COPY MARKED TO SHOW CHANGES

Please note: New wording is in BLUE. Wording that was retained and part of the 2006 criteria is in BLACK. Older wording that was removed or replaced is in RED with cross out.

APT Presentation January 30, 2013; follow up to feedback March 7, 2013 Dorothea Sawicki, chair, APT Committee

A. Revisions to the basic science educator and clinical educator tracks to align the education criteria to the 5 AAMC categories for education excellence.

II. Basic Science Educator (Tenure Track)

A. Introduction

This track is meant for faculty members whose contributions entail variable combinations of education, research, scholarship, service, and administration, but whose primary contribution is in teaching and administration in the Basic Science Department and the University of Toledo's system. Faculty members on this track may include basic scientists, physicians, statisticians, and others in health care and related professions. While the Educator role is the primary criterion, scholarship and service are also expected of all faculty members in the Basic Science Educator Track.

Usually a candidate may be considered for promotion in this track after five (5) years of service at the University of Toledo. An earlier promotion may be granted for those exceptional candidates who have exceeded the criteria set forth in the criteria document for this track, as determined by the candidate's Department Chair and Dean.

Owing to the importance of commitment and accomplishment in the education arena for this track, it is expected that faculty in this track will place greater emphasis on this component of their responsibilities than on service or scholarship. The degree of their dedication and accomplishment in meeting the education needs of the Department and the College will be used in determining their readiness for promotion.

Tenure may be awarded with promotion to Associate Professor at the request of the Department Chair and the Dean. When requested together, the APT committee usually reviews promotion first and the tenure is reviewed independently and subsequently. Alternatively, a request for tenure can be considered separately and after promotion to Associate Professor. Usually a tenure decision is postponed in the setting of a new faculty appointment, where some University of Toledo experience is advisable prior to awarding tenure.

Promotion of a faculty member from other tracks to the Basic Science Educator Track (i.e., changing tracks at the time of promotion) is permitted, but would require the faculty member to meet all of the criteria for promotion in the Basic Science Educator Track.

Criteria for promotion are listed below.

- 1. Education this is the most important criterion for this track.
 - a. Effective teaching and mentoring in classrooms and other settings where effective teaching takes place.
 - b. Development or evaluation of innovative educational programs.
 - c. Supervision and management of continuing education programs.
 - d. Creating education tools such as web based modules and DVDs.

2. Scholarship

Scholarship is defined broadly for this track. It includes methods of generating or synthesizing of knowledge, such as reviews, or dissemination of new knowledge.

3. Service

- a. Effectiveness of committee membership, leadership and administrative services.
- b. Service contributions to the University of Toledo academic community and the community at large.

B. Assistant Professor

An Assistant Professor in the Basic Science Educator Track will have completed training in an appropriate discipline and possess an appropriate professional degree. Faculty who hold a Ph.D. or other academic degree will not usually be required to have a license, depending on the nature of their service. In addition, an Assistant Professor in this track should show strengths among the following categories.

- 1. Education Evidence of teaching ability and commitment.
- 2. Scholarship Evidence of an interest in and commitment to scholarship.
- 3. Service A commitment to active committee participation and administrative service in fulfilling the mission of the Basic Science Department and the University of Toledo

C. Associate Professor

Promotion to Associate Professor in the Basic Science Educator Track will be based on a combination of achievements in education, scholarship, and service. The candidate will meet threshold promotion criteria in all three categories of education, scholarship, and service, and will have attained excellence in education and one other category.

1. Education

Threshold criterion:

The candidate must provide evidence of having contributed substantially to education in the health research fields. These contributions should be apparent from past and present quality of teaching, time commitment to teaching, and number of courses and programs to which the candidate has contributed.

Criteria for documenting educational excellence:

Continued educational contributions to COMLS graduate (MSBS, MS or PhD) students, medical students (sometimes referred to as undergraduates), nursing students, physician assistant students and/or COMLS postdoctoral fellows or residents and their programs are required for educational excellence. These are outlined within five categories of educational activity highlighted by the AAMC. Education excellence requires evidence showing significant accomplishment in the first two categories (teaching and curriculum) and in at least one of the other three categories

Categories:

- a. Teaching
 - (1) Active and sustained participation in teaching students in classroom, small groups and/or in other settings with qualitative assessments at a regular interval. Evidence of high quality teaching will be based on student evaluations, peer evaluations, improvement in learn outcomes, and also by recognition by receipt of Teaching Award(s). There is an expectation that the individual completes all student evaluations on a timely basis.
 - (2) If appropriate, active and sustained participation in postdoctoral fellow or residency program teaching with evidence of sustained teaching of high quality based on evaluations, teaching awards, outcomes and/or peer evaluations.
- b. Curriculum: Evidence of educational excellence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Development of specific curriculum related to medical or graduate student (or postdoctoral fellow/resident) education (such as development of elective courses, specific classroom based lectures, additional online or other modules, new programs and if appropriate new patient education

- programs. There is an expectation for innovative student education such as new pedagogy or assessment tools.
- (2) Scholarship on innovation in student and/or postdoctoral fellow (or resident if appropriate) education and its presentation at the regional or national level. Evidence of scholarship will be seen in the number of presentations, articles or research projects related to student education activities.
- c. Learner Assessment: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Participation in development, implementation, analysis or reporting learners' knowledge, skills, and attitudes data and/or involvement in assessment of student educational outcomes and development of remediation methodology.
 - (2) Service on student or resident curriculum evaluation committees at departmental or college level.
- d. Advising/Mentoring: Documentation of the candidate's level of involvement and quality of advising and mentorship activities for students and/or residents.
- e. Educational leadership/Administration: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Administrative responsibilities in student educational programs with evidence to support maintaining or exceeding benchmarks for quality.
 - (2) Service regional and/or national student education committee(s).

Criteria for excellence in education:

Excellence in education requires significant achievements from among the following criteria:

- (a) Long-standing, exemplary teaching and mentoring of health care, medical and graduate students, residents or fellows.
- (b) Development of educational programs for schools kindergarten through grade 12 (K-12), undergraduate, graduate or others programs made for public awareness.
- (c) Organization or presentation of workshops on education at regional or national meetings.
- (d) Establishment of new methods to promote and assess learning, including contributions to curriculum reform/innovation, and development and publication of new curricula and programs.
- (e) Effectiveness in administration and organization of education programs.
- (f) Interaction with students outside the classroom as a counselor or group participant.

2. Scholarship

Threshold criterion:

Publication of a minimum of five (5) educational or scientific reports,

program descriptions or evaluations, book chapters, monographs, or other educationally relevant materials (not including abstracts) is expected. The candidate must be primary or senior author on at least two (2) publications. It is expected that the majority of the publications will have occurred after appointment to the Assistant Professor level.

Criteria for excellence in scholarship:

Excellence criteria: (significant achievements from among the following)

 PI on educational, research or other trials or on extramural educational or research grants.

Publication of five (5) peer-reviewed papers or educational material in high-quality national or international journals, of which the candidate is primary/senior author on a substantial portion. It is expected that the majority of the publications will have occurred after appointment to the Assistant Professor level.

- Reviewer for a refereed journal, editorial board member, member of a study section for the peer review of grants.
- Participation in scientific, educational and/or research review processes at state or national levels
- Presentation of scientific, educational, abstracts, reviews, or analytic studies at national/international meetings
- Development and/or dissemination of intellectual properties
- Leadership in various educational programs at the University of Toledo
- Co-investigator on educational or research grants.

Additional activities that can demonstrate excellence

- Consultant to externally funded grant, medical or scientific organization
- Demonstrated ability to inspire students, colleagues, and others to become involved in educational and/or research activities
- Involvement in administrative aspects of education and/or research (e.g. organization and direction of education and/or research initiatives)
- Significant self-development activity to increase educational and/or research effectiveness (e.g. Faculty Development programs).

3. Service

Threshold criterion:

There must be evidence that the candidate has made quality educational and administrative contributions locally or regionally as indicated by internal letters of reference.

Criteria for excellence in service:

In addition to the above threshold criterion, excellence in service requires further significant achievements from among the following criteria since last promotion.

- (a) Leadership in defining and disseminating superior educational tools and concepts.
- (b) Established local or regional reputation in the area of teaching or through unique administrative skills.
- (c) Presentations of educational and administrative topics at local, regional or national meetings.
- (d) Administration or leadership in local, regional or national organizations.
- (e) Effectiveness in administrative skills including leadership on committees within the University of Toledo.
- (f) Developing/implementing new and innovative educational tools, programs and concepts at the University of Toledo, local, regional or national levels.

D. Professor

Promotion to Professor in the Basic Science Educator Track is based on achievements, which demonstrate continued professional growth and contributions to the University of Toledo since last promotion. Furthermore the candidate's achievements should be recognized to be comparable to accomplishments by faculty members at the same rank at other academic medical and biomedical institutions. The successful candidate will have sustained excellence in education. Additional contributions in the scholarship and service areas are supportive factors in consideration of promotion to this rank.

1. Education

Continued educational contributions to COMLS graduate (MSBS, MS or PhD) students, medical students (sometimes referred to as undergraduates), nursing students, physician assistant students and/or COMLS postdoctoral fellows or residents and their programs are required for educational excellence. These are outlined within five categories of educational activity highlighted by the AAMC. To establish excellence as an educator, the candidate should demonstrate a leadership role through accomplishments in teaching (a) and curriculum (b) and from at least one of the other three categories.

Categories:

a. Teaching

(1) Active and sustained participation in teaching students in classroom, small groups and/or in other settings with qualitative assessments at a regular interval. Evidence of high quality teaching will be based on

- student evaluations, peer evaluations, improvement in learn outcomes, and also by recognition by receipt of Teaching Award(s). There is an expectation that the individual completes all student evaluations on a timely basis.
- (2) If appropriate, active and sustained participation in residency program teaching with evidence of sustained teaching of high quality based on evaluations, teaching awards, outcomes and/or peer evaluations.
- b. Curriculum: Evidence of educational excellence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Development of specific curriculum related to medical or graduate student (or resident/fellow) education (such as development of elective courses, specific classroom based lectures, additional online or other modules, new programs and if appropriate new patient education programs. There is an expectation for innovative student education such as new pedagogy or assessment tools.
 - (2) Scholarship on innovation in student and/or fellow (or resident if appropriate) education and its presentation at the regional or national level. Evidence of scholarship will be seen in the number of presentations, articles or research projects related to student education activities.
- c. Learner Assessment: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Participation in development, implementation, analysis or reporting learners' knowledge, skills, and attitudes data and/or involvement in assessment of student educational outcomes and development of remediation methodology.
 - (2) Service on student or resident curriculum evaluation committees at departmental or college level.
- d. Advising/Mentoring: Documentation of the candidate's level of involvement and quality of advising and mentorship activities for students and/or residents.
- e. Educational leadership/Administration: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)
 - (1) Administrative responsibilities in student educational programs with evidence to support maintaining or exceeding benchmarks for quality.
 - (2) Service regional and/or national student education committee(s).

1. Education

To establish excellence as an educator, the candidate should demonstrate a leadership role through accomplishments from among the following education activities:

- (a) Long standing, exemplary teaching and mentoring of medical and/or graduate students, residents or fellows.
- (b) Presentations, workshops at regional and national meetings.
- (c) Development of methods to promote and assess learning, and innovative curricula.

- (d) Directorships and administration of educational programs and courses.
- (e) Facilitating student educational activities outside the classroom.

2. Scholarship

To establish excellence as a scholar, the candidate should demonstrate leadership role accomplishments from among the following scholarly activities:

- (a) Principal investigator role in research projects or healthcare trials. Investigator role in educational or scientific research projects.
- (b) Attracting extramural research support.

 Obtaining various extramural research support, especially in education
- (c) Peer-reviewed publications in which the candidate is primary/senior author. *Threshold criteria*: The candidate will have at least 10 publications, of which at least 5 are in peer-reviewed journals. Others may include educational_or scientific reports, program descriptions or evaluations, book chapters, monographs, or other relevant materials (not including abstracts). At least 5 publications should be since promotion to associate professor. The candidate should be primary or senior author on at least 4 of the publications [2 since promotion to associate professor] in peer-reviewed journals.
- (d) Participation in review of basic science research at state or national levels.
- (e) Presenting educational or scientific observations, abstracts, reviews, or other information at national and/or international meetings.
- (f) Development of intellectual properties or patents.
- (g) Reviewing or editing educational or scientific publications.

3. Service

To establish excellence, the candidate should demonstrate leadership role accomplishments from among the following service activities:

- (a) Continuous involvement or leadership in administrative programs.
- (b) Expertise in a specific educational field as evidenced by reputation and productivity at the regional and national level.
- (c) Chair or officer role on local, regional, and national organizations.
- (d) Committee chair responsibilities within the University of Toledo's system.
- (e) Developing, implementing or directing new educational programs and

V. Clinical Educator Track (Tenure Track)

A. Introduction

This track is meant for faculty members whose contributions entail variable combinations of education, scholarship, clinical service, and administration, but is intended for faculty members who are primarily involved in patient care, teaching, and administration. Faculty members on this track may include physicians, psychologists, social workers, ethicists, statisticians, and others in health care and health care related professions While educational contributions are the primary criteria, scholarship, as defined by the generation of new knowledge, synthesis of existing knowledge, or analytical observations is also expected of all faculty members in the Clinical Educator Track.

Usually a candidate may be considered for promotion at any track after five (5) years of service at the University of Toledo. An earlier promotion may be granted for those exceptional candidates who have exceeded the criteria set forth in the criteria document for each track, as determined by the candidate's Department Chair and Dean.

Owing to the importance of commitment and accomplishment in the education arena for this track, it is expected that faculty in this track will place greater emphasis on this component of their responsibilities than on service or scholarship. The degree of their dedication and accomplishment in meeting the education needs of the Department and the College will be used in determining their readiness for promotion.

Tenure may be awarded with promotion to Associate Professor however there may be circumstances where promotion to Associate Professor can occur but a tenure decision is postponed at the request of the Department Chair and the Dean; otherwise, a request for tenure will be considered separately and after promotion to Associate Professor. Usually a tenure decision is postponed in the setting of a new faculty recruit, where some local experience is advisable prior to awarding tenure.

In addition, tenure is not necessarily granted simultaneously with promotion on any track. APT Committee usually reviews the promotion first and tenure request independently and subsequently. In some exceptional circumstances, promotion and tenure may be deliberated on the same day. This would, however, be at the request of the Dean and Chair of the candidate's department.

Tenure will usually be awarded with promotion to Associate Professor; however, there may be circumstances where promotion to Associate Professor can occur, but a tenure decision is postponed (e.g., in the setting of a new faculty recruit where some local experience is advisable prior to the awarding of tenure.

Promotion of a faculty member from the Clinical Scholar Track or the Practitioner Track

to the Clinical Educator Track (i.e., changing tracks at the time of promotion) is permitted, but would require the faculty member to meet all of the criteria for promotion in the Clinical Educator Track.

Criteria for promotion are listed below.

- 1. Education this is the most important criterion for this track.
 - a. Effective teaching and mentoring in classrooms and clinical settings.
 - b. Development or evaluation of innovative educational programs.
 - c. Assessment of learners
 - d. Educational leadership and administrative activities
 - c, Conduct of continuing education programs.
 - d. Other forms of education such as production of intranet or internet programs or DVDs.

2. Scholarship:

Scholarship is defined broadly for this track. It includes clinical investigations as well as other methods of generating or synthesizing new knowledge, such as reviews, meta-analysis, or clinical treatment development and evaluation, and analytical observations (case reports). Scholarship related to medical education is encouraged.

3. Service

- a. Effectiveness of clinical and administrative service.
- b. Other contributions of service to the University of Toledo's academic community and the community at large.

B. Assistant Professor

An Assistant Professor in the Clinical Educator Track will have completed training in a clinical discipline, have certification (or will be making progress toward certification) by an American Board (physicians) or available equivalent for other disciplines, and have a license to practice in Ohio. Faculty who hold a Ph.D. or other academic degree may not necessarily be required to have a license, depending on the nature of their service. Each of these basic expectations will take into account relevant variations dependent upon the discipline. In addition, an Assistant Professor in this track should show strengths along the following categories.

- 1. Education Evidence of teaching ability and commitment to education excellence.
- 3. Scholarship Evidence of an interest in and commitment to scholarship.
- 2. Service A commitment to clinical and administrative service in fulfilling the mission of the clinical department and the University of Toledo's system.

C. Associate Professor

Promotion to Associate Professor in the Clinical Educator Track is based on achievements in education, scholarship, and service. The candidate will meet threshold criteria in all three categories of education, scholarship, and service, and will have attained excellence in education and one other category.

Education

Threshold criterion:

The candidate must provide evidence of substantial contributions to and innovation in education in the health fields. These contributions should be apparent from past and present quality of teaching, time commitment to teaching, and number of courses and programs to which the candidate has contributed.

Criteria for documenting educational excellence:

Continued educational contributions to COMLS medical students (sometimes referred to as undergraduates), physician assistant, nursing, graduate (MSBS, MS or PhD) students and/or COMLS residents and their programs are required for educational excellence. These are outlined within five categories of educational activity highlighted by the AAMC. Education excellence requires evidence showing significant accomplishment in the first two categories (teaching and curriculum) and in at least one of the other three categories.

Categories:

a. Teaching:

- (1) Active and sustained participation in teaching students in classroom, small groups, and/or in clinical settings with qualitative assessments at a regular interval. Didactic teaching (i.e. prepared presentations on key clinical topics) is encouraged. Evidence of high quality student teaching will be based on student evaluations, peer evaluations, improvement of learner outcomes, and also by recognition by receipt of teaching award(s). There is an expectation that the individual completes all student or resident evaluations on a timely basis.
- (2) If appropriate, active and sustained participation in residency program teaching with evidence of sustained teaching of high quality based on resident evaluations, teaching awards, residency outcomes, and/or peer evaluations. Didactic teaching (i.e. prepared presentations on key clinical topics) is encouraged There is an expectation that the individual completes all learner evaluations on a timely basis.
- **b. Curriculum:** Evidence of educational excellence is required in (1) or (2)
- (1) Development of specific curriculum related to student or resident education (such as development of electives, specific classroom based lectures, additional online or other modules; new CME programs, new COMLS patient education programs). There is an expectation for innovative student and/or resident education such as new pedagogy or assessment tools.
- (2) Scholarship on innovations in student and/or resident education and its presentation at the national level. Promotion to Professor rank requires national presentations. Evidence of scholarship will be seen in the number of presentations, articles or research projects related to student or resident education activities.
- **3. Learner Assessment:** Evidence is required in (a) or (b)

- (a) Participation in development, implementation, analysis or reporting learners' knowledge, skills, and attitudes data and/or involvement in assessment of student educational outcomes and development of remediation methodology.
- (b) Service on student or resident curriculum evaluation committees at departmental or college level.

4. Advising/Mentoring:

Documentation of the candidate's level of involvement and quality of advising and mentorship activities for students and/or residents.

5. Educational leadership/administration: Evidence is required in (a) or (b)

- (a) Administrative responsibilities in student or resident educational programs with evidence to support maintaining or exceeding benchmarks for quality.
- (b) Service on regional and/or national student and/or resident education committee(s).

Criteria for education excellence:

Excellence in education requires significant achievements from among the following criteria:

- (a) Recognition as an excellent teacher or mentor to medical students and/or graduate students, residents, and fellows as documented by student and faculty evaluations, letters of reference or teaching awards.
- (b) Development of patient education and public health education programs.
- (c) Development of continuing medical education (CME) programs.
- (d) Organization or presentation of workshops on education at regional and national meetings.
- (e) Establishment of new methods to promote and assess learning, including contributions to curriculum reform/innovations, and development and publication of new curricula and programs.
- (f) Effectiveness in administration and organization of education programs.
- (g) Interaction with students outside of the classroom as a counselor or group participant.

Service

Threshold criterion:

The candidate holds certification by an American Board (physicians), or available equivalent certification for other disciplines. If a physician, there must be evidence that the candidate has contributed to quality medical care locally or regionally as indicated by internal and external (if appropriate) letters of reference.

Criteria for documenting service excellence:

In addition to the above threshold criteria, excellence in service requires further

significant achievements from among the following since last promotion.

- a) Leadership position in defining and disseminating superior quality care in a specific area of expertise. Development of new clinical treatments, devices, or concepts.
- b) Established local or regional reputation for expertise in a field as evidenced by productivity and clinical competence. This reputation also enhances that of the University of Toledo and/or UTMC.
- c) Chair of major UTCOM or UTMC committees (e.g., Admissions committee, Curriculum committee, APT Committee, IRB committee, Medical Executive Committee).
- d) Officer of a National or State-wide organization, or Chair of a committee of a national or international organization
- e) Active service on major UTCOM or UTMC task forces.

Other activities to note:

- a) Active participation in UTCOM, UTMC, or UTP committees
- b) Participation in local, regional, state, or national medical organizations.
- c) Participation in non-medical organizations at the local, state, or national level.
- d) Presentation of clinical topics at local, regional, or national organizations.
- (a) Leadership in defining and disseminating superior quality care in a particular specialty area.
- (b) Established local or regional reputation for expertise in a field or evidence by productivity and clinical competence.
- (c) Evidence of professional skill, medical knowledge, humanistic concern for the patient, and the innovative application of techniques and knowledge.
- (d) Presentation of clinical topics at local, regional or national meetings.
- (e) Administration or leadership in local, regional or national organizations.
- (f) Effectiveness in administrative skills including leadership on committees within the University of Toledo.
- (g) Development of new clinical treatments, devices or concepts.

Scholarship

Threshold criteria: (same items but in paragraph form).

- The candidate has at least 5 clinical or scientific reports, program descriptions or evaluations, book chapters, monographs, or other clinically relevant materials (not including abstracts)
- The candidate is primary author on 2 or more publications
- The majority of publications have been since appointment to Assistant Professor at UT COM.

Excellence criteria: (significant achievements from among the following) In addition to

the above threshold criteria, excellence in scholarship requires further significant achievements from among the following criteria.

- PI on educational, research or clinical trials (includes site PI on multicenter trials) or on extramural educational or research grants.

 Extramural research support.
- Publication of peer-reviewed papers in high quality national/international journals of which the candidate is primary or senior author on a substantial portion.
- Reviewer for a refereed journal, editorial board member, member of a study section for the peer review of grants.
- Participation in clinical/scientific, educational and/or research review processes at state or national levels
- Presentation of clinical/scientific, educational, abstracts, reviews, or analytic studies at national/international meetings
- Development and/or dissemination of intellectual properties
- Co-investigator on educational, research or clinical (trial) grants.

Additional activities that can demonstrate excellence

- Consultant to externally funded grant, medical or scientific organization
- Demonstrated ability to inspire residents, students, colleagues, and others to become involved in educational and/or research activities
- Involvement in administrative aspects of education and/or research (e.g. organization and direction of education and/or research initiatives)
- Scholarship of "practice" or "application" reflected by clinical practice activities that enhance recognition of medical center (e.g., improving patient care, treatment of complex cases based on a reputation for care)
- Significant self-development activity to increase educational and/or research effectiveness (e.g. Faculty Development programs).

D. Professor

Promotion to Professor in the Clinical Educator Track is based on achievements that demonstrate continued professional growth and contributions to the University of Toledo since last promotion. Furthermore the candidate's achievements should be recognized to be comparable to accomplishments by faculty members at the same rank at other academic medical and biomedical institutions. The successful candidate will have sustained excellence in education. Additional contributions in the scholarship and service areas are supportive factors in consideration of promotion to this rank.

1. Criteria for documenting educational excellence:

Continued educational contributions to COMLS medical students (sometimes referred to as undergraduates), physician assistant, nursing, graduate (MSBS, MS or PhD) students and/or COMLS residents and their programs are required for educational excellence. These are outlined within five categories of educational activity highlighted by the AAMC. To establish excellence as an educator, the candidate should demonstrate a leadership role through accomplishments in teaching (a) and curriculum (b) and from at least one of the other three categories.

Categories:

a. Teaching:

- (1) Active and sustained participation in teaching students in classroom, small groups, and/or in clinical settings with qualitative assessments at a regular interval. Didactic teaching (i.e. prepared presentations on key clinical topics) is encouraged. Evidence of high quality student teaching will be based on student evaluations, peer evaluations, improvement of learner outcomes, and also by recognition by receipt of teaching award(s). There is an expectation that the individual completes all student or resident evaluations on a timely basis.
- (2) If appropriate, active and sustained participation in residency program teaching with evidence of sustained teaching of high quality based on resident evaluations, teaching awards, residency outcomes, and/or peer evaluations. Didactic teaching (i.e. prepared presentations on key clinical topics) is encouraged There is an expectation that the individual completes all learner evaluations on a timely basis.

b. Curriculum: Evidence of educational excellence is required in (1) or (2)

- (1) Development of specific curriculum related to student or resident education (such as development of electives, specific classroom based lectures, additional online or other modules; new CME programs, new COMLS patient education programs). There is an expectation for innovative student and/or resident education such as new pedagogy or assessment tools.
- (2) Scholarship on innovations in student and/or resident education and its presentation at the national level. Promotion to Professor rank requires national presentations. Evidence of scholarship will be seen in the number of presentations, articles or research projects related to student or resident education activities.

c. Learner Assessment: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)

- (1) Participation in development, implementation, analysis or reporting learners' knowledge, skills, and attitudes data and/or involvement in assessment of student educational outcomes and development of remediation methodology.
- (2) Service on student or resident curriculum evaluation committees at departmental or college level.

d. Advising/Mentoring:

Documentation of the candidate's level of involvement and quality of advising and mentorship activities for students and/or residents.

e. Educational leadership/administration: Evidence is required in (1) or (2)

- (1) Administrative responsibilities in student or resident educational programs with evidence to support maintaining or exceeding benchmarks for quality.
- (2) Service on regional and/or national student and/or resident education committee(s).

1. Education

To establish excellence as an educator, the candidate should demonstrate a leadership role through accomplishments from among the following education activities:

- (a) Long-standing exemplary teaching and mentoring medical and/or graduate students, residents and fellows.
 - (b) Patient education and public health education programs.
 - (c) Continuing medical education (CME) programs
 - (d) Workshops at regional and national meetings
- (e) Methods to promote and assess learning and/or develop innovative curricula.
- (f) Directorships and administration of educational programs and courses.
 - (g) Student activities outside of the classroom
 - (h) Clinical presentations at local, regional and national meetings.

2. Scholarship

To establish excellence as a scholar, the candidate should demonstrate leadership role accomplishments from among the following scholarly activities:

- (a) Principal investigator role in research projects or clinical trials.
- (b) Attracting extramural research support.
- (c) Peer-reviewed publications in which the candidate is primary/senior author. *Threshold criteria*: The candidate will have at least 10 publications, of which at least 5 are in peer-reviewed journals. Others may include clinical, educational or scientific reports, program descriptions or evaluations, book chapters, monographs, or other clinically relevant materials (not including abstracts). At least 5 publications should be since promotion to associate professor. The candidate should be primary or senior author on at least 4 of the publications [2 since promotion to associate professor] in peer-reviewed journals).
- (d) Participation in review of clinical or basic science research at state or national levels.
- (e) Presenting clinical, educational or scientific observations, abstracts, reviews, or other information at national and/or international meetings.
- (f) Development of intellectual properties or patents.
- (g) Reviewing or editing clinical or scientific publications.

3. Service

To establish excellence as a service provider, the candidate should demonstrate leadership role accomplishments from among the following service activities:

- (a) Continuous and longstanding delivery of superior quality health care.
- (b) Expertise in a field as evidenced by reputation, clinical competency, and productivity.
- (c) Professional or personal skill and knowledge.
- (d) Committee chair or officer role on local, regional, and national organizations.
- (e) Committee chair responsibilities within the University of Toledo.
- (f) Developing or directing new treatment programs and using new devices or concepts.
- (g) Service to profession, including serving as board examiner.