

**Graduate Council Minutes  
January 12, 2010**

Present: Lawrence Anderson, Jamie Barlowe, Barbaranne Benjamin, Karen Bjorkman, Wendy Cochrane, Michael Dowd, John Gaboury, David Giovannucci, Scott Heckathorn, Mohamed Hefzy, Wayne Hoss, Patricia Komuniecki, Anand Kunnathur, Joel Lipman, Geoffrey Martin, Kelly Phillips, Susan Pocotte, Thihal Ponnaiyan (GSA), Ram Rachamadugu, Patricia Relue, Kathleen Salyers, Dorothea Sawicki, Barbara Schneider, Krishna Shenai, Dianne Smolen, Robert Sullivan, Mark Templin, Amy Thompson, Hermann Von Grafenstein, Frederick Williams

Absent: Eric Longsdorf, Gary Moore, Azadeh Parvin

Excused: Frank Calzonetti, Dwayne Demedio, Brian Fink, Amira Gohara, Hans Gottgens, Ruth Hottell, Richard Komuniecki, Sakui Malakpa, Joseph Margiotta, Sheryl Milz, Randall Ruch

Guests: Jeffrey Gold

***Call to Order and Roll and Approval of Minutes***

The Minutes of the December 8, 2009, meeting were approved.

***Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council and the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies***

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

On behalf of the Graduate Council Executive Committee (GCEC) Dr. Pocotte welcomed everyone to today's Graduate Council (GC) meeting. The location of this meeting is another significant milestone in the history of the Graduate Council of the University of Toledo. It is the first time for the Graduate Council of the merged Health Science Campus (HSC) and Main Campus (MC) Graduate Faculty to meet on the HSC. The moment lends itself to a brief overview of our successful accomplishments that lead up to the opportunity of the Graduate Council to meet here today. The accomplishments result from the work of many Faculty, Students and Administrators.

Dr. Pocotte provided highlights of some of the changes to College of Graduate Studies since 2006 merger of MUOT and UT include:

- One Graduate College for two campuses  
9 Colleges with Graduate Programs  
>200 programs (63 doctoral and first professional programs/175 Master's)  
Fall 2009 Enrollment: 4,924 Headcount, 3,446 FTE
- Leadership: One Vice Provost and Graduate Dean (dual reports)  
New Associate Dean on the Health Science Campus (HSC), Dr. Thea Sawicki
- One COGS Budget
- One Graduate Faculty, approximately 720 Graduate Faculty
- One Graduate Council
- One Constitution/By Laws
- One Graduate Student Association

This is the second academic year in which the Graduate Faculty have operated under a constitution that merged the Graduate Faculty from MC and HSC pre-merger of MUOT and UT.

This is the second semester of the first academic year that we have conducted the Graduate Council per its harmonized bylaws.

Per our Constitution: “The purpose of the Graduate Faculty of the University of Toledo shall be the advancement of knowledge through research and instruction of the highest quality.

The faculty shall seek to foster in students a spirit of inquiry, recognition of the value of scholarship, and an understanding of the integrity required for the pursuit of scholarship.

The College of Graduate Studies shall be the executive office of the Graduate Faculty. It shall administer the policies of the University that pertain to graduate education and shall administer the decisions of the Graduate Council as representatives of the Graduate Faculty. The Graduate Council shall be the representative body of the graduate Faculty and shall legislate for it.”

This academic year is the first year for One Graduate Student Association for all UT graduate Programs in COGS. Together we have already accomplished a lot.

The standing committees of the Graduate Council function with faculty representing both HSC and MC. The ultimate approval and/or recommendation for Graduate Faculty membership, graduate curriculum and academic standards for both HSC and MC are now with the Graduate Council.

Considerable work has been done to harmonize the policies for submission of student master’s theses and doctoral dissertations. This work includes new policy regarding electronic submissions, and substantial revisions to the Handbook for Preparation of Graduate Dissertations and Theses.

A single handbook for all COGS students is in preparation.

After almost a year of work we are getting close to finalizing a harmonized Academic Standards document.

Graduate Council is represented at several University forums with Senior Leadership. This includes monthly meetings with the two provosts and Faculty Senate Executive Committee, Research Council, and participation on the evaluation of the UT Strategic Plan.

The attendance at our Graduate Council meetings has been excellent and representative of both HSC and MC graduate faculty and ex officio members. Our dialogue is respectful and collegial. During the process of harmonization our discussions and decisions reflect a commitment to our students and program and scholarship quality in a manner that preserves the best of our histories, creates new ideas and is in alignment with the UT and Colleges visions and missions.

Dr. Pocotte was pleased to introduce Dr. Gold, Provost and Executive Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the College of Medicine. The GCEC has invited him to address this body with welcoming remarks given the significance of this first Graduate Council meeting on the HSC campus.

Welcome Remarks from Dr. Jeffrey P. Gold, Provost and Executive Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the College of Medicine

Dr. Gold was pleased to formally and warmly welcome the Graduate Council to the Health Science Campus (HSC), with its wonderful facilities. He reminded the Council the HSC is their campus. He thanked the Council for hosting this meeting on the HSC and noted the historical significance and emphasized that it is always people that build great organizations, hospitals and colleges. He recognized the importance of graduate education and the Council’s serious care and responsibility for it. On behalf of Dr. Jacobs, the BOT and himself, he thanked the GC for providing excellence for students.

Similarly, the iCARE pin is a symbol of our commitment to providing excellent access, as we care for patients in an environment of mutual respect. It symbolizes more than the health delivery components of the environment it was conceived from. He charged the academic segments of the University to remind themselves of these important words in their daily lives as they consider and debate the future while engaging in the strategic planning process: Vision, Relevance, Recognition, Responsive, Collaborative, and Excellence.

He told the Council he is always available to them and to attend their meetings and participate at other levels and again thanked them for the invitation to attend today's meeting.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Komuniecki reported on the following:

- *OBR Doctoral Set Aside Status Update*

The IUC Provost's group has recommended to the Presidents the following shift in the new doctoral set aside for state to 50% for degrees awarded with the remaining 50% split 25% for research funding and 25% for a variety of quality measures. As a reminder starting with FY11, 10% of the doctoral subsidy received by each state university will be attributed to the new formula. Each successive year there would be an additional 10% shift to the new formula, thus, after 10 years, 100% of the doctoral subsidy received would be attributed to the new formula. The IUC Presidents received recommendations from the Provosts and will discuss in a conference call today on this subject.

- *Spring Enrollments*

Thanks for your assistance to ensure that our funded doctoral students are registered for at least 12 hours (HSC campus students typically register for 15 hours). Additional tuition funding was allocated to the colleges to cover this request. As some of you may know, as of Thursday overall graduate headcount was up 7.1% and, more importantly, graduate FTE was up 7.7%. We may see additional changes by the 15th day, of classes (the census day). The definition of what number of credit hours constitutes a full-time student at UT needs to be revisited (full-time has at various times been 9, 12, or 15 hours at UT).

- *Spring Orientation and Professional Development*

We welcomed 100 new graduate students at the January orientation last Thursday. If any of you have new students in that group, please encourage them to review additional PowerPoint presentations on the COGS website for current students. The Professional Development Calendar for the spring term lists several presentations for graduate students. These Professional Development Programs did not exist a year ago, so we want to make graduate students aware of these offerings. The first presentation is by Karen Bjorkman on "Building a productive relationship with your advisor" to be held on January 26th from 4:00 -5:30 p.m., in the Student Union Ingman Room. There will be two ETD workshops, a program for international graduate students and a career planning workshop for doctoral students. Be sure to have all your students check the COGS website for information about all our programs.

- *Budget Planning Update*

As some of you may know, colleges have been asked to start the budget planning process for FY11 with 5% up and 5% down scenarios. The deans will be meeting with Scott Scarborough later this week for additional discussion about budget parameters. Dr. Komuniecki will be making arguments to recapture the stipend budget as part of the 5% up scenario. We hope to be able to let academic colleges know their budgets sooner than last year in order to recruit a strong incoming cohort. In terms of revenue generation, we already have a proposal under consideration to add \$30 to the application fee for international students (typically done at other universities) the potential revenue generated would be used to create a professional development fund for graduate students (~\$36K/annum).

- *Program Review*  
The Graduate Council committee is now populated and will be meeting with Dr. Komuniecki later this month to discuss the graduate program review process. We will bring back to GC the outline of the metrics to be assessed with drivers coming from the State and the projected timeline and possible outcomes. The OBR mandates that doctoral program review needs to be done every eight years.
- *GOAP Awards Appointments Made for Spring 2010*  
Dr. Komuniecki is pleased to announce that COGS is able to make 10 new GOAP awards that will start this semester. The breakdown includes students in CAS, EDU and HSHS, and BUS. This is one of the COGS diversity initiatives and we plan to bring all the GOAP students together to help establish a mentoring network.
- *NRC Doctoral Program Report*  
Although not yet released, COGS will make a statement about the outcome of the UT rankings when it is made public. Relevancy is now an issue since it has been five years since the survey was completed and that was prior to the merger.
- *Update on the Federal Directives on Research Ethics*  
Last month Dr. Komuniecki mentioned the new NSF and NIH mandates for institutions to provide appropriate programs “to facilitate the ethical conduct of research” effective January 1, 2010. Jim Trempe has asked Dr. Komuniecki to announce that UT has contracted with the Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative (CITI) to take advantage of their RCR modules. We will be inviting him to GC at one of our upcoming meetings to provide additional information.
- *Announcements*
  - *On-line Admissions Application*  
Good news! Since August 2009, COGS has received and processed more than 2,000 online applications (about 75% to MC programs). At this time last year, prior to the online application, there was a six-week backlog in processing. Dr. Komuniecki is happy to report that there is no backlog this year.
  - *Graduate Catalog and Policy*  
The COGS Dean’s office has begun the process of updating the graduate catalog and converting existing policies into the new format for posting; we will keep GC informed as to the status of this process. Marcia King-Blanford has asked me to start that process. In the very near future, we are going to be asked to review the policy of COGS for inclusion in the University of Toledo Policies which are posted for a 30-day review period.

Dr. Pocotte asked whether the policies pertain to policy and/or governance. Dr. Komuniecki responded that they are policy not governance and the COGS office is responsible for this.

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### Discussion of Draft Amendments to the Academic Standards Document

Dr. Pocotte referred to the Draft Amendments to the Academic Standards Document that was provided for Council review via overhead projector as well as having been distributed to Council members for discussion at today’s meeting. The Academic Standards was approved at the Graduate Council meeting of April 1, 2009. Various stakeholders have reviewed the document to determine if it coordinated with other COGS academic policies. The document represents minimum standards. Colleges and programs may set more rigorous standards. The GCEC has responded to numerous implementation issues. Dr. Komuniecki discussed the draft document with the Associate Deans two times.

She pointed out the color coding on the document; gray markings indicated language that the GCEC and Associate Deans have agreed to; and blue markings highlight additional language provided by the Associate Deans for clarification. The document has also been vetted by the Registrar's office. She noted the grade of "E" would remain on the transcript but has no weight on the GPA.

There was discussion of effectiveness and difference of assigning a grade of "E" as opposed to a "U", since the grade of "U" carries the weight of an "F" as a Main Campus (MC) policy, and the harmonized grading scale posted difficulties to the HSC programs where "U" had no weight in the GPA. Thus, the "E" grade was proposed as an alternative for those programs, allowing a student to retake a course to achieve a grade of "S", and not be penalized with the grade of "F". There is no "No Credit" option at the graduate level, except in audited classes, so the proposed grade of "E" provides a comprised solution to that problem. The "E" grade would be particularly useful in a clinical situation. For example, when a student is making some progress but not performing at a satisfactory graduate level, neither the "IN" nor "PR" grade are appropriate and "U" would count as an "F", a "PR" grade is inappropriate and "U" would turn into an "F". Students incur tuition charges for retaking the course to meet program requirements. This impacts approximately three to five students each year.

Clarification was made that a student cannot graduate with an "E" on the transcript. This policy needs to be clearly stated in the Academic Standards. However, if a student has changed programs, they may not need to the course for which the "E" grade was assigned and should have the option to receive "No Credit". The transcript would need to align with the Plan of Study.

Dr. Anderson stated the "E" grade is similar to the role of "W" in that it does not apply to letter grades. It is suitable for advanced readings, colloquiums in research hours, and clinical experiences. It also mitigates a "U" being counted as an "F" which could be a damaging situation.

Dr. Komuniecki stated she would look into methods to operationalize the grade implementation and will seek feedback from her counterparts affiliated with the Council of Graduate Schools to determine a student's option to petition and departmental authority of when not to accept. The instructor needs to be able to meet the contractual obligation.

There was additional discussion of whether "E" will become a part "S/U" creating a third option "S/U/E", whether the implementation would be retroactive or if individual course modifications are needed. The total number of retakes allowed needs to be determined. Course retake policy indicated in the draft document would apply to S/U/E graded courses.

Dr. Komuniecki indicated that "E" grade assignments could not be retroactive and that she would like to discuss with the Curriculum Committee whether to review this new grading option by course or whether it should occur automatically. She stated the "E" should only be listed as an option for those courses that need it since there are variances in grading options needed for specific courses. The grade of "E" is preferable to the grade of "NC", so that the student completes the activity required for the course.

Dr. Relue was concerned about potential abuse and questioned whether the course assigned a grade of "E" would need to be retaken if it is an elective.

The GCEC will resend a revised Academic Standards document in hope that it will be ready for vote at the next Council meeting

### ***Standing Committee Reports***

None.

***Organizational Reports***

**Report of the Graduate Student Association**

Mr. Thihal Ponnaiyan, President of the Graduate Student Association, reported the third Annual GSA Symposium is scheduled to be held either on March 20th or Mar 27<sup>th</sup> with the keynote speaker yet to be finalized. The event will be comprised of both oral and poster presentations.

For the first time universities and colleges within a 100-mile radius of UT will also be invited to attend in addition to all the graduate students at UT.

Mr. Ponnaiyan reported that the GSA website is up and running and has gained a lot of popularity. When visitors stay on the site for more than three minutes, we can track that number and their locale. We have had visitors from all over the U.S. including Alaska. There have also been several visitors from Africa, Asia and Europe. Dr. Komuniecki commended the GSA for its work on the website.

The first social event for this term is scheduled to be held on Friday, January 20, 2010, beginning at 8:00 p.m. It will be a semester mixer at Mulvaney's Bunker Irish Pub on Dorr Street. This event is being organized with the intention of serving as get-acquainted ice-break for new graduate students (Spring 2010) to get better acquainted with each other.

The next GSA General Assembly meeting is scheduled to take place on Wednesday, January 20, 2010, at 6.00 p.m. Student opinion regarding the academic standards document will be collected during this meeting and presented later to the Graduate Council.

***Old Business***

None.

***New Business***

None.

***Adjournment***

There being no further business the Council adjourned at 1:59 p.m.