability" to reflect current terminology.
HE	Health and Recreation Professions	Intervention: Therapeutic Arts	RCRT 5900	Title change from "Intervention: Craft Therapy" to "Intervention: Therapeutic Arts" to reflect current terminology.
SM	Biological Sciences	Advanced Cell Signaling	BIOL 6200	Remove CHEM 6500 as a prerequisite.
SM	Biological Sciences	Advanced Cell Signaling	BIOL 8200	Remove CHEM 8500 as a prerequisite.
MD	Orthopaedic Surgery	Sports Medicine	ORTH 6930	Change in title from "Independent Study (Orthopedic Biomechanics)" to "Sports Medicine", change in credit hours from fixed to variable, catalog description change.

The following Course Modifications were sent to the GCCC for review. All these courses have been modified as part of a renumbering of a suite of courses in the Orthopedics to rationalize the course numbering system in concert with a program revision. Given that there are substantial changes to the course content, the Curriculum Committee is requesting syllabi be provided. Provisionally, it is recommended these for approval pending review of the syllabi.

Course Modifications

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Change in course
MD	Orthopaedic Surgery	Introduction to Clinical Orthopaedics	ORTH 5850	Change in title from "Sports Medicine" to "Introduction to Clinical Orthopaedics", catalog description change. Content also changed.
MD	Orthopaedic Surgery	Adult Reconstruction & Tumor	ORTH 6940	Change in title from "Independent Study (Orthopedic Anatomy)" to "Adult Reconstruction & Tumor", change in credit hours from fixed to variable, catalog description change. Content also changed.
MD	Orthopaedic Surgery	Foot and Ankle	ORTH 6950	Change in title from "Independent Study (Orthopedic Radiology)" to "Foot and Ankle", change in credit hours from fixed to variable, catalog description change. Content also changed.

Standing Committee Reports

Report of the Membership Committee

On behalf of the Membership Committee, Dr. Samir Hefzy, committee chair, reported to the Graduate Council that the committee reviewed and approved 35 Graduate Faculty Membership Applications. Their report is provided below:

GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS - Fall 2013 - List 1 - (August 2013 - October 2013)							
College	Full	Associate I	Associate II	Adjunct	Special Status	Returned	Total
Business and Innovation	2				1		3
Engineering	1				1		2
College of Health Sciences							0
Judith Herb College of Education	1			1	1		3
Languages, Literature and Social Sciences	1						1
Medicine and Life Sciences	5		1		2		8
Natural Sciences and Mathematics	1			2	1		4
Nursing	1	2	1	3			7
Communication and the Arts				1			1
Social Justice and Human Service				3	1		4
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences	1						1
Libraries		1					1
Total	1	3	2	10	7	0	35

Report of the Constitution and Bylaws Committee

Dr. Mark Templin, committee chair, reported that the proposed changes to the Constitution went down to defeat in April 2013. The committee resumed work in the fall term and deleted both the supremacy and delegation clauses, then began work on Article Four regarding the Graduate Council and the enumeration of the GC powers. Dr. Templin detailed additional changes on which they are working including Graduate Council having authority to determine membership. When the committee completes its work, the revised draft Constitution will be brought to GC for discussion and ratification before sending out to the Graduate Faculty for a vote. COGS is responsible for conducting the voting process using a special website, and some faculty did not want their names associated with their votes.

Discussion ensued regarding the possibility of initiating electronic voting through a third party. However, concern was mentioned regarding the privacy risk involving a third party. The committee will complete its review and revision of the Constitution first and then will move on to the GC Bylaws. The Bylaws do not actually go out to all of Graduate Faculty as a whole, but changes require a two-thirds majority vote of GC. Dr. Michael Dowd asked Dr. Templin to have the committee consider revising the membership category to include retired Graduate Faculty membership to continue out the length of the membership term rather than have the membership expire immediately upon retirement. Dr. Giovannucci stated that he would address this request at a GC Executive Committee meeting.

Old Business

None.

New Business

None.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:09 p.m.