

**Assurance Argument**  
University of Toledo - OH

3/15/2016

## **3 - Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources, and Support**

---

The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

### **3.A - Core Component 3.A**

---

The institution's degree programs are appropriate to higher education.

1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of performance by students appropriate to the degree or certificate awarded.
2. The institution articulates and differentiates learning goals for undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduate, and certificate programs.
3. The institution's program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the main campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortial arrangements, or any other modality).

### **Argument**

---

**1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of performance by students appropriate to the degree or certificate awarded.**

**2. The institute articulates and differentiates learning goals for its undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduation, and certificate programs.**

The University of Toledo (UT) ensures that the courses and programs offered are current and performance-level appropriate for the degree or certificate rewarded by means of several levels of review – internal and external.

The rigor and content of degree programs are ensured by the engagement of faculty and curriculum committees in developing program content and requirements. A peer-review process is used when creating or substantially revising all degree programs. The process involves first, internal approval at various levels including the department, college, Faculty Senate for undergraduate programs or Graduate Council for graduate programs, and the Office of the Provost. Standard New Program Proposal forms are required at both the [undergraduate](#) and [graduate](#) levels. After internal approval, new undergraduate and graduate programs undergo submission, review and approval by the Ohio Department of Higher Education (ODHE; formerly Ohio Board of Regents) and the [Chancellor's Council on Graduate Studies](#) (CCGS; formerly the Regent's Advisory Committee on Graduate Studies) respectively.

Submission requirements for the initial review and approval of new academic programs include the articulation and differentiation of learning goals. Programs are required to identify specific, measurable student learning goals. The peer-review process ensures that these learning goals are also appropriate for the level of each program and associated degree. The student learning goals are reviewed as part of the initial submission of new program applications.

The appropriateness of student learning outcomes, performance and expectations for students in

graduate programs is also explicitly reviewed by ODHE as a part of the Program Development Plan – Academic Quality in advance of program approval.

Courses contributing to program requirements are also internally reviewed and approved at various levels, including Faculty Senate or Graduate Council, to certify that each course and its content are appropriate. A new course approval form, which includes submission of a syllabus/complete outline, allows review of each course for consistency and completeness. Review for all new undergraduate and graduate courses begins at the department level. Modifications to existing undergraduate/graduate programs and undergraduate/graduate courses are reviewed following a similar process involving multiple levels. Proposed changes are compared to the current structure and the rationale for change is required.

The agendas and minutes from the [February 3, 2015](#) and [February 17, 2015](#) Faculty Senate meetings provide evidence of the implementation of the internal peer review and approval process for courses and programs. Minutes from the [November 3, 2015](#) Graduate Council meeting provide evidence of that curriculum approval process. All Graduate Council members hold full graduate faculty status, and the graduate faculty status of the proposer on any new course or program is checked to ensure that the appropriate status is held.

All academic programs participate in an institutional process of [program review](#) (discussed further in Criterion 4.A.1). For programs with external accreditation, this occurs at least six months prior to their scheduled accreditation visit. All programs are reviewed at least every seven years. The institutional review process involves a [self-study](#) completed by the faculty leaders of the program, which is reviewed along with other documentation by a team of external reviewers knowledgeable in the area of study and familiar with current trends. The process includes a review of program design, program efficiency, faculty expertise, continuous improvement efforts and financial sustainability. Per its [bylaws](#), Graduate Council is involved in the review process for graduate programs. The results of UT's program review identify continuous improvement opportunities to enhance the quality of its academic programs.

The appropriateness of program learning goals and content are reviewed at the time of each program's scheduled review. As can be seen on the [schedule for program review](#), programs offering degrees at multiple levels — for example a BA and a MA — are reviewed at the same time. The external reviewers are specifically asked to respond to a [pre-determined set of questions](#), including a focus on content and learning outcomes, such as: “Based on your knowledge of the discipline, is the curriculum current and does it provide an adequate educational experience for graduates of the programs?” thus providing feedback regarding the content, rigor and expectations for students' performance for each program. This process ensures that learning goals are appropriate and differentiated between levels for programs offered at multiple levels.

Programs also are required to list learning goals in their assessment plans, which are periodically reviewed by members of the University Assessment Committee (further discussed in Criterion 4.B).

In addition to internal review, over 135 programs, colleges and centers [maintain external accreditation](#) awarded by over 40 different accrediting bodies. These programs meet rigorous standards developed by their external accreditors that help to define current and appropriate content and expectations for students.

**3. The institution's program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the Main Campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortium arrangements, or any other modality).**

All programs, regardless of mode of delivery or location, go through the same processes of peer review. This includes the initial review when a new program is proposed as well as during the institutional process of program review. (See Criterion 3.A.1 and 3.A.2 for additional details regarding these processes.)

UT currently has over 40 degree programs available [100% online](#). Of these, 10 programs are also available in face-to-face format. For these programs offered in both modes, consistency in student learning outcomes, feedback on teaching and students' performance across the different modes are included as part of the internal program review.

As enrollment in online courses continues to rise, resources have been directed toward programs and services that will ensure the quality of the courses and associated degree programs.

Under the leadership of UT Online (formerly Learning Ventures), UT has adopted the [Quality Matters \(QM\) program](#) for online course design and development, the [Sloan Consortium's \(Sloan-C\) Quality Scorecard](#) and also conducted a self-review to ensure the quality of online program administration.

Based on the QM standards, instructional designers developed a document — [Critical Policy Issues for Online Courses](#) — to guide faculty. The document addresses academic integrity, accessibility, copyright responsibilities, communication, FERPA and user authentication. A series of templates, guidelines and checklists are available to assist course design and revision. Instructional designers who have completed QM peer reviewer courses collaborate with multimedia designers and educational technologists to work with faculty developers in course design and development.

[Online faculty development programs](#) are critical to quality online programs. Instructional designers, multimedia designers and educational technologists conduct a variety of online courses, workshops and individual consultation to prepare faculty to design and teach online with technology. Self-paced tutorials and videos are also available to faculty. The [Pathway to Master Online Instructor program](#) includes four components: Online Teaching Certificate (OTC), Online Course Design Certificate (OCDC), Applying Quality Matters Rubric (APPQMR), and Peer Reviewer Course (PRC). Each of these components addresses a unique quality-based perspective in online learning. As of December 2015, 19 faculty members were certified QM peer reviewers and served on course review teams. In addition, two of the senior staff of UT Online achieved the distinction of earning the QM Master Reviewer certification.

An [online course design evaluation tool](#) based on the essential QM standards has been used for new online courses supported by UT Online. The results are made available to faculty and used for course improvement. Unofficial QM reviews are being conducted upon request. UT's plan is for all online courses to meet QM standards by AY 2020.

The institution's dual credit program, College Credit Plus, was developed in response to [Ohio Revised Code Chapter 3365](#) effective September 15, 2015. By statute, these courses must follow the same course syllabus and learning outcomes, and use the same textbook, materials and assessments as the college course. Collaboration between the institution and area high schools resulted in college level courses currently taught in three modalities: online, face-to-face and blended. Teaching certification for high school instructors is reviewed by UT faculty on behalf of the Office of Enrollment, which administers the program, and ultimately approved by the provost based on faculty evaluations. Certified teachers are primary high school instructors and are assigned a UT faculty member as collaborator on course assignments and activities, depending on modality of delivery. Discussed also in Criterion 3.C. and 4.A.

The [Division of Off-Campus and Extended Programs](#) provides a link with the campus for students at off-campus sites to facilitate communication with students on services critical to their academic progress and success, such as registration and access to textbooks. The division assists with program evaluation as appropriate.

The Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review is expanding the institution's annual assessment reporting process to monitor better the overall quality of programs offered at additional locations or using multiple modalities. These programs must differentiate between sites/modalities and provide data as evidence of [equivalence in students' experiences](#) and achievement on an annual basis. The University Assessment Committee is working to refine the reporting process; the goal is for these reports to be submitted annually via the online system used for the submission of all annual program assessment reports. These reports and the comparison of outcomes across sites/modalities will also be included and reviewed during the cyclical program review process.

## Sources

---

- Accredited Programs and Endorsements-List
- Chancellor's Council on Graduate Studies New Programs
- College Credit Plus - Ohio Revised Code Section 3365
- Critical policy issues for online courses
- Division of Off Campus and Extended Programs
- Faculty Senate-Agenda with Minutes 02-03-2015
- Faculty Senate-Agenda with Minutes 02-17-2015
- Graduate Council Bylaws 4-7-15
- Graduate Council Bylaws 4-7-15 (page number 7)
- Graduate Council Minutes 11-03-2015
- Graduate Council Minutes 11-03-2015 (page number 8)
- New Program Form - Undergraduate Curriculum Tracking System
- New Program Form-Graduate Curriculum Tracking System
- Offsite Locations Annual Report Draft 11-18-15
- Online Courses Design Evaluation
- Online Degree Programs
- Online Degree Programs - Quality Matters
- Online faculty development programs 2015
- PR 2013-2020 cycle
- PR 2013-2020 cycle (page number 5)
- Program Review
- Program Review Questions to Guide External Reviewers
- Program Review Template 2015-16
- Sloan-C handbook and quality scorecard
- UT Online - Pathway to Master Online Instructor Program

## 3.B - Core Component 3.B

---

The institution demonstrates that the exercise of intellectual inquiry and the acquisition, application, and integration of broad learning and skills are integral to its educational programs.

1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings, and degree levels of the institution.
2. The institution articulates the purposes, content, and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.
3. Every degree program offered by the institution engages students in collecting, analyzing, and communicating information; in mastering modes of inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.
4. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity of the world in which students live and work.
5. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work, and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their programs and the institution's mission.

## Argument

---

**1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings, and degree levels of the institution.**

**2. The institution articulates the purposes, content, and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.**

The UT Core Curriculum consists of two components:

1. General education courses, which are of broad interest and are distributed across categories including composition, fine arts, humanities, mathematics, natural sciences and social sciences, and
2. Diversity courses, which foster an understanding of and respect for different cultures and peoples, both within and outside the United States.

Responsibility for the institution's core curriculum has been delegated by UT's Board of Trustees to its Faculty Senate with oversight given to the [Senate Committee on the Core Curriculum](#).

This [committee](#) acts as the review and recommendation body to formulate and articulate guidelines for implementation of the University-wide core. Proposals for the inclusion of courses as part of the general education curriculum must be approved through the Senate Core Curriculum Committee and Faculty Senate as a whole. In addition, this committee oversees the implementation of UT's Transfer Module and [approves courses](#) that are proposed for inclusion in the document.

The purpose of the required [core curriculum](#) is described as "... a foundation for undergraduate

education. It exposes the student to a range of disciplines that gives breadth to the learning experience, prepares students for their degree programs, and develops students as lifelong learners who will thrive in and contribute significantly to a constantly changing global community.”

The goals of the University-wide curriculum are well aligned with the institutional mission and core values of discovery, learning and communication:

- To broaden the range of experiences open to students;
- To help students develop the disciplined, analytical and critical skills necessary for intellectual development throughout life;
- To prepare students to make better-informed and humane decisions and to be able to communicate those decisions to others;
- To cultivate students' potential for creative expression.

In April 2011, Faculty Senate approved a competency-based student learning outcomes general education curriculum. Part of the motivation for this approach to general education was to help facilitate assessment of general education courses. In the process of implementing a competency-based general education coursework, UT found that many of the newly approved courses would not be approved as Ohio Transfer Module (OTM) courses. To facilitate transfer between institutions, the state of Ohio requires that a four-year institution's general education curriculum consist of a minimum of 36 credit hours of coursework approved by the state for inclusion in the OTM distributed across disciplines such as humanities, mathematics, natural sciences and social sciences. A substantial portion of the courses approved for our competency-based general education curriculum was not approved for OTM inclusion because the competency-based student learning outcomes did not match discipline-specific learning outcomes. After much deliberation, in March 2014, Faculty Senate voted to return to the previous general education curriculum. However, the competency-based learning outcomes are being used for assessment of the general education curriculum. Details regarding the general education assessment plan and process including the role of Faculty Senate in collaboration with the Office of Assessment, Accreditation, and Program Review can be found in Criterion 4.B.1.

The competency-based learning outcomes are:

- Communication: Demonstrate abilities to communicate meaningfully, persuasively and creatively with different audiences through written, oral, numeric, graphic and visual modes.
- Personal, Social, and Global Responsibility: Demonstrate understanding of and critical engagement in ethical, cultural and political discourse, and capacity to work productively as a community member committed to the value of diversity and the imperatives of justice.
- Critical Thinking and Integrative Learning: Integrate reasoning, questioning and analysis across traditional boundaries of viewpoint, practice and discipline.
- Scientific and Quantitative Reasoning and Literacy: Demonstrate the capacity to apply mathematical reasoning and scientific inquiry to diverse problems.
- Information Literacy: Demonstrate the ability to find, organize, critically assess and effectively use information to engage in advanced work in a challenging field of study. Students should demonstrate responsible, legal, creative and ethical use of information.

**3. Every degree program offered by the institution engages students in collecting, analyzing, and communicating information; in mastering modes of inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.**

The foundation of every undergraduate degree program includes the required embedded [Core/General Education Curriculum](#). As part of this coursework, students must demonstrate the ability to

communicate, understand personal, social and global responsibility, integrate and apply critical thinking and scientific and quantitative reasoning, and use information literacy in their fields of study. Students demonstrate proficiency in these outcomes through undergraduate program-specific course assessments.

Appropriate content for degree programs is ensured by the required engagement of faculty and curriculum committees in developing program content and requirements. A peer review process is used when creating or substantially revising any degree program. The process for undergraduate programs, as shown on the [Undergraduate Program Proposal Form](#), involves review and approval at various levels including the department, college, Faculty Senate and the Office of the Provost and then the ODHE. For [graduate programs](#) the process involves the same levels of review with the addition of the Graduate Council, Dean of the College of Graduate Studies, Office of the Provost and the Chancellor's Council on Graduate Studies.

[Examples of degree program student learning outcomes](#) (SLOs) illustrate the range and inclusion of learning outcomes that engage students with information, inquiry and creative work across colleges.

Once a program is in place, institutional procedures related to program review provide ongoing monitoring of program content and students' expectations. At the time of [review](#), each academic program provides the basis upon which the curriculum was developed and lists students' engagement in research and creative work. External peer [reviewers participate in the review](#) and are asked to assess the overall curriculum content as well as the quality and level of students' scholarly and creative activities. Discussed further in Criterion 4.A.1.

Students' feedback on their courses and levels of engagement/expectation is included on the National Survey of Students Engagement (NSSE). The survey was administered in 2015 and completed by a total of over 1,200 students, approximately 650 first-year students and 620 senior students.

[Responses](#) to a number of the NSSE 2015 survey items assess students' experiences in their courses. For example, for the NSSE item "[Analyzing an idea, experience, or line of reasoning in depth by examining its parts](#)" over 70% of the students responded that their coursework emphasized this "very much" or "quite a bit." Over 90% responded that they "[Connected ...learning to societal problems or issues](#)" sometimes, often, or very often during the current school year. Over 80% also responded that they "[Used numerical information to examine a real-world problem or issues](#)" during the current school year sometimes, often, or very often.

#### **4. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity of the world in which students live and work.**

The education's recognition of diversity is evidenced by the fact that the [Core/General Educational Program](#) for all students, regardless of college or focus of study, requires the completion of course work aimed at fostering understanding and respect regarding different cultures and peoples, both within and outside the United States, through the study of their beliefs, customs, histories, values and interrelationships. Students select one course from Diversity of U.S. Culture and one course from non-U.S. Culture for a total of six hours.

This core-required multicultural educational experience is complemented by co-curricular offerings across the institution. Programs and opportunities supported include those provided by:

- The division of Equity, Diversity and Community Engagement;
- Catharine S. Eberly Center for Women;



- The Office of Student Diversity/College of Medicine and Life Sciences;
- Center for International Studies and Programs.

Co-curricular opportunities for students include special events, special interest organizations, speaker series, community service and engagement, and international opportunities. All help increase awareness of human and cultural diversity. As an example of the contribution of these offices, the [Catharine S. Eberly Center for Women](#) served over 600 students in 2014-15 and sponsored 67 programs, a total of over 300 hours of programming for the year.

Results from the [2015 National Survey of Student Engagement](#) indicated that over 80% of the students responding felt that the institution [emphasized contact among students from different backgrounds](#) (social, racial/ethnic, religious, etc.) some, quite a bit, or very much. In addition, 88% reported that their experiences at the institution contributed to [“Understanding people of other backgrounds \(economic, racial/ethnic, political, religious, etc.\)”](#) some, quite a bit, or very much.

##### **5. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work, and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their programs and the institution’s mission.**

Faculty and students, both undergraduates and graduates, participate in research and artistic endeavors that contribute to scholarship, creative work and the discovery of knowledge relating to their chosen fields of study.

All undergraduate students have the opportunity to take part in research sponsored by various departments within UT. The [Office of Undergraduate Research \(OUR-UT\) report](#) provides evidence of the significant amount of student research undergoing at UT; the office exists as a central resource for undergraduate research at UT. Primary objectives of OUR-UT include:

- Be a focal point for research opportunities.
- Advocate for increased funding of undergraduate research.
- Showcase undergraduate research accomplishments.
- Be a resource for faculty members to increase undergraduate involvement in their research.
- Be a resource for the community and local industries to increase their involvement in undergraduate research.
- Aid in the integration of a research component to existing courses and/or development of new research-intensive courses.
- Coordinate undergraduate research involvement with the other offices at UT including: the Office of Research, the Honors Program, the Office of Service Learning, the various colleges, and the various departments and/or academic programs.

OUR-UT sponsors a [summer research symposium](#) that includes approximately 25 oral presentations and 25 posters each year to showcase undergraduate research. The office also provides resources that include a student research handbook and a compilation of research opportunities.

All graduate students at UT must show evidence of contributions to scholarship either through their thesis, dissertation or some form of culminating project. Requirements vary by program and are outlined in general in the [Graduate Catalogs](#). All electronic theses and dissertations submitted as degree requirements are published on OhioLINK. Information includes the unique accession number, student name, title, degree, and self-selected program/department/college. A total of 522 theses and dissertations were submitted from Spring 2013 to Fall 2014; a summary of those submitted [Spring 2015](#) is provided. Additionally, UT's Graduate Student Association hosts the [Midwest Graduate Research Symposium](#). Approximately 200 participants from ten universities attended the sixth annual

event in spring 2015.

Faculty research and scholarly work are expected; at the start of the academic year, faculty are required to submit to their chair a signed report, the Annual Report of Professional Activity (ARPA), which enumerates their professional activity in the previous year. For tenure-track faculty, the ARPA includes sections for teaching, professional activity (research) and service. In conjunction with the completion of this assurance argument, evidence of the quantity and range of faculty research and creative activity was requested from each department for the past three academic years, 2012 through 2014, and [summarized](#). In addition, a sampling and review of approximately 160 faculty CVs in spring 2015 indicated that 82% of the sample reviewed included evidence of publication or other scholarly work over the past five years.

Participation in artistic endeavors and performances of creative work are supported and routinely scheduled for University and community viewing by the College of Communication and the Arts. A full 2014-2015 [schedule of events](#) that included faculty and students illustrates the range of music, art, and theatre and film performances, over 125 of which ran during the 2014-15 academic year. In addition, a printed newsletter, [Accent CoCA](#), highlights the college's creative endeavors and learning opportunities for students, faculty and the local artistic community.

As further evidence of the institution's support for students' engagement in research and scholarly work, a search of the undergraduate course catalog for the academic year 2014-15 showed a list of 65 courses that contain research/research skills in the title or catalog description across colleges. These courses included approaches such as directed or independent study research, research methods, information literacy and applied research. Enrollment in these courses totaled 2,453 undergraduate students throughout the year.

## Sources

---

- Accent CoCA
- Chancellor's Council on Graduate Studies New Programs
- College of Communication and the Arts (COCA) Events
- Eberly Center for Women website
- Electronic Theses and Dissertations 2015
- Faculty Senate - Standing Committees - Core Curriculum
- Faculty Senate - Standing Committees - Core Curriculum (page number 4)
- Faculty Senate Constitution-Appendix and Rules
- Faculty Senate Constitution-Appendix and Rules (page number 16)
- Faculty Senate Roster AY2015-2016
- Faculty Senate Standing Committees Roster 2015
- Faculty Senate Standing Committees Roster 2015 (page number 3)
- General Education Assessment Plan, May 2015
- Midwest Graduate Research Symposium
- New Program Form - Undergraduate Curriculum Tracking System
- New Program Form-Graduate Curriculum Tracking System
- NSEE response items 2015
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted (page number 2)
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted (page number 3)
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted (page number 8)

- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted (page number 10)
- NSSE Engagement Indicators 2015
- OBOR Academic-Program-Review-Guidelines\_FINAL\_042915
- Ohio Articulation and Transfer Policy
- OUR-UT AnnualReport 2015
- OUR-UT symposium agendas 2013-15
- Program Review Questions to Guide External Reviewers
- Program Review Template 2015-16
- SLO examples
- Summary of Faculty Professional Activity 3 Years With Data Summaries
- University Core Curriculum
- UT Catalog 2015-2016

## 3.C - Core Component 3.C

---

The institution has the faculty and staff needed for effective, high-quality programs and student services.

1. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and the non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance; establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff; involvement in assessment of student learning.
2. All instructors are appropriately qualified, including those in dual credit, contractual, and consortial programs.
3. Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.
4. The institution has processes and resources for assuring that instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; it supports their professional development.
5. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.
6. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising, and co-curricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained, and supported in their professional development.

### Argument

---

**1. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance; establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff; involvement in assessment of student learning.**

[UT faculty](#) is composed of instructors, lecturers, associate lecturers, senior lecturers, assistant professors, associate professors and professors. About 25% have been with UT for 20 years or longer and ~45% were hired in the last 10 years. The ratio of students to faculty is 14:1. About three-quarters of faculty hold full-time positions; lecturers help minimize use of part-time faculty. UT is committed to recruiting and maintaining an excellent faculty who are well qualified, creative, hardworking, dedicated to student success and active in scholarly and outreach activities. Faculty are hired and retained based on demonstrated expertise in their disciplines and therefore qualified to determine curricular content and oversight, and expectations for student performance and assessment. Department chairs work with deans and the provost on the faculty hiring process and faculty Annual Workload Agreement to ensure sufficient faculty for classroom and non-classroom roles.

A special survey for the purposes of developing this assurance argument was distributed to department chairs in spring 2015 (response rate 78%). To assess the question of sufficient number of faculty, this survey included an item asking chairs to report whether or not changes in academic program requirements were made as a result of the number of available faculty. [Survey results](#) indicate the majority of departments have adequate faculty to offer their academic programs as defined, with a few adjustments required due to faculty availability. A few departments reduced the number of electives or the frequency of offering specific electives due to faculty availability. One department reported changing graduation requirements for its graduate programs due to insufficient number of faculty available to complete field exams, three departments reported eliminating or

suspending enrollment in programs due to lack of faculty expertise and two departments did not have adequate numbers of faculty to provide the Honors course requirements in their major.

The [Faculty Hiring Plan](#) developed in 2014-15 and approved by interim President Naganathan is designed to provide college deans with decision-making authority to move funds and salary lines across departments and strategically develop a hiring plan, taking into consideration program demands, accreditation requirements and the potential job market for graduates. [As of June 30, 2015](#), 118 positions were reviewed as part of the FY15 hiring plan process and 75 positions were approved to search.

The [survey to department chairs](#) also asked them to describe the role of their faculty in the oversight of the curriculum. While the methods of involvement differed - departmental curriculum committee membership or participation in curriculum discussions at faculty meetings, for example - all departments responding confirmed that faculty play an active oversight role.

UT has sufficient faculty for non-classroom roles. Each college/service unit has an assessment liaison who sits on the University Assessment Committee. Faculty also serve on essential committees including: curriculum, governance (Faculty Senate; Graduate Council), faculty credentials for the Graduate College, admissions, promotion and tenure and student adjudication panels.

**2. All instructors are appropriately credentialed, including those in dual credit, contractual, and consortial programs.**

UT faculty possesses the credentials required by the [Ohio Board of Regents Guidelines and Procedures](#) (note that the Ohio Board of Regents is now called Ohio Department of Higher Education) for instructors of higher education. It is expected that faculty hold a master's or doctoral degree, part-time faculty have the same credentials as full-time faculty, and faculty in terminal degree programs hold the same level of degree. Faculty members with bachelor's degrees either teach in associate degree programs or have equivalent experience that is evaluated initially at the department level. When faculty members are employed based on equivalent experience, the [institution defines a minimum threshold](#) of experience and an evaluation process used in the appointment process.

To confirm that UT is in compliance with HLC's faculty qualification expectations by September 2017, the Office of the Provost is re-verifying credentials of all instructors. [New faculty hires must provide](#) official transcripts. Confirming qualifications is an integral part of the recruitment and on-boarding processes.

*UT dual credit programs*

Dual credit programs (College Credit Plus or CC+) are for high school (HS) students who take college level courses on UT campuses or at their HS (modalities can be online, face-to-face, blended). Credit earned is on both the student's UT transcript (college credit) and HS transcript (HS graduation credit). High school instructors are certified: they submit a letter of request; are required to hold an Ohio teaching certification and a master's degree in the content area or hold a master's degree in another area and have at least 18 credit hours of course work in the content area; and submit a vita and a letter of recommendation from the HS principal. Certification to teach is reviewed by the UT department and faculty for the Office of Enrollment that administers the CC+ program, and approved by the Office of the Provost (documents available onsite). Certified HS teachers are primary instructors on HS campuses and are assigned UT faculty as mentors on course assignments and activities, depending on modality of delivery. On UT campuses, University faculty are primary instructors. This is discussed further in Criterion 4.A.4.

*UT consortial programs*

The institution has four consortial programs, with faculty qualifications ensured:

- BSN Consortium with Bowling Green State University (BGSU) in Nursing;
- RN to BSN Consortium with BGSU in Nursing.

For the two consortial programs with BGSU, UT nursing faculty/professional staff teach all upper division nursing major courses for the BS degrees in nursing, as required by the Ohio Board of Nursing. The [BGSU faculty](#) holds a master's or doctoral degree and teach their own BG students in the pre-nursing major on the BG or BG Firelands campuses, i.e., general education core courses/pre-requisite courses for admission to upper division major.

- Doctor of Nursing Practice Consortium with Wright State University (WSU): WSU tenured/tenure eligible faculty teaching in the [DNP Consortium](#) are doctorally prepared or hold the appropriate terminal clinical credentials and are graduate faculty members; non-tenure eligible faculty hold at least a master's degree in nursing.
- [Northwest Ohio Consortium of Public Health with BGSU- MPH](#): BGSU faculty are doctorally prepared or hold the appropriate terminal clinical credentials in the field of public health and are members of the graduate faculty.

The institution has no contractual programs.

**3. Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.**

Department chairs are responsible for the annual performance review and evaluation of departmental faculty through [Policy 3364-72-05 Departments and Departmental Chairs for the University Colleges](#). Details regarding the review process are outlined in the Collective Bargaining Agreements (CBA) for [Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty](#) and [Lecturers](#).

At the start of the academic year, faculty are required to submit to their chair a signed report, the [Annual Report of Professional Activity](#) (ARPA), enumerating their professional activity in the previous year. For tenure-track faculty, the ARPA includes separate sections for teaching, professional activity (research) and service. For lecturers, the focus is on teaching and teaching-related activities, but other objectives identified by the department may be included. The faculty member's chair reviews and evaluates the ARPA relative to the Annual Workload Agreement negotiated between the faculty and the department for the year under review, submitting an evaluation to the appropriate dean's office.

Evaluation materials to support contribution to teaching may include but are not limited to assessment of the learning by students, self-evaluation, classroom visitations, peer review, student evaluations of teaching, review of syllabi, examinations and other curricular materials, and assessment of academic advising of students. The [CBA for Lecturers 9.2](#) also requires the department chair to observe teaching.

As seen in the [Academic Personnel Calendar](#), tenure-track faculty are evaluated annually over the pre-tenure probationary period to determine if progress towards tenure is satisfactory. Tenured faculty are evaluated every five years to further their professional growth. The process for both is to submit a dossier of evidence to support performances in teaching, professional activity and service, all teaching evaluations, annual ARPA, evaluations and merit scores. Post-tenure faculty submit these documents for the previous five years; pre-tenure faculty submit all work to-date each year. In the first two years

of service, the chair and dean consider pre-tenure evaluations. After that, the Department Personnel Committee, department chair, College Committee on Academic Personnel, college dean, University Committee on Academic Personnel, the provost and the President participate in the review process.

Lecturers are evaluated annually with the highest priority given to teaching and teaching-related duties, field work and field supervision. An evaluation of quality and satisfactory performance is submitted to the chair prior to the end of the fall semester each academic year [Lecturers' CBA 9.3](#). Following a review of the evaluative materials, the department chair writes an evaluation of overall effectiveness in teaching and other core responsibilities, and comments regarding non-core duties [Lecturers' CBA 9.4](#).

The timeline for submission of materials, review and evaluation for each faculty level is on the [Academic Personnel Calendar](#). Copies of evaluations are stored in the Office of the Provost.

College of Law faculty not bound by the collective bargaining agreement still follow the CBA rules and processes. College of Medicine and Life Sciences faculty not bound by a collective bargaining agreement are evaluated annually, and for post-tenure reviews, by their chair using workload and effort reports per the [Faculty Rules and Regulations](#). An [Annual Report of Professional Activity](#) was developed specifically to reflect the clinical and mentoring workload for faculty in the College of Medicine and Life Sciences. The annual faculty workload form allows faculty and chairs to plan faculty teaching for the upcoming academic year. The annual departmental faculty review forms are submitted to the dean. They are used to project and monitor faculty effort dedicated to teaching, research and clinical activities when applicable.

[Department chairs reported](#) that the evaluation of quality of teaching for part-time instructors is completed using the same evaluation forms and process used for other teaching faculty.

#### **4. The institution has processes and resources for assuring instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; its supports their professional development.**

Faculty members are recruited and hired based on demonstrated expertise in their disciplines. All new faculty hires must complete and submit an [Employment/Education Data Form](#) and provide the institution with an official transcript to verify the highest degree awarded. The institution adheres to the [Ohio Board of Regents Guidelines and Procedures for Academic Program Review](#), which outlines expectations for faculty credentials for all full- and part-time instructors including graduate teaching assistants and high school teachers who serve as adjunct faculty for dual enrollment courses.

Following appointment to the UT faculty, credentials and effectiveness in teaching are monitored in several ways. As a part of program review, both internal and provided by external accreditors, faculty qualifications are reviewed to ensure that program faculty are current in the discipline. Individual faculty members are reviewed on the quality of their teaching as part of the Annual Report of Professional Activity by their department chair. See 3.C.3 for additional detail on this process. [Promotion in academic rank](#) requires evidence of a record of successful teaching for all ranks.

Multiple resources are provided to support faculty for professional development:

- The institution [provides up to 8 credit hours per semester](#) for undergraduate and graduate courses without the payment of fees.
- New faculty participate in [New Faculty Orientation](#), a two-day program providing general orientation to the institution, sessions focused on promotion and tenure, support for research

- and for teaching and assessment. Over 40 new faculty participated in 2014 and over 60 in 2015.
- [Sabbatical leaves](#) support faculty professional development, scholarly work or time to enhance courses or work on advanced degrees. Thirty-three [sabbatical leaves](#) were granted for 2015-16.
  - The Office of the Provost provides financial support for faculty for travel to present their scholarly work or to defray the cost of publication. All faculty members may apply for [Faculty Professional Development Funds](#). ~\$38,000 was awarded to faculty during 2014-15 from this fund.
  - The Office of the Provost sponsors new chairs' attendance at workshops focused on helping these individuals adapt to their new role and responsibilities. An ongoing series of presentations/discussions, [Professional Development for Academic Administrators](#), is also provided for interested administrators. Total attendance for five sessions during spring 2015 was 81.
  - UT's Research Enterprise [provides support to faculty](#) by assistance with proposal development/writing, mentoring, training opportunities, workshops and seeking sources of funding. The Research Council sponsors opportunities for [internal research funding](#) including: Summer Fellowship Program, deArce-Koch Memorial Endowment Fund in Support of Medical Research/Development, Biomedical Research Innovation Awards, Interdisciplinary Research Initiation Awards, Phase 0 SBIR/STTR Program, Visiting Faculty Research Awards, Archaeological Research Endowment Fund and Publications Subvention Program. A [list of research award recipients](#) for 2014-15 is provided. Funding for University Research Opportunities for 2015-16 exceeds \$389,000 in internal funds. All programs are open to full-time tenure track faculty; however, some are focused on specific groups such as those on nine-month contracts or junior faculty.
  - On the Health Science Campus, the [Jacobson Center for Clinical and Translational Research](#) provides faculty with information about seminars and grand rounds taking place to help foster inter-college and inter-departmental communication and collaboration.
  - The Dean's Research Advisory Council (RAC) makes recommendations regarding the strategic growth of College of Medicine and Life Sciences research program. The RAC faculty support also includes a template for faculty performance assessment, [policy for bridge funding](#) and selection of recipients of the [Medical Research Society Awards](#), and a [Junior Faculty Mentoring Program](#).

The special survey developed for the purposes of developing this assurance argument and distributed to department chairs in spring 2015 (response rate 78%) asked [individual departments to describe](#) the various departmental mechanisms that support faculty professional development. These vary by department and include activities such as financial support for travel, membership in professional organizations, publication cost assistance, departmental mentoring programs, equipment, and department sponsored workshops and invited speakers.

*Professional development – teaching:*

UT Online and the University Teaching Center (UTC) provide professional development and support for faculty in their roles as teachers.

[UT Online](#) (formerly Learning Ventures) oversees and coordinates online education efforts, assists faculty in the development and delivery of online and blended courses, trains faculty in online course design and development and provides technology assistance via workshops, road shows, roundtables, online certificate courses, and individual assistance from instructional designers and educational technologists. Special emphasis is given to Quality Matters program training for high quality online instruction. [During 2013 - June 2015, 217 faculty members participated in professional development opportunities and 135 participated in training sessions focused on technologies during summer 2014 - Summer 2015.](#) Also discussed in Criterion 5.A.4.



The [UTC](#) is supported by the Office of the Provost (\$60,000 operating and programming budget) and provides faculty with professional development in the areas of teaching technologies, syllabus development, teaching skills, assessment and curriculum development. Faculty professional development includes invited speakers, hands-on classroom technology workshops, discussions, techniques to promote learning and strategies to develop assessment tools. Weekly webinars, [Monday Morning Mentor](#) (©Magna Publications), are provided to all faculty, and faculty may take advantage of a [Student Observer Program](#) that provides feedback on teaching from trained student observers. During 2014-15, attendance at the various UTC offerings exceeded 500.

Both [UT Online](#) and [UTC](#) provide course development/transformation award opportunities to faculty. Faculty selected for these awards utilize the institution's resources to develop or revise student-centered courses that embody principles of best practice in teaching to promote learning. During the academic year 2014-15, faculty were supported by UT Online in the development of 37 new online courses, all designed to meet Quality Matters standards for online education; 32 additional faculty were supported by UTC to revise existing courses.

#### **5. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.**

Tenured and tenure-track faculty members are [required to hold](#) and post a minimum of five office hours/week each semester they are teaching. The [standard offer letter templates](#) for lecturers, visiting and part-time faculty addresses this requirement: "maintaining a minimum of five office hours per week, as well as other office hours to accommodate students who cannot utilize regularly posted office hours."

Faculty list office hours on course syllabi and post them on office doors; students contact instructors via email or voice mail. Chairs ensure faculty maintain this requirement and discuss with faculty any need for additional hours. The non-unionized faculty, many in graduate programs, may not have written requirements but each meets with students when mutually agreeable and as requested.

Results of a Student Centeredness Survey, voluntarily completed by students, shows favorable results for items related to accessibility of faculty. [Nearly 75%](#) of students felt satisfied or very satisfied with faculty willingness to discuss ideas and concepts outside of class, and [over 60%](#) felt satisfied or very satisfied with opportunities to work with faculty on activities aside from course work. [Responses](#) on the 2015 National Survey of Students Engagement (NSSE) indicated that 74% of seniors who responded "Discussed course topics, ideas, or concepts with a faculty member outside of class." Approximately 40% reported discussing career plans with a faculty member often or very often and over 50% reported that they worked with a faculty member on activities other than course work during the current school year.

#### **6. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising, and co-curricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained and supported in their professional development.**

Staff members are appropriately qualified for their positions as defined in the relevant position descriptions. The search and hiring process overseen by Human Resources and Talent Development Office ensures only candidates having these qualifications are interviewed and hired. Confirming qualifications (degrees, areas of training/experience) by review of official transcripts is an integral part of UT's recruitment process and on-boarding.

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT:

[Staff is provided up to 8 credit hours of tuition waiver](#) per semester to further their higher education/professional development. Recognition of professional excellence is another important means of supporting staff development utilized by UT as is [University awards](#).

*TUTORING:*

The current [director of the Academic Enrichment Center](#) holds a master in higher education degree and previously served fifteen years as director of curriculum integration of technology at St. John's Jesuit High School and two years with UT's Health Profession Living Learning Community.

The [executive director of the Learning Enhancement Center and the Writing Center](#) holds a doctoral degree in higher education and 15 years of experience in the field of higher education. In addition to the executive director, there are three professional staff (academic services coordinator, supplemental instruction (SI) coordinator, and professional writing tutor), two faculty members, 51 undergraduate tutors and three graduate tutors. A list of [all staff members](#) is provided. The writing tutor, who hires and trains all writing tutors, holds a bachelor of arts and a master of arts in English and has three years of experience in higher education; a faculty member from the Judith Herb College of Education serves as a professional writing tutor on an intermittent basis. Professional development opportunities are available for professional staff such as attending national and regional conferences that include Association for Tutoring Professionals, International Writing Centers Association, National College Learning Center Association and the National Tutoring Association.

Tutors and SI leaders are required to have a 3.5 cumulative grade point average and have an A letter grade in the subject areas they are tutoring. All tutors are required to attend an initial four-hour training session on communication skills, learning styles and tutoring techniques. The training for SI leaders uses the University of Missouri, Kansas City training module for SI instruction. Supervisors observe tutors and SI leaders at least three times per semester. Professional development workshops and further training are available throughout the semester in a variety of topics based on real-time observations, tutor feedback and best practices.

*FINANCIAL AID:*

There are 22 administrative and staff members in the Office of Financial Aid providing services on Main Campus (MC) and Health Science Campus (HSC). The [assistant vice president for financial aid and enrollment services](#) has a BS in accounting (Wright State University), a master's in interdisciplinary education (University of Dayton), and over 20 years' experience with financial aid, student accounts and student business services.

*ACADEMIC ADVISING:*

*Success coaches*

Currently, 20 [success coaches](#) are budgeted (discussed further in Criterion 4.B.3). To hold these full-time professional staff positions, individuals must meet minimum qualifications to be hired and receive ~150 hours of training after hire. Almost every coach holds a master's degree and some are working on doctorates. Success coaches report to the assistant provost for student success and retention.

*College advisers*

Academic advising in undergraduate programs is decentralized; professional staff or both professional staff and faculty are selected based on criteria in programs that use them. [Professional staff](#) typically must have one of the following qualifications: (1) a bachelor's degree plus a specified amount of advising or related experience and stated skills (e.g. communication, technology); or (2) a master's degree in a field of study in the college or program and stated skills. There is no centralized training for academic advisers; units train their own new staff with professional materials, shadowing, one-on-

one instruction (e.g. on requirements and records systems) and observation with feedback. Professional development is offered monthly at meetings of Toledo Academic Advising Association (TACADA, affiliated with the National Academic Advising Association) and through periodic webinars.

Graduate student advising is primarily done by the major professor and thesis/dissertation committees. The College of Graduate Studies also provides regular information about GPA status to the student, adviser and academic college.

#### *Co-Curricular activities*

Qualifications applicable to all professional positions in Student Affairs include a master's degree from an accredited four-year college or university, major in higher education, counseling, business administration or a related field, and a minimum of one year of experience in higher education. Additional years of experience, or experience with increasing levels of responsibilities in supervising staff, program development and implementation, advising student organizations, facilities management, and/or budget management are needed for middle and higher level positions, as well as a broad knowledge of student development theories and ability to apply theories of student development and leadership to practice and programming.

Professional development opportunities include University training and professional development programs; participation in conferences, trainings, workshops/webinars from local, state and national meetings/professional associations, such as National Association of Student Personnel Administrators (NASPA), American College Personnel Association (ACPA), National Conference on Race & Ethnicity in American Higher Education and National Intramural-Recreational Sports Association (NIRSA). During the 2014-15 academic year, three individuals with the Division of Student Affairs attended professional development initiatives sponsored by NIRSA and nine others, along with the residence hall directors, were active participants in ACPA and NASPA offerings, with one engaged as a member of the national committee for ACPA. All staff can participate in continuing education opportunities by enrolling in an advanced degree program offered by the institution.

## Sources

---

- Academic Adviser - example position descriptions
- Academic Enrichment Center Director - position description and CV
- Academic Personnel Calendar 2015
- Annual Report of Professional Activities ARPA
- ARPA form-College of Medicine Life Sciences
- BGSU Collective Bargaining Agreement and the BGSU Faculty effective 05-01-2013
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Lecturers
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Lecturers (page number 12)
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Lecturers (page number 13)
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Tenured Tenure Track
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Tenured Tenure Track (page number 12)
- Collective Bargaining Agreement CBA-Tenured Tenure Track (page number 35)
- Doctor of Nursing Practice (DNP) - Brochure
- Employment Education Data Form
- Faculty Hiring Plan Status as of 6-30-2015
- Faculty Hiring Rehiring Plan 2015
- Faculty Professional Development Funds 2014-2015 Summary

- Faculty Rules and Regulations for Faculty not bound by a Collective Bargaining Agreement
- Jacobson Center
- Junior Faculty Mentoring Program
- LEC Exec Director-position description and CV
- LEC Staff
- Medical Research Society Award - UT News Article
- New Faculty Hire Doc Requirements
- New Faculty Orientation - Agenda 2014
- New Faculty Orientation-Faculty Checklist 2015
- Northwest Ohio Consortium for Public Health with BGSU and Wright State University
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted
- NSEE response items 2015-highlighted (page number 2)
- OBOR Academic-Program-Review-Guidelines\_FINAL\_042915
- Online course development funding
- Professional Development Academic Administrators Spring 2015
- Research Awards Internal 2013-15
- Research Enterprise Support to Faculty
- Sabbatical Leave Application form
- Sabbatical Leaves 2015-2016
- Schissler Steve resume
- Standard offer letter templates-lecturer.visiting.PTfaculty
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014 (page number 9)
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014 (page number 10)
- Success Coach-Position Description
- Survey to chairs - Summary May 2015
- Survey to chairs - Summary May 2015 (page number 11)
- Survey to chairs - Summary May 2015 (page number 30)
- Survey to chairs - Summary May 2015 (page number 37)
- University Awards
- University Teaching Center
- UT List of Instructors 03-08-2016
- UT Online Annual Report 2014-2015
- UT Policy 3364-81-01-02-007 Research Bridge Funding
- UT Policy no. 3364-25-35 Education Assistance and Tuition Waiver
- UT Policy no. 3364-72-05 Departments and Departmental Chairs for the University Colleges
- UT Policy no. 3364-72-11 University Evaluation of Faculty Qualifications DRAFT
- UT Research Funding Opportunities Brochure 15-16
- UTC Annual Report 2014-2015
- UTC Annual Report 2014-2015 (page number 5)
- UTC Annual Report 2014-2015 (page number 6)
- UTC Innovations in Teaching Awards
- UTC Student Observer Program
- UTC-Course Design Institute

## 3.D - Core Component 3.D

---

The institution provides support for student learning and effective teaching.

1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.
2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.
3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its programs and the needs of its students.
4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites, museum collections, as appropriate to the institution's offerings).
5. The institution provides to students guidance in the effective use of research and information resources.

### Argument

---

#### **1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.**

UT provides a variety of student support services to enhance the learning of our diverse student population. The [demographic of students](#) served includes undergraduate and graduate students; new, transfer and online students; first-generation, underprepared, adult learners, military and other populations that vary in race, ethnicity, socio-economic status and geographic background. These aspects shape the support programs and services designed to meet the learning needs of our students.

Upon admittance to UT, all students are required to participate either in person or online in an orientation program providing information about campus support services; students interact individually with academic advisers to register for courses. [New student orientation programs](#) are customized based on category of student, new student, transfer student or re-admitted student. Students receive instant access to the [myUT Portal](#), connecting them to additional resources and affording them the opportunity to become familiar with University support services via [UT Portal Student/Student Resources](#) tabs. Students have the ability to check class schedules and grades, view and pay bills, and submit feedback on classroom experiences through a [mobile app](#).

Students are afforded support services that include academic advising, [career and experiential learning](#) opportunities, [disability services](#), tutoring by [Learning Enhancement Center](#) and [Academic Enrichment Center](#), and co-curricular engagement. These services are designed to assist students in achieving their educational goals while contributing to their growth and development.

#### **2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.**

UT uses selective admission standards for colleges and/or programs requiring higher levels of preparation for success in first-year courses, and provides preparatory instruction and learning support to address students' academic needs. [YouCollege](#) guides undecided students in exploring majors and

careers, and directs major-ineligible students into appropriate preparation for reaching their goals. Starting July 2016, YouCollege and its [department of exploratory studies](#) will become part of a new University College.

In 2015-2016, UT instituted the [Multicultural Emerging Scholars Program](#), incorporating both a residential summer bridge program and a continuing living-learning community for the participants' first year. Twenty-five students completed the summer term. Enrolled in 8 credits, the cohort earned an average summer GPA of 3.15. Twenty-four students returned in the fall, earning an average GPA of 2.7; there was a 90% retention rate from fall 2015 to spring 2016. Planning for the summer 2016 bridge program and fall living learning community is underway. The Division of Student Affairs will continue to play a critical role.

Success coaches assigned to first-year students assist them in developing individualized plans for academic and personal success and stay with them throughout their years at UT. Using the [Starfish EARLY ALERT™](#) Case Management Tool, Success Coaches track students' progress in the classroom and communicate with professors to address specific academic concerns. Results of a one-semester pilot project involving several 1000-level mathematics and composition courses showed positive results associated with the use of the early-alert system: decreased DFW rates by 2 percentage points overall for the participating courses when compared to rates for the prior year (decreased DFW rates of ~16 percentage points in MATH1200, 7 percentage points in MATH1320 and 5 percentage points in ENGL1110).

In the second semester (fall 2015) of utilizing Starfish, the project expanded beyond ENGL1110, MATH1200, and MATH1320 to include MATH1180, and several pilot sections of MATH1730. In looking at fall 2014 to fall 2015 DFW rate data, the DFW rates decreased by 1.7 percentage points for ENGL1110, .6 percentage points for MATH1320, and 4.2 percentage points for MATH1180. The DFW rates in MATH1200 and MATH1180, however, remained fairly flat or did not improve from the prior fall. In looking at utilization of support services based on the early-alert flags raised by math instructors in progress surveys, it was found that students did not utilize resources such as tutoring and math study tables for MATH1180. It is believed the timing of the two early-alert surveys in MATH1180 did not occur at optimal interval times (too early in the term and too late in the term) for proactive intervention to occur with the students. Adjustments have been made to the timing of the early-alert progress surveys for courses in Spring 2016, such as around key test dates, to ensure proactive intervention can occur and students can be directed to resources to aid in their success. Adjustments have also been made in the support services area to fill the growing tutoring demand for students enrolled in MATH1320, including a renovated room for spring 2016 in Carlson Library.

Each student is also assigned an academic adviser who helps the student stay on track to complete requirements for graduation and take advantage of opportunities inside and outside the classroom. Success coaches and academic advisers act as points of contact for students to address questions, concerns or problems related to their University experience.

Entering students are placed appropriately in mathematics, chemistry and general education courses based on placement models developed internally through data collection and analysis. Students who do not qualify by ACT/SAT for the math courses prescribed for their programs are directed to a web-based assessment and learning system, Assessment and Learning in Knowledge Spaces (ALEKS) for testing and up to six months of online adaptive instruction before final testing and placement. General chemistry uses a similar online ALEKS product incorporating testing and adaptive learning. The Testing Center on Main Campus offers alternative on-site placement testing in college algebra, trigonometry, general chemistry and chemistry for the health sciences. Testing in a foreign language allows students to begin study at an appropriate level and/or test out of one or more courses. Students

may test for placement in French, German, Japanese, Latin and Spanish in the Testing Center; for Arabic in the Foreign Language Department; and for Chinese through the Confucius Institute. Non-native speakers are placed in English composition in one of two levels through ESL testing. Prerequisites for some first-semester courses provide preparation for those who require it. The Academic Test Center on the HSC provides proctoring, accommodations, and monitors national medical test taking by students and residents.

[College of Adult and Lifelong Learning](#) (CALL), serving over 730 students in spring 2015, provides access, career and life coaching, degree completion, and academic support to new, continuing and reentering adult learners. CALL helps students transition to college life and establish a foundation for educational attainments, career success and lifelong learning. The Military Service Center served over 500 students in 2014. Based on students' input and identified needs, services continue to expand. Recent initiatives include a student association, a lounge and parking for veterans. CALL will become part of the new University College in July 2016.

The [Learning Enhancement](#) (LEC) and [Academic Enrichment Centers](#) (AEC) provide free resources and services that support the needs of students by facilitating student engagement and collaboration, within both the face-to-face and online setting. Services include walk-in tutoring for mathematics, science, accounting and foreign language with 18,211 visits in 2013-14; supplemental instruction provided for eight courses with over 8,000 visits for 2013-14; academic workshops, and study resources and strategies. These resources help students foster self-directed learning that contributes to their academic success. [Data collected by the LEC](#) compared the fall-to-fall retention rates of first-time, full-time students in 2013 to 2014. The retention rate for students who attended at least one tutoring session was 91% compared to 84% for students who attended none. As a result of these overall positive outcomes, the supplemental program was expanded to include Organic Chemistry in 2014 and Introduction to Psychology in 2015. [Data collected by the AEC](#) support the importance of the services it provides to HSC students in Fall 2015.

[TRIO Student Support Services](#) (TRIO SSS) provide a range of support services for special populations of students. In 2013-14, TRIO SSS students achieved an average GPA of 2.61; 33% of this cohort achieved a GPA of 3.0 or higher. In addition, 100% of the students rated their SSS "adviser's support of me" 4 or higher out of 5. The TRIO program has grown over the last few years and services were utilized by 175 students, an increase of approximately 10% since 2010.

[Student-Athlete Academic Services](#) are available to all student-athletes, recognizing their unique needs. Over 300 student-athletes utilized the services in 2014-15. Programming and services, including advising, tutoring academic coaching and study tables, are adjusted as needed to fit students' needs. UT won the 2014-15 Mid-American Conference Institutional Academic Achievement Award when its 399 student-athletes posted an overall athletic GPA of 3.213. UT won the award three of the last four years.

### **3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its programs and the needs of its students.**

Academic advising services, including orientation, academic and career planning, course selection and graduation progress evaluation, are delivered to students by professional staff advisers, success coaches and career specialists in college-based centers, and by faculty in academic departments and programs. Models vary based on individual colleges' academic missions. Success coaches assigned to populations across colleges (adults and transfers, direct-from-high-school, Honors) contact students based on predictive tools like Starfish and evidence of transactional problems; assist them in developing goals and study strategies; and make appropriate referrals to opportunities and services.

Advisers and coaches work to help the institution achieve the 2014-16 retention and graduation goals in the [University Completion Plan](#).

Varied modes of delivery serve advising needs: appointment, walk-in, phone, email, Skype, online, in groups, classes, and remote locations. Walk-in Wednesdays or appointments for prospective students are available in all colleges. Critical tools for all advisers and coaches include the [MyUT Portal ToolKits for Faculty/Advisers](#), u.achieve Degree Audit Reports, Transferology, and Transfer Evaluation Services (TES). [Advising is assessed](#) through satisfaction surveys, appointment evaluations, focus groups, data analytics and utilization reports.

**4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites, museum collections, as appropriate to the institution's offerings).**

UT provides appropriate infrastructure and state-of-the-art technology to support effective teaching and learning environments.

#### *Information Technology*

[Information technology](#) supports multiple enterprise applications and oversees software and hardware for faculty and students.

Banner, a highly integrated administrative system with a common database shared by all personnel including faculty, students and advisers, provides information on financial aid, courses and registration.

UT's Authentication Domain (UTAD) account provides authenticated access to most of UT's [computing services](#) using a single user name and password combination.

UT has increased the capacity of the student e-mail system to 50GB, double its previous amount, and maintains wireless coverage on its campuses to nearly 100 percent. It replaced access points with new technology (802.11ac) covering virtually all indoor space on all campuses. Results of the 2014 Student Centeredness Survey indicate that 74% of those responding were satisfied/very satisfied with the availability of [computer facilities](#) and [internet access](#).

UT provides some 100 open and instructional computer labs. Central IT provides five open labs, two of which are available 24 hours, 365 days a year. All open labs have a basic software configuration that includes Microsoft Office suite, SPSS, Maple, various media players, browsers, PDF readers and other multimedia packages. Some colleges also provide labs and most have core mediation, printing and discipline-specific software configurations depending on a program's needs. Several colleges as well as Central IT offer laptop loaners for students.

The [UT Virtual Lab](#) environment can be accessed from anywhere in the world and requires no configuration; users simply sign and start using the applications. The academic environment consists of student labs for general use and virtual computers for specific classes. Virtual labs are available 24 hours a day, 365 days a year.

Self-paced software training for beginner, intermediate and advanced skill sets in Windows 7 and all of the individual Office 2010 applications are available to all faculty, staff and students.

A mature system of strategic planning allows the IT Department to monitor continually the resources



provided in light of anticipated needs, emerging trends and [strategic goals](#) defined by the institution.

#### *Classroom Support*

Some 125 general purpose classrooms have basic media configurations, ranging from one-instructor workstations, internet, projectors and screens; over 100 classrooms have more advanced configuration with document cameras, LCD screen, electronic screens, Crestron touch-panel control systems for lights and sound, high-tech audio systems, wireless microphones, lecture capture and audience response systems to allow student interaction. The number of technology-enhanced classrooms centrally scheduled and permanently equipped has increased over time.

Classroom Services continues to upgrade technology and instructional media to keep pace with faculty needs and emerging trends.

#### *Online Learning Support*

[UT Online](#), formerly Learning Ventures, oversees and coordinates UT's online education efforts, assisting departments and colleges administer and deliver online programs and online and blended courses. UT Online assists faculty in the creation of effective online environments through an instructional design and development department, educational technologists and academic technology personnel. UT Online also maintains the [infrastructure](#) necessary for effective management of curricula online and face-to-face.

#### *Information Resources, Electronic Databases and Libraries*

[UT Libraries](#) enrich the student learning experience, facilitate research at all levels, and engage the community. The libraries consist of four service locations: William S. Carlson Library (which includes the Ward M. Canaday Center for Special Collections), McMaster Engineering Library, Mulford Health Science Library and the LaValley Law Library.

The [libraries serve](#) undergraduate, graduate and professional students, faculty and researchers worldwide, supporting teaching, learning, research and engagement through its collections and services. [Collections](#) include electronic resources, printed titles, media, government documents and special collections, including archives, manuscripts and rare books. The collections' scope expands through our [cooperative partnerships](#), including OhioLINK, the Northwest Ohio Regional Depository, the Toledo-Lucas County Public Library, the Toledo Museum of Art Reference Library and interlibrary loan. [Reference and research services](#) are provided through a variety of methods. Library faculty provide [information literacy instruction](#) for learners at all levels, from introductory to advanced. Library faculty have taught for-credit information literacy courses in a number of colleges, and work with faculty to develop and offer course-integrated information literacy instruction (425 instructional sessions and 3,606 participants in 2013-14).

University Libraries [engage the community](#) through special programs, original and award-winning exhibitions, and its collection of manuscript materials. During the past two years, the University Libraries have embarked on an improvement program for faculty and students. In 2014, the interim provost appointed task forces to review facilities and collections, and in 2015 a [self-study](#) of the libraries was submitted and evaluated by an [external team](#) that also conducted a site visit. Based on this input, University Libraries [launched an effort](#) to develop a facilities master plan that will guide future strategic planning and the search for a new leader. The university has allocated \$3M of state capital funds to improvements in Carlson Library, with plans to begin the renovations in summer 2016. In addition, the university has requested another \$3M in state capital funds in the FY2017 and FY18 biennium for use in continuing the improvements to Carlson Library developed in the master plan for the facility (discussed also in Criterion 5.C.2).

The [LaValley Law Library](#) provides a variety of services to support the teaching, scholarship, research and service programs of the law school. The library is open seven days a week (108.5 hours/week) with reference services available every day — a total of 75–80 hours/week when classes are in session. All reference desk librarians have graduate library degrees and three have law degrees from ABA-accredited law schools. Extensive interlibrary loan services are available through OhioLink; many of the library's databases are available remotely to students and faculty. The library also provides services and resources, such as a computer laboratory and individual and group study rooms.

### *Teaching and Learning Spaces*

Since the time of the last HLC visit, capital funds have been used to upgrade and renovate a number of [learning spaces](#). On the Main Campus, over \$2 million was provided to renovate science and computer labs as well as the Communications Department. On the Health Science Campus, over \$34M was provided to support the Interprofessional Immersive Simulation Center and renovations to the anatomy lab. An additional \$151,000 was invested to move and renovate the ceramics studio in the Center for Sculptural Art at the Toledo Museum of Art. The University is currently undertaking a [master plan](#) to ensure adequacy of facilities.

UT provides an exceptional variety of innovative learning environments [on](#) and [off](#) campus, including:

- The Lake Erie Center, an interdisciplinary research and education center for aquatic conservation, bioremediation and restoration, coastal zone processes, environmental chemistry and hydrology, ecology and ecosystem management, fishery genetics, geography and land use planning, bioeconomics, limnology, remote sensing and environmental monitoring.
- The University's Stranahan Arboretum, a 47-acre off-campus site consisting of cultivated ornamental trees, rolling lawns, natural woods, ponds, wetlands and prairie, serves as one of the Department of Environmental Sciences' field sites for environmental education and research. Both graduate and undergraduate courses in ecology and geology use the Arboretum as an outdoor laboratory.
- The Plant Science Research Center (PSRC) faculty performs basic and applied research in plant biology. The PSRC instructs students from undergraduate through post-doctoral levels; develops, in collaboration with academic, government and industrial partners, technologies for transfer to the public and private sectors; and serves as a regional resource for research and training in the plant sciences.
- UT's Plastination Laboratory provides plastinated specimens to facilitate education of health-care students and students of the Toledo schools and surrounding vicinity. The laboratory has been instrumental in creating a permanent collection of specimens for study and review.
- The Jacobs Interprofessional Immersive Simulation Center (UT-IISC) advances interprofessional collaboration and clinical care through the practice of professional/clinical skills and teamwork, using simulation clinical models and environments.
- The Ruth M. Hillebrand Clinical Skills Center trains and assesses clinical skills of health-care professionals and students.
- Center for Performing Arts (CPA) houses the Department of Music and the Department of Theatre and Film, and received a major renovation in 2011. Music performances take place in the newly renovated Recital Hall; expanded band and choral rooms serve the needs of small and large classes and ensemble rehearsals. Theatre productions take place primarily in the Center Theatre several times a year, with fully equipped scenic and costume shops serving as teaching and production spaces for students and staff. The Lab Theatre has been renovated into a dedicated Film/Video studio space, and all three areas utilize specialized computer labs for hands-on student learning.

- Classrooms in the Center for Visual Arts, a Frank Gehry building, house almost all courses in art history and art education. The building's sky-lit studios and extensive darkrooms are home to the photography, painting, drawing, new media, foundation and printmaking classes. The Center for Sculptural Studies, also a Frank Gehry building, houses the metals foundry and has studio space for sculpture, ceramics, installation and design classes. Digital Studio and the Haigh Auditorium offer state of the art spaces for visual arts instruction. The CVA Gallery is the home of student, faculty and visiting artist exhibitions throughout the year.
- Toledo Museum of Art's Reference Library is an art research library reflecting the museum's collections and exhibitions. The Library also serves as the library for UT's Department of Art and maintains a circulating collection for students, faculty and Museum members. In addition to books, periodicals and DVDs, resources include access to art auction databases, an artists' index to exhibitions held at the Museum since 1901, documentary information on the Museum's collections, vertical files on more than 20,000 artists, and research assistance. The public is invited to use the Library, free of charge, during public hours.
- [Additional technological enrichments](#).

Academic programs requiring clinical practice sites (in colleges including health sciences, medicine, nursing and pharmacy) work to ensure adequacy of available sites. This is evidenced by the continued and full accreditation of these programs. A recently signed [Affiliation Agreement](#) between the College of Medicine and Life Sciences and ProMedica will result in the [expansion](#) of the sites available for students in health-care-related programs.

#### **5. The institution provides to students guidance in the effective use of research and information resources.**

As further evidence of the institution's guidance of students in effective use of research and information resources, a search of the undergraduate course catalog for the academic year 2014-15 showed a list of 65 courses that contain research/research skills in the title or catalog description across colleges. These courses included approaches such as directed or independent study research, research methods, information literacy and applied research. Enrollment in these courses totaled 2,453 undergraduate students throughout the year.

UT is committed to providing and enhancing the learning experience of all students through staff support, training, coursework and programming that help advance student knowledge in identifying, evaluating and using information resources. For example, the library system offers [classes on information literacy](#), thesis and dissertation information and APA formatting. LibGuides and trained library staff provide information on how to use the information portals and [research databases](#) available to students.

Individual colleges provide students with guidance through faculty supervision and program-appropriate training that deals with specific types of research being conducted. For example, two courses offered, [On Being a Scientist](#) and [Issues in Research and Scholarship](#), includes information on responsible conduct during research. The [Office of Undergraduate Research](#) provides additional coursework and programming on undergraduate issues in research, scholarship and ethics in research (see also Criterion 3.B.5).

#### **Sources**

---

- 2015 Facts at a Glance
- Academic Enrichment Center

- Additional Technological Enrichment
- AEC Support of HSC Colleges Fall 2015
- Assessment Reports - Advising
- Building Inventory 02-04-2016
- Center for Experiential Learning & Career Services
- Classroom Facilities Summary 2015
- CoCA teaching and learning spaces
- College of Adult and Lifelong Learning CALL website
- Computing Services
- Exploratory Studies
- Information Technologies IT Strategic Plan 2014-2015
- Issues in Research and Scholarship Summer 2015
- LaValley Law Library ABA Report
- Learning Enhancement Center
- LEC Tutoring Data 2013-2014
- Multicultural Emerging Scholars Summer Bridge Program MESP
- MyUT Portal Login page
- MyUT Portal Student-Student Resources
- MyUT Portal Toolkits for Faculty Advisers
- Office of New Student Orientation
- Office of Undergraduate Research
- On Being a Scientist Spring 2016
- Starfish website
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014 (page number 8)
- Student Centeredness Survey 2014 (page number 11)
- Student Disability Services
- Student-Athlete Academic Services
- TRIO Student Support Services
- University Core Curriculum
- University Libraries - collections
- University Libraries - exhibit and outreach activities
- University Libraries - external program review report
- University Libraries - information literacy instruction
- University Libraries - Mission, Vision, Policies
- University Libraries - partnerships
- University Libraries - reference and research services
- University Libraries - self study
- University Libraries - vital statistics 2014
- University Libraries - Working Group Reports Final
- UT Facilities - Campus Master Plan update
- UT Mobile App
- UT Online Annual Report 2014-2015
- UT Online resources
- UT University Completion Plan 2014
- UT Virtual Labs
- UT-Promedica Affiliation Agreement final
- UT-Promedica\_BladeArticle5-14-15
- YouCollege

## 3.E - Core Component 3.E

---

The institution fulfills the claims it makes for an enriched educational environment.

1. Co-curricular programs are suited to the institution's mission and contribute to the educational experience of its students.
2. The institution demonstrates any claims it makes about contributions to its students' educational experience by virtue of aspects of its mission, such as research, community engagement, service learning, religious or spiritual purpose, and economic development.

### Argument

---

UT provides an enriched educational environment as evidenced by the number and range of opportunities for students to engage in co-curricular activities complementary to their programs of study, develop aspects of their personality and strengthen their classroom learning.

Co-curricular opportunities are well aligned with the institution's mission statement, reflecting a commitment to "advance knowledge...through engagement" as well as to the core value of Engagement, Outreach and Service: a focus on services that meet students' needs and being a center of excellence for cultural, athletic and other events.

The [Office of Student Involvement](#) seeks to build community, providing students with opportunities for involvement that will enhance and complement their UT experience. This is achieved through social, educational and developmental programs and support to help students get connected to campus, discover involvement and leadership opportunities and learn more about campus life. The office oversees over several hundred [student organizations](#) focused on [Greek life](#), honorary societies and special interests such as academics, politics, religion, service, cultural/social, sports and the [Levis Leadership UT program](#).

The [University Recreation Center](#) provides engaging, student-centered recreational and health promotion programs and development opportunities for student success. The Center is one of the largest campus employers of students, who are given the opportunity to develop multiple skills. Programming includes a wellness center, sports clubs, summer camps and many special events focused on health and wellness.

The [Center for International Studies and Programs](#) (CISP) fosters cross-cultural understanding by linking students, faculty and staff, visiting scholars and community. CISP plays a leading role in global outreach, coordinating international experiences for students and providing support services for international students. Programming includes an international speaker program, travel grant and scholarship opportunities, study abroad, student exchange, UT Explorers and global health initiatives. Each year, over 500 faculty and students (international and domestic) going abroad utilize the Center's resources.

The [Office of International Student & Scholar Services](#) (OISSS) provides UT and greater NW Ohio with quality international education programming and community engagement with people of diverse cultures. OISSS helps over 2000 international students transition to life in the United States and at the institution.

The [Center for Experiential Learning and Career Services](#) (CELCS) works to connect students to meaningful learning experiences and assist them with academic choices and career exploration. Co-curricular activities available through CELCS include service learning, Ohio Means Jobs and a Washington Center Internship program.

Summative evidence of the level of community engagement attained by the institution, faculty, staff and students was the recent receipt of the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching's 2015 [Community Engagement Classification](#). The award recognized "excellent alignment among campus mission, culture, leadership, resources, and practices that support dynamic and noteworthy community engagement." To the extent that students participate in many of these community activities, these activities contribute to the overall co-curricular experiences available.

UT's impact on the economic development in the region is evidenced by the translation of UT research into commercial success. Sixty invention disclosure forms were received by the [Technology Transfer Office](#) in 2014 and 50 inventors contributed to patents issued the same year by the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office. Three start-ups were established to commercialize technology developed by faculty members in 2013 and four more in 2014.

## Sources

---

- Annual Report on Technology Transfer 2015AY
- Carnegie Community Engagement Classification Letter
- Center for Experiential Learning & Career Services
- Center for International Studies and Programs
- Greek Life
- Levis Leadership UT
- Living Learning and Special Interest Communities
- Office of International Student Scholar Services
- Office of Student Involvement
- UT Recreation Center
- UT Student Organizations by type 2015-2016

## **3.S - Criterion 3 - Summary**

---

The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

### **Summary**

---

Because it is committed to improve the human condition; to advance knowledge through excellence in learning, discovery and engagement; and to serve as a diverse, student-centered public metropolitan research university, UT provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings. Its faculty have received commendations, both on and off the campus, for their outstanding research, teaching and service.

UT expanded its ability to provide a quality education to a larger student body with its recent merger. The University's degree programs are appropriate for the comprehensive research institution that is has become. The cross fertilization of academic disciplines created by the merger bring a rich diversity of instructional modalities together.

The appropriateness of all degree programs, including general education, is supported by the broad engagement of qualified faculty in the development, review, and approval process for programs and courses as well as the teaching and assessment of students' learning. Student learning outcomes are articulated for all programs and address a range of skills appropriate for higher education across the institution. Processes exist to ensure program quality across instructional methods and locations. In the face of challenging financial circumstances, the Board of Trustees and the University administration continue to be committed to quality education by providing suitable faculty development opportunities, technology resources and physical space. The rich diversity of co-curricular opportunities and experiences are valuable resources for student growth and development.

### **Sources**

---

*There are no sources.*