



THE UNIVERSITY OF
TOLEDO
1872

Executive Summary
of the University's
Higher Learning Commission
Mid-Cycle Assurance Argument
Submitted March 11, 2016

INTRODUCTION

A team of consultant-evaluators from the Higher Learning Commission (HLC) will conduct a Year 4 (mid-cycle) Comprehensive Evaluation of the University of Toledo April 11-12, 2016.

In preparation for the visit, the University has submitted an assurance argument and corresponding evidence that the team will review before its arrival. This document summarizes the assurance argument, and is organized to correspond with the five criteria for accreditation as established by the HLC.

To read the complete document, go to www.utoledo.edu/hlc.

CRITERION ONE. MISSION

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

1A. The institution's mission is broadly understood within the institution and guides its operations.

The UT mission statement, corresponding vision and core values were developed in a process suited to the institution's higher education nature and culture of inclusion, as the process included faculty, staff and students. The Mission statement was developed through joint efforts of an Executive Steering Committee of the Merger Group and a Faculty Senate Synergy work group following the 2006 merger of the former Medical University of Ohio and the former University of Toledo into the new University of Toledo.

The 2007 mission, core values and vision statements were approved by the Board of Trustees (BOT) on January 8, 2007 (Resolution 06-12-14).

The 2007 mission statements were reaffirmed in 2010-2011 as part of the strategic planning process leading to *Directions 2011*, the University's strategic plan. The mission statements are current.

UT recognizes that its primary contribution to "improving the human condition, advancing knowledge through excellence in learning, discovery and engagement, while serving as a diverse, student-centered university" is through its educational and co-curricular programs. There is a strong link between the mission and UT's academic programs.

The 2012 HLC report noted for shared governance the existence of "tension between goals of careful deliberation (more common among Main Campus faculty) and a need for decisive, rapid response by the administration." A fall 2015 survey of campus still found some disparity but the comments provide evidence that tensions have eased under interim and new leadership.

Public recognitions attest to the alignment of services and mission:

- July 2015, UT received the Diversity Higher Education Award (HEED) for the third straight year. Only colleges and universities "demonstrating an outstanding commitment to diversity and inclusion" receive this national distinction.
- UT's Medical Center (UTMC) received national designation as a Leader in LGBT Healthcare Equality, the second consecutive year UTMC met the standards of the Healthcare Equality Index.
- UT's services for student veterans earned UT recognition from Military Times, G.I. Jobs, a place in the "Best for Vets: Colleges 2016" rankings, and designations as a 2016 Military Friendly School by Victory Media's G.I. Jobs magazine and a Top Military Friendly University by Military Advanced Education & Transition.

1B. The mission is publicly articulated

UT addresses its constituents through its "About UT" website, where the mission, vision, and core values are shared prominently. The mission statement is found at the beginning of the University *Directions 2011* strategic plan, appears in admissions materials, on the back of business cards, on screensavers and campus TVs, and in University Hall.

The scope of the institution is defined by the mission and by the Carnegie Foundation's designation of UT as a doctoral university with higher research activity, which denotes its breadth of programs as well as the range of its undergraduate and graduate degrees and the focus on the development of new knowledge

The mission documents identify the nature of the institution as a "diverse, student-centered public metropolitan research University." UT understands its constituents to be the students who study and work here, the faculty

who teach here, the staff who support the mission in multiple ways, and the geographic community as well as the global community it engages through educational and research activities.

The diversity of faculty and staff: Of the 1,487 instructional faculty, 55% are male, 45% female, 80% are white, 16% ethnic minority, 3% international, ~1% unknown ethnicity. Of the 3,115 staff members (including hospital staff): 45% are male, 55% female. Data related to ethnicity of the staff indicate that 67% are white, 18% ethnic minority, 14% international, 1% unknown ethnicity. Of the 999 research/graduate assistants at UT: 55% are male, 45% female, 48% are white, 10% ethnic minority, 41% international, 1% unknown ethnicity.

The fall 2015 enrollment profile of its 20,381 students indicated 22% ethnic minority and 6% international for undergraduates and 16% and 19%, respectively, for graduate students.

1C. The institution understands the relationship between its mission and the diversity of society.

The University evidences its understanding of the relationship between its mission and the diversity of society in 5 ways.

1. Diversity is explicitly addressed in the University mission statement and further emphasized in its core values. In 2006-2007, President Jacobs created the President's Council on Diversity, whose thirty-plus members "serve as an advisory group to the President providing recommendations based on observations, reports, and monitoring concerning diversity issues on the UT Campus."

In November 2013, President Jacobs appointed the University's first chief diversity officer. In fall 2015, President Gaber appointed Dr. Willie McKether, associate dean, College of Languages, Literature and Social Science, as Special Assistant to the President on Diversity. His primary task is to write the university's first campus-wide, comprehensive diversity plan. In doing so, he is conducting focus groups and surveys with student, faculty, staff and members of the University community to learn how they feel about and perceive diversity at the University.

2. The division of Equity, Diversity and Community Engagement (EDCE) ensures UT provides processes and activities reflecting its mission-driven commitment to improve the human condition for all constituents. The EDCE conducts diversity training through its Culture Building Institute; manages the Culture Ambassadors; leads the UT Campus Climate Survey; assists in presenting the President's Lecture Series on Diversity.

Its Minority Business Development Center (MBDC) promotes minority-owned businesses and provides real-world experiences to students. In 2014, the 19 participating businesses generated more than \$10 million in sales with 90 jobs supported. The EDCE was awarded more than \$450,000 from the Ohio Development Services Agency to create and run the Minority Business Assistance Program within the MBDC, ultimately serving 17 counties.

The Catharine S. Eberly Center for Women advocates for female faculty, staff and students at UT and in the larger community. In 15 years, more than 6,000 individuals have come through the Center and 3,600 have matriculated at UT.

3. The Office of Inclusion protects against and investigates harassment or discrimination. It conducts oversight of the hiring process for faculty positions. Diversity is required in the composition of all UT search committees. Names of faculty search committee members are sent to the Office of Inclusion to approve/verify appropriate diversity of the group and determine the completion of Search Committee Training (required every two years).

4. The Office of Multicultural Student Success is a hub of academic programs, activities and services that reach students in the 7th grade through high school graduation and beyond.
 - TOLEDO EXCEL scholarship incentive program for underrepresented minority groups;
 - Upward Bound, a federal program, promotes college enrollment for high school students;
 - Latino Initiatives forms partnerships with communities, K-12 public and private schools and businesses to promote Latino achievement, and offers the annual Latino Youth Summit.
5. UT addresses its role in a multicultural society through the Center for International Studies and Programs, which promotes cross-cultural interactions among students, faculty and staff, visiting scholars and the community to foster understanding and appreciation.

The 2014 Climate Survey showed broad consensus among students and faculty that UT is an inclusive institution.

1D. The institution's mission demonstrates commitment to the public good.

While UT recognizes that its primary contribution to the improvement of the human condition is accomplished through its degree-granting educational programs, it understands its mission extends to its local, regional and state communities as well as the global community. Community outreach and engagement are core academic goals, representing a longstanding commitment that permeates the institution. UT's mission, core values and vision statements all explicitly describe the institutional commitment to engage with and provide excellent service to its constituents.

- UT was included in the 240 U.S. colleges and universities to receive the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching's 2015 Community Engagement Classification.
- UT recognizes faculty contributions to our community with the annual Edith Rathbun Outreach and Engagement Excellence Award to faculty who exemplify outreach and service in their scholarly activities. The Provost Office offers a Shining Star Award for Community Involvement.
- The Institute for Human Trafficking and Social Justice, established in 2015, was a direct result of a cry from community leaders to help Toledo deal with the problem of trafficking of youth in the region and country.
- The Lloyd Jacobs Interprofessional Immersive Simulation Center was made in part to provide state of the art training facilities for community members that include the U.S. Air Force, fire fighters, first responders and EMTs.
- UT worked with the city of Toledo and state of Ohio starting in August 2014 to respond to the water crisis that resulted from harmful algal blooms on Lake Erie.
- UT@TPS (The University of Toledo at the Toledo Public Schools), offered through the College of Adult and Lifelong Learning, was established in 2010 to help parents and community members continue their own education and potentially become retention advocates for Toledo's children and youth.
- Examples of community service and offerings are: Community Care Clinic, the S. Amjad Hussain Visiting Lecture in the History of Medicine and Surgery, the Dorothy MacKenzie Price Piano Series, the Jesup Scott Honors College Distinguished Lecture Series, the McMaster Cosmology Lecture Series, the UT Eberly Center Lecture and Film Series, the College of Law's Stranahan National Issues Forum and Cannon Lecture Series, the Edward Shapiro Distinguished Lecture Series, the Edwin Dodd Lecture, and the Saturday Morning Science series.
- The Jack Ford Urban Affairs Center is an applied research center that provides support in addressing a broad range of metropolitan Toledo research topics.

In October 2013, UT was named a member of the Association of Public and Land-Grant Universities' inaugural 16-member class of "Innovation and Economic Prosperity Universities." The designation acknowledges universities working with public and private sector partners in their states and regions to support economic development through a variety of activities, including innovation, entrepreneurship, technology transfer, talent and workforce development and community development.

UT's educational responsibilities take primacy over other purposes. UT is a public research university governed by a Board of Trustees and the Ohio Department of Higher Education. The purpose of the institution is to fulfill its educational mission while demonstrating its role as a "significant diverse, student-centered public metropolitan research university." As a not-for-profit, public institution, UT has no investors and is not expected to generate financial returns. All revenue, tuition income, grant funding and public funding, is directed toward teaching, research and service to the community-at-large.

In fall 2015 the BOT approved an academic affiliation between the College of Medicine & Life Sciences and Promedica Health Systems of Toledo. Working together, these organizations are creating stronger, more competitive medical education programs for students and residents, and improved health care coordination for northwest Ohio residents by access to the complementary programs and service lines of a larger clinical system.

Evidence of the commitment to economic development and community enhancement is the revitalization of an area adjacent to Main Campus. The \$12 million Dorr Street Gateway Project, bordering the southwest corner of Main Campus, is creating a college-town atmosphere with restaurants, coffee shops, bookstores and student living spaces. The Dorr Street Safety Project, adjacent to Main Campus, greatly improved traffic conditions in one of the more highly congested intersections in Toledo.

The UT Intermodal Transportation Institute (ITI) is part of the CFIRE Consortium (a 10-university national Center for Freight and Infrastructure Research) and encompasses a geographical area serving the majority of U.S. freight traffic. Focused on transportation, logistics, and supply chain issues, UT/ITI conducts research, education, outreach and technology transfer in support of the freight community. This is Ohio's only Tier 1 University Transportation Center.

Criterion One Summary

UT is a mission-driven institution that understands the education it offers to its students is its primary purpose and that this purpose is best realized through the deep engagement of its students, faculty, staff and administrators in its local, regional, national and global communities. The inclusion of its broad constituency in decision-making, strategic planning and execution assures that its decisions include the insights afforded by diverse perspectives, its plans consider the needs of everyone while admitting the limits of its abilities to meet them all, and its strategies arise from purposeful commitment to improving the human condition

CRITERION TWO. INTEGRITY: ETHICAL AND RESPONSIBLE CONDUCT

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

2A. The institution operates with integrity in its financial, personnel and auxiliary functions; it establishes and follows policies and processes for fair and ethical behavior on the part of its governing board, administration, faculty and staff.

UT follows established institutional policies, practices and procedures (University policy manuals, UT website) and established law. Ohio Revised Code Chapter 3364 established the merged UT.

The BOT operates under a code of ethics: members undergo ethics training every two years.

Under BOT bylaws, the Board's Finance and Audit Committee is charged with oversight and continuous financial soundness of UT-internal and external audits. The Trusteeship and Governance Committee ensures integrity of the Board.

Article 6 of the Collective Bargaining Agreement (AAUP unionized faculty) and the Rules and Regulations (faculty not bound by a collective bargaining agreement) address conflicts of interest for faculty.

A 2015 independent auditor's report by Plante & Moran, PLLC validates UT's responsible operations: "The University is positioning itself to address the formidable challenges it faces. The University has reduced administrative expenses over the last several years by managing resources more efficiently; establishing stronger budget and position controls; and implementing automation and re-engineering processes. The University continues its pursuit of reducing expenses wherever possible while still maintaining critical functions in support of the student experience and its mission."

UT complies with required curriculum directives initiated by the Ohio Department of Higher Education (communicated on the Provost's Office web page).

Academic and student policies are evidence of a commitment to academic integrity:

- Undergraduate academic dishonesty policy
- Graduate student academic dishonesty policy
- Student code of conduct-prohibits cheating and plagiarism
- Course syllabi reference information on academic integrity and dishonesty
- Policy on the confidentiality of student records; FERPA training and a process for reporting of FERPA violations.

The Office of Financial Planning ensures transparent development/implementation of budget and budgetary procedures.

- Budget blue books are publicly available on Office of Financial Planning, Analysis and Budget web site.
- As prescribed by Board bylaws, the President and Board's Finance Committee review the budget and the President presents the budget to the BOT.

UT has an Equal Opportunity Policy for faculty and staff searches. Search committee members undergo training through the Office of Inclusion (76% of employees trained to date).

Human Resources policies for faculty and staff require ethical behavior. The Standards of Conduct Policy outlines responsibilities of supervisors. University policy on sexual harassment and other forms of harassment prohibit conduct affecting an environment of equity and respect. Title IX information is provided campus wide; a new Title IX Coordinator was hired (Mr. Donald Kamm) and three Title IX deputies were appointed; a consistent complaint process is in place; mandatory Title IX training of all faculty as well as staff involved in Title IX processes was completed. Confidential reporting services are available.

As a state institution, UT abides by Ohio open records laws and public meeting laws. Policies are developed transparently and the process utilizes an open 30-day comment period on new/modified policies on the University Policy website (email sent to all UT members.) BOT agendas and minutes are available on the BOT website (most meetings are open to the public.) Faculty Senate and Graduate Council websites host agendas/minutes and meetings are open to the public.

2B. The institution presents itself clearly and completely to its students and the public with regard to its programs, requirements, faculty and staff, costs to students, control and accreditation relationships.

The UT website is the primary source of all University information. Also the Office of Undergraduate Admissions and College of Graduate Studies websites, individual college websites and the University catalog present information on admissions and program requirements.

The Office of Institutional Research (IR) ensures its website provides clear, easily accessible and accurate information about UT.

Tuition and fees are presented on the Office of the Treasurer website as Finance brochures. The Office of Undergraduate Admissions website has estimated expenses and there is an interactive price calculator on the Office of Financial Aid's website.

The Office of the Registrar website has important registration dates; the office communicates with students about their accounts and bills prior to each semester. Transfer credit information and processes are in one place on the Registrar's website.

Accreditation information is prominently displayed on the website of the Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review. This includes regional HLC accreditation as well as external accreditation of over 40 UT programs by professional societies. Program accreditation is also displayed on individual college/program web pages.

2C. The governing board of the institution is sufficiently autonomous to make decisions in the best interest of the institution and to assure its integrity.

Under Ohio revised code, UT is governed by a Board of Trustees appointed by the Governor and composed of 8 voting members and 2 non-voting student members, who serve nine-year and two-year terms, respectively. The BOT Preamble sets forth the expectation the Board will "serve and govern the University in an effective way and to ensure a culture of constructive inquiry, open discussion and academic excellence."

Evidence of the Board's actions to preserve and enhance UT are:

- Meeting minutes demonstrating the Board's care and thoroughness in hiring Dr. Sharon Gaber as the 17th President;
- May 2015 special meeting minutes detailing discussions of the Promedica affiliation agreement with the College of Medicine and Life Sciences;
- November 2015 minutes detailing approval of UT's low enrollment report to the Ohio Chancellor's Office and Department of Higher Education and Board discussions of student retention issues;
- Presentations to the BOT on student retention and a new student retention taskforce display a commitment by the Board to discuss relevant issues and challenges.

The BOT Academic Affairs Committee is charged with oversight and ensuring continuous improvement of UT academic activities and student programs, emphasizing student centeredness. The Clinical Affairs Committee is charged with oversight and strategic direction of the clinical enterprise (UTMC). The Finance and Audit Committee is charged with oversight and continuous improvement of the financial soundness of the University.

Board resolution 09-08-18 recognizes faculty as a key stakeholder and states explicitly that the Board will consider its input on University matters. A Faculty Senate representative serves on the Academic and Student Affairs Committee of the Board.

Board bylaw 3364-1-01 outlines the authority of the Board to approve or initiate the administrative structure of UT, its educational program and requirements, appointment, compensation and removal of all UT personnel, fiscal policies; and University policies.

Board bylaw 3364-1-06 sets the expectation that the Board will abide by the strictest ethical guidelines (statements of the code of ethics are signed by each member at the first meeting of the fiscal year).

Board bylaw 3364-1-07 delegates authority to the President as executive head of the University; it also designates the provost and vice-president level positions that report to the President.

2D. The institution is committed to freedom of expression and the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning.

Embedded in the UT Mission statement: core value 2 states UT will vigorously pursue and widely share new knowledge; expand the understanding of existing knowledge; develop the knowledge, skills and competencies of students, faculty, staff and the community while promoting a culture of lifelong learning."

UT is committed to freedom of expression through the following:

- It is embodied directly in UT policy on "Expression on Campus"
- Article 5.0 of the Collective Bargaining Agreement articulates faculty rights and defines academic freedom
- College mission statements support the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning
- Commitments to the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning are also found in:
 - Faculty Senate constitution, Article II: primary responsibility of the Senate is "to protect faculty equal opportunity, due process and academic freedom..."
 - Graduate Council constitution supports graduate faculty's advancement of knowledge...foster in students a spirit of inquiry...and an understanding of the integrity required for the pursuit of scholarship."
 - CBA Article 9 and the Rules and Regulations (non-AAUP faculty) each speak to this commitment.

2E. The institution's policies and procedures call for responsible acquisition, discovery and application of knowledge by its faculty, students and staff.

The Department for Human Subjects in Research oversees responsibility to assure protection of human subjects (University Policy no. 3364-70-05).

UT has two institutional review boards (IRBs):

1. Biomedical IRB – review/approval of research to evaluate safety, effectiveness and/or usefulness of therapies, diagnostic procedures and preventative measures.
2. Social, Behavioral and Educational IRB – review/approve research protocols involving human subject data generated by questionnaires, observation, studies of existing records and non-biomedical stimulus/interventions.

Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC) oversees laboratory animal research under the Department of Laboratory Animal Resources. DLAR maintains an animal quality care program accredited by the Association for Assessment and Accreditation of Laboratory Animal Care International.

The Institutional Biosafety Committee (IBC) is responsible for reviewing research protocols utilizing recombinant DNA, human and animal cell lines, biological/infectious agents and certain select agents/toxins.

University Research Council reviews and formulates general research policies, input on policies and practices affecting research and scholarship. It also awards URAF funding for faculty research/scholarly projects.

Ethical use of information:

- Student research handbook has information on ethical conduct of research and scholarship.
- Graduate student orientation modules on academic integrity and plagiarism are required. The graduate policy on academic dishonesty has an appeal process at the level of the dean/Graduate Council after college-level processes have been exhausted.
- The undergraduate policy on academic dishonesty informs students of ethical use of information and provides a process for handing charges of academic dishonesty. The undergraduate Student Grievance Council adjudicates grievances or challenges to accusations of academic dishonesty not resolved at the faculty or college level.

Criterion Two Summary

UT is a mission driven institution of higher education. It is a University that faces challenges in a forthright and ethical manner. It is an educational institution and a learning organization. The evidence provided above supports that fact that UT uses its financial and personnel resources to continually transform itself into a vital metropolitan research university. Ten years ago, the vision of the UT BOT was responsible for the creation of the third largest university in the State of Ohio. The record of the merger of the Medical University of Toledo and the University of Toledo is replete with examples of ethical and responsible actions of trustees, institutional administrators, faculty and staff in collectively sharing in that merger and its subsequent success. The documentation provided by trustee records and Faculty Senate minutes verifies the integral interaction of the entire university community in this historical institutional action. The subsequent transformation of the merged University into a vibrant student centered institution is the result of two very diverse academic communities joining together and learning from each other to create a set of administrative academic policies and procedures that have enhanced the opportunity for student learning and development and community engagement.

The University has recreated its administrative structure to ensure on-going academic freedom and administrative responsibility are collaborative. The financial challenges of maintaining mission critical programs and services are being met by the academic and administrative leadership of the institution. The financial and budgetary evidence provided combined with the strategic leadership of the BOT and administration clearly demonstrates that UT has created a pathway that provides continuation of a resource base that ensures future mission accomplishment.

CRITERION THREE. TEACHING AND LEARNING: QUALITY, RESOURCES AND SUPPORT

The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

3A. The institution's degree programs are appropriate to higher education.

The rigor and content of degree programs are ensured by the engagement of faculty and curriculum committees in developing program content and requirements. Credit hour assignments follow State of Ohio guidelines (Directive 2010-016). The Faculty Senate Curriculum Committee (undergraduate) and the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (graduate) review and approve all new/modified course and program proposals in a rigorous, peer-review process.

Submission requirements include articulation and differentiation of student learning goals that are measurable. Peer-review processes ensure such learning goals are appropriate for the level of each program and associated degree.

All programs participate in an institutional process of program review that occurs once every 7 years. The review process includes a self-study completed by program faculty and an on-site review by a team of external reviewers. The program completes an action plan in response to the external review. These action plans are discussed with the provost and can be factors in the next budget planning cycle.

Over 40 UT programs are offered 100% online, and 10 of these are also available as face-to-face programs. For program offered in more than one mode of delivery, there is consistency in student learning outcomes and feedback on teaching and student performance and these are noted in the internal program review process. Quality Matters (QM) training of online program faculty supports enhanced quality for these programs. The Pathway to Master Online Instructor Program addresses four quality-based perspectives in online education. As of December 2015, 19 faculty are certified as QM peer reviewers and 2 UT Online Office staff earned QM Master Reviewer certification.

UT's dual credit program, College Credit Plus (CC+), was developed in response to Ohio Revised Code Chapter 3365. There are currently 13 Toledo high school teachers certified and approved by UT to teach college level courses to high school students, who receive credit at both the high school and college level for this work.

The Division of Off-Campus and Extended Programs provides a link with the campus for students at off-campus sites. There are 10 additional locations where UT programs are offered and these are undergoing HLC Panel review in May 2016. One additional location at Schoolcraft College in Livonia, MI, was approved by HLC in spring 2015 (the PhD in Higher Education program is currently offered there).

3B. The institution demonstrates that the exercise of intellectual inquiry and the acquisition, application and integration of broad learning and skills are integral to its educational programs.

The general education program is appropriate. The UT core curriculum consists of two components:

1. General education courses of broad interest and distributed across categories including composition, fine arts, humanities, mathematics, natural sciences and social sciences, and
2. Diversity courses fostering understanding of and respect for different cultures and peoples, both within and without the United States.

The Faculty Senate Committee on the Core Curriculum reviews and recommends guidelines for implementation of the core curriculum. It also approves Transfer Module courses and implementation of the University's transfer module.

The core curriculum enables students to demonstrate an ability to communicate, understand personal, social and global responsibility, integrate and apply thinking and scientific and quantitative reasoning and use information literacy in their field of study.

The education's recognition of diversity is evidenced by the fact that the core/general educational program for all students, regardless of college or focus of study, requires completion of course work aimed at fostering understanding and respect for different cultures and peoples, through study of their beliefs, customs, histories, values and interrelationships. Students select one course from Diversity of US Culture and one from Diversity of non-US Culture for a total of 6 hours.

All undergraduate students have an opportunity to take part in research sponsored by various departments at UT. The Office of Undergraduate Research (OUR-UT) is a central resource for undergraduate research and it sponsors a Summer Research Symposium. All graduate students must show evidence of contributions to scholarship either through their thesis, dissertation or some form of culminating project.

3C. The institution has the faculty and staff needed for effective, high-quality programs and student services.

UT faculty are instructors, lecturers, associate and senior lecturers, as well as assistant, associate and full professors (the latter three groups are in tenure eligible tracks or tenured).

The student-faculty ratio is 14:1. About 75% of faculty holds full time appointments, and about 25% have been at UT for 20 or more years, providing an experienced population of instructors. Department chairs confirmed that faculty plays an active oversight role of their curriculum development.

There are sufficient numbers of faculty in most departments, as shown by a survey of chairs in spring 2015. The Faculty Hiring Plan developed in 2014-2015 led to 118 positions being reviewed as part of the FY15 hiring process, and 75 positions were approved to search.

Faculty possess the credentials required by the Ohio Board of Regents Guidelines and Procedures (note that the Ohio Board of Regents is now called Ohio Department of Higher Education) and the HLC. It is expected that UT faculty hold at least a master's degree in the area taught or a master's degree and at least 18 credit hours of training in the current area of teaching. Faculty holding baccalaureate degrees can be instructors in associate degree programs or career technical areas. UT has established a threshold of experience for other instructors who hold less than a master's degree but have extensive experience outside of the classroom. The department chair

and college dean would provide this information to the Office of the Provost and, after review by the provost, the appointment may be approved based on “equivalent experience”.

High school instructors in College Credit Plus courses are certified by the University and must hold at least a master’s degree; they are primary instructors on the high school campus and are assigned a UT faculty mentor. High school students attending classes at UT have UT faculty as primary instructors.

There are four consortia programs at UT: The BSN consortium with BGSU; the RN to BSN consortium with BGSU; the Northwest Ohio Consortium of Public Health with BGSU; and the DNP consortium with Wright State University.

Instructors are annually evaluated, including through the use of the Annual Report of Professional Activity (ARPA). Tenured faculty is evaluated every five years to further their professional growth; tenure-track faculty is evaluated annually.

Faculty professional development is supported by the provision of up to 8 credit hours per semester to allow faculty to take University courses to further their education and by new faculty orientation, sabbatical leaves, funds provided to assist with professional development, workshops and internal research funds and mentoring programs (on the Health Science Campus for junior investigators.) UT Online provides online course development training to faculty. The University Teaching Center offers training in syllabi development and teaching skills, as well as mentoring for faculty and chairs.

Faculty is required to hold office hours and be available to students. The UT Student Centeredness Survey found ~75% of students are satisfied or very satisfied with faculty willingness to discuss ideas and concepts outside of classes.

Staff are qualified for their positions. Search and hiring processes overseen by Human Resources and Talent Development Office ensures only candidates having these qualifications are interviewed and hired. Staff are also allowed up to 8 credit hours/semester of free courses as part of their professional development.

3D. The institution provides support for student learning and effective teaching.

New student orientation programs are customized based on the category of student, new student, transfer student or re-admitted student. Support services include academic advising, career and experiential learning opportunities, disability services, tutoring and co-curricular engagement.

Students are admitted to academic colleges or to YouCollege; the latter guides undecided students in exploring majors and directs major-ineligible students into appropriate preparation for reaching their goals. As of July 2016, YouCollege will become part of the new University College.

The Multicultural Emerging Scholars Program has a residential summer bridge program and a continuing living-learning community for participant’s first year at UT. The 25 students enrolled summer 2015 in 8 credit hours earned an average GPA of 3.15, 24 student returned in fall (the 25th returned spring semester) and there was a 90% retention of the fall students for spring 2016. The program is clearly successful!

Starfish Early Alert™ was purchased to assist success coaches to keep track of student performance and to alert them when students were in academic difficulty. The results led to a 2 percentage point decrease in D and F grades and withdrawals (DFW rates) in 1000-level math and composition courses.

Each student is assigned an academic advisor to help the student stay on track to complete requirements for graduation.

College of Adult and Lifelong Learning (CALL) served over 750 students in spring 2015. CALL helps students transition to college life and its Military Service Center served over 500 students in 2014. CALL will become part of the new University College.

TRIO support services provide support for special populations of students. Student-Athlete Academic Services are available to all student athletes; over 300 used its services in 2014-2015.

Information Technology (IT) supports many administrative applications and oversees software and hardware for students and faculty. Banner is a common database shared by all faculty, students, advisors and others, and provides information on financial aid, faculty qualifications, courses and registration. UT increased capacity of student email to 50GB and maintains wireless coverage on its campuses to nearly 100 percent. The UT Virtual Lab environment can be assessed anywhere.

The University's libraries are: William S. Carlson (the Canaday Center for Special Collections is housed within this), Mulford on the Health Science Campus, McMaster Engineering, and the LaValley Law Library.

Innovative learning environments on/off campus include the Lake Erie Center, Stranahan Arboretum, Plant Science Research Center, the Plastination Laboratory, Ruth M. Hillebrand Clinical Skills Center, Center for Performing Arts, Center for Visual Arts, Toledo Museum of Art's Reference Library and the Interprofessional Immersive Simulation Center on Health Science Campus.

3E. The institution fulfills the claims it makes for an enriched educational environment.

Co-curricular programs are supported by:

- Office of Student Involvement
- University Recreation Center
- Center for International Studies and Programs
- Office of International Student and Scholar Services
- Center for Experiential Learning and Career Services
- Technology Transfer Office

UT received the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching's 2015 Community Engagement Classification. The award recognizes "excellent alignment among campus mission, culture, leadership, resources and practices that support dynamic and noteworthy community engagement".

Criterion Three Summary

Because it is committed to improve the human condition; to advance knowledge through excellence in learning, discovery and engagement; and to serve as a diverse, student-centered public metropolitan research university, UT provides high quality education wherever and however its offerings are presented. Its faculty have received commendations, both on and off the campus, for their outstanding research, teaching and service. UT expanded its ability to provide a quality education to a larger student body with its recent merger. The University's degree programs are appropriate for the comprehensive research institution that it has become. The cross-fertilization of academic disciplines created by the merger bring a rich diversity of instructional modalities together. The appropriateness of all degree programs, including general education, is supported by the broad engagement of qualified faculty in the development, review, and approval process for programs and courses as well as the teaching and assessment of students' learning. Student learning outcomes are articulated for all programs and address a range of skills appropriate for higher education across the institution. Processes exist to ensure program quality across instructional methods and locations. In the face of challenging financial circumstances, the BOT and the University administration continue to be committed to quality education by providing suitable faculty

development opportunities, technology resources and physical space. The rich diversity of co-curricular opportunities and experiences are valuable resources for student growth and development

CRITERION FOUR. TEACHING AND LEARNING: EVALUATION AND IMPROVEMENT

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments, and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

4A. The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs.

UT maintains a practice of regular program review. In response to the 2012 HLC visit, UT established an Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review within the Office of the Provost. This office combines administrative efforts related to program review and assessment, improving internal communication and coordination. A vice-provost for accreditation and program review and a director for accreditation and program review were also created to provide additional oversight.

Academic programs undergo program review at least every 7 years; 44 programs were reviewed in 2013-14 and 15 in 2014-2015. A program review template and external review team guide the process; the external team's report is reviewed by the program, who submits an action plan to the Office of the Provost. The Graduate Council's Graduate Program Review Committee reviews the program self-study and external team report, providing an additional level of review for graduate programs.

UT evaluates all credit that it transcripts.

- UT awards credit in accordance with federal definitions of credit hour as adopted by the HLC and the Chancellor's Directive 2010-016. Ohio Department of Higher Education Guidelines and Procedures for Academic Program Review establishes minimum credit hours for each degree level (120-126 for baccalaureate; 30 for masters; 90 for doctoral degrees).
- Faculty Senate (undergraduate) and Graduate Council (graduate) curriculum committees monitor credit hour approval and provide transparency.
- UT evaluates and accepts credit hours from accredited postsecondary institutions: Ohio's transfer and articulation policy designates courses in the Ohio Transfer Module. Prior learning credit is initiated through the College of Adult and Lifelong Learning, governed by state mandates, UT policy and Faculty Senate oversight.

UT exercises authority over the prerequisites for courses, including dual credit courses. Faculty determine courses and prerequisites. Faculty Senate and Graduate Council have final approval of curriculum.

Dual credit course (College Credit Plus) quality is ensured by having equivalent syllabi and learning outcomes for each of the high school and UT courses and a similar level of achievement expectation. High school teachers in dual credit courses are certified by UT.

Toledo Early College is a program designed to accelerate students into UT courses beginning freshman year. Students can take up to 2 years of English, 4 years of math and science, and 2 years of social studies in high school (earning up to 60 hours of college credit and saving time/money for a college degree).

4B. The institution demonstrates a commitment to educational achievement and improvement through ongoing assessment of student learning.

UT has clearly stated goals for student learning and effective processes for assessment of student learning.

- The University Assessment Committee (UAC) is composed of college and service unit liaisons who meet monthly and who create an assessment plan and annual assessment reports on how well students are meeting learning goals/outcomes.

- A new faculty assessment representative (FAR) was created in 2014 to assist programs and colleges with assessment of student learning, professional development and consultation.
- An online database was developed to improve efficiency of annual assessment reporting.
- In 2013, a General Education Assessment Planning Committee was formed with Faculty Senate and UAC members. The UAC conducted a review of the general education curriculum in 2015 and results were shared with Faculty Senate.
- The UAC provides recommendations to the Provost regarding institutional decisions related to budget and resource allocation. Data is from annual assessment reports, institutional surveys and other sources.

4C. The institution demonstrates a commitment to educational improvement through ongoing attention to retention, persistence and completion rates in its degree and certificate programs.

UT has increased its focus on student retention, persistence and completion since 2012. Two new positions were created to oversee student success: a vice-provost for retention and undergraduate studies and an assistant provost for student success and retention.

UT collects and analyzes information on student retention, persistence and completion: Fall to fall and spring to spring returning students measure retention; persistence is measured as the percent of students returning semester to semester and after completing years 2 and 3 of studies; completion rates are monitored as 4-, 5-, and 6-year graduation rates of degree seeking, full time, first time students.

The Success Coach program, implemented in 2013, resulted in a 3 percentage point increase in retention in 2014 (to 70%) and another 2 percentage point increase in 2015 (71.9%)-the highest retention rate in over a decade. Use of Starfish Early Alert™, an early warning and student tracking system, helped raise retention rates by early intervention in student academic issues (15 percentage point decrease in DFW rates for Math 1200 and 7 percentage point decrease for Math 1320).

A retention fund was created: 1,353 students were assisted with over \$1.2M in Tillotson and Tuition Assistance Grants.

Criterion Four Summary

The evidence provided demonstrates that UT takes pride in ensuring that continuous improvement is the cornerstone of its educational programs, learning environments, and support services. The ongoing assessment of student learning harnesses data to incrementally improve its academic community's ability to advance learning, research, and service.

A partnership has been created between academic affairs and student services that intentionally accesses curricular and co-curricular programs. The process of regular program review, including internal and external review and the annual process of assessment reporting, ensures that program quality and effectiveness of student learning are monitored. UT's commitment to quality improvement is shared by its academic administrators, faculty, and staff. Annually members of the academy are recognized for their contributions to enhancing student learning on campus.

UT understands that incremental and breakthrough improvements in student learning can only occur through ongoing evaluation, measurement, and data driven judgments to improve learning. It is clear from the evidence presented that although progress is being made in many areas, institutional methodologies and processes themselves are under constant examination to determine best practices that will enhance student learning, retention and graduation. UT is fortunate to have the faculty and staff devoted to the implementation of those best practices to serve its students.

CRITERION FIVE. RESOURCES, PLANNING, AND INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

The institution's resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities. The institution plans for the future.

5A. The institution's resource base supports its current educational programs and its plans for maintaining and strengthening their quality in the future.

UT has the fiscal and human resources and physical and technological infrastructure sufficient to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered.

- The 2015 annual financial report indicates UT has a sound financial base. Three main sources of revenue are state aid, federal grants and tuition. From FY12-FY15 tuition revenues remained constant, with students funding a greater percentage of total operating budget (from 31.5% to 40.5%) while state aid declined.
- The UT Foundation, a legally separate, tax-exempt entity acting primarily as a fundraising organization for the University, provided \$52M in support since 2012.
- The planned 2% increase in enrollment for AY2015-2016 did not materialize, leading the University to implement 1.5% of operating budget reductions in spring 2016 and for AY 2016-2017 (3% of total budget). The University has engaged Ruffalo Noel Levitz to assist in developing and implementing a strategic enrollment plan to cure declining enrollments.
- UT has 1,487 instructional faculty members, 3,115 staff and 999 research/graduate assistants. UT is well positioned with appropriate faculty and staff to carry out its mission and vision.
- UT is located on ~900 acres, including a main campus and a health science campus where its academic colleges are located. It also provides educational facilities at Scott Park campus, the Lake Erie Center, the Stranahan Arboretum and the Toledo Museum of Art.
- Commitments to continuous improvement include the \$32M Lloyd Jacobs Interprofessional Immersive Simulation Center, and the Maker Society, a student run organization with 3D printers where students create their own projects and build a community of diversely skilled, creative individuals. NSF awarded UT one of its 50 "iCorps" sites, enabling students to create prototypes for their classroom experience.

UT's BOT is responsible for oversight of academic programs, budgets, general administration and employment of faculty and staff. The BOT ensures educational programs are not adversely affected by elective resource allocations to other areas or superordinate entities.

UT assures resources are allocated true to its core mission. Decisions follow two key criteria:

1. Centrality to core activities of research, instruction and patient care while adhering to UT's mission.
2. Excellence: each division's plan is reviewed and an allocation of resources is determined with an understanding of key assumptions used to develop the overall budget (enrollment, retention, state-imposed tuition caps, fee revenue, state subsidy, discount rate, faculty workload).

UT's annual independent audit in 2015 found no discrepancies. The audit report is presented at a public BOT meeting and maintained on the Office of Finance website.

UT has a well-developed process in place for budgeting and for monitoring expense:

- The recommended annual budget is presented to senior leadership and the Finance and Strategy Committee of the Office of Finance for review, mailed to BOT members and considered for approval at the June Board meeting.
- UT has a budget control procedure that addresses management of budget authority for departments: all expenditures shall be expended in accordance with applicable state and federal statutes, regulations, policy and specific directives of the Board. Changes in budget allocation are sent to the Office of Financial

Planning, Analysis and Budget for review and implementation. Budget transfers do not change the Board approved total net income; they are transfers within operating expenditures or revenues.

5B. The institution's governance and administrative structures promote effective leadership and support collaborative processes that enable the institution to fulfill its mission.

The BOT is knowledgeable about UT and provides oversight for its financial and academic policies and practices and meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities.

Chapter 3364 of Ohio Revised Code established the BOT as governing authority over the University. All Board meetings are public. The President is required at the beginning of each academic year to make a report to the Board reviewing the administration's prior year goals and objectives for the new year.

The Board has the authority to hire the President, as it did with Dr. Sharon Gaber in spring 2015.

UT engages its internal and external constituencies: UT public records policy 3364-10-02 ensures access to public records requests. Other examples of including internal and external constituencies are:

- The Governor appoints non-voting student members to the Board; faculty members serve on some Board committees.
- The Faculty Senate and Graduate Council constitution/bylaws ensure roles for faculty in making recommendations to the administration and exercising responsibility for academic matters.
- The Collective Bargaining Agreement (AAUP faculty) and the Rules and Regulations (non-union faculty) provide for faculty roles in decision making and governance of academic affairs.
- Faculty and administrators share leadership on University-wide governance bodies such as Research Council, institutional review boards and institutional animal care and use committee.
- Student Government (undergraduates) and the Graduate Student Association represent the needs and concerns of students and work with administrators to address issues.

5C. The institution engages in systematic and integrated planning.

UT employs an integrated planning and resource allocation model as the basis for long-range strategic planning and continuous improvement. This model allows UT to enact its mission, vision and core values and achieve the intended outcomes of its processes and improvement goals in an intentional and sustained way.

The Financial Planning Group implemented in January 2016 a long-range Axiom tool, allowing all forecasting to be done on one platform, to help inform decisions on budget planning, cash flow planning and capital planning.

Changes since the HLC 2012 visit include:

- Additional investments in Human Resources and Talent Development to manage employee benefits and a more robust training and development program, increased staff and operating budgets.
- Additional funding for compliance resources: a new Clery Act compliance officer and athletics compliance officer were hired; a Title IX coordinator was hired and three deputies appointed.
- Decreasing disparity between depreciation and capital budgeting.

UT planning anticipates the possible impact of fluctuations in sources of revenue such as enrollment, the economy and state support.

A multiple campus master plan is being developed with SmithGroupJJR – the first master plan since the 2006 merger.

The Informational technology department strategically plans for instructional, research and administrative technology needs. Over \$11M in funding has been provided to support this planning in the last two years.

Ruffalo Noel Levitz and consultant Dr. James Mager are working with the President and the University to create and implement a strategic enrollment plan.

Globalization initiatives have seen increased international students at UT from 2011 to 2015, with a slight decrease last year.

- The UT-Community College Internationalization Consortium is a bridge program allowing students to start their education at home and finish it at UT
- Competitive awards initiative will increase the prestige of UT programs, assisting globalization efforts.
- The UT American Language Institute assists international students with English language skill development. The Institute is seeking accreditation with the Commission on English Language Program Accreditation (CEA) and the University and College Intensive English Programs (UCIEP) to enhance full time matriculation of international students at UT.

5D. The institution works systematically to improve its performance.

UT measures its performance through feedback from various surveys:

1. The Student Centeredness Survey provides feedback on services in three main areas: academics, support services and learning environment/facilities. The advising coach retention project was developed in response to survey results.
2. The National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE) assesses the extent to which students engage in academic activities and campus life. The “You spoke, we listened” initiative resulted from NSSE surveys.
3. The Campus Climate Survey for students, staff and faculty provides an overall sense of the UT climate with the goal of improving the culture of the UT community (perception of acceptance, diversity related services, courses and programs; attitudes and feelings toward others, discrimination and harassment, and awareness).
4. Employee satisfaction is measured through a Professional Staff Association survey. In FY2015, and in response to staff surveys, all eligible employees were provided a 2% increase in salary/wages and a lump sum payment.
5. The University Completion Plan outlines goals to improve performance.
6. UT developed key performance indicators in 2015 for academic and clinical enterprises. For example, a new free speech policy was implemented in 2015 to address appropriate conduct.
7. Changes to Rocket Solution Central were implemented to enhance customer service, the Staff Ambassador program and improved orientation programs were also in response to student survey requests.

Criterion Five Summary

UT is a mission-driven research university that strategically utilizes its resources in maximizing its ability to improve its academic environment for student learning. As demonstrated by the decisions by the faculty, UT administrative leadership and BOT, a culture of continuous improvement has been evolving. Evidence provided demonstrates UT is intentional in its planning to meet current fiscal challenges while positioning itself to respond to anticipated future requirements of technology and the physical campus. The merger of the Medical University of Ohio with The University of Toledo was a calculated decision to create a stronger postsecondary institution of higher education committed to excellence. UT emerged from this merger as a strong institution with the resources, structures and processes that enables it “... to improve the human condition; to advance knowledge through excellence in learning, discovery and engagement; and to serve as a diverse, student-centered public metropolitan research university.”