



University Assessment Committee

Wednesday, March 4, 1:00-2:30PM

Meeting Minutes

Attendees: Brian Ashburner, Lori DeShetler, Matt Franchetti, , Lynne Hamer, Alana Malik, Laurie Mauro, Shery Milz, Holly Monsos, Susan Pocotte, Barbara Schneider, Michele Soliz, Jackie Thompson

Not present: Tom Atwood, Lydia Cozier, Brian Kuhn, Terribeth Moore, Shannon Neumann, Ashley Pryor, Julie Quinonez, Geoff Rapp, Patty Relue, Valerie Simmons-Walston, Tia Tucker

VP Updates:

Email went out today to all faculty on curriculum mapping from the Provost. Another email will go out later this semester to the Dean's reminding them they will be accountable for using the maps in their College.

Annual Report Template – The departments got their templates a couple of weeks ago. The college templates are under development right now. We are supposed to get Delaware's data on Friday. Alana is going to have the assessment piece next Friday. Everyone else should have their templates. They are due by the middle of May. The reporting cycle has been changed. The data included are for three semesters – fall 2018, spring 2019, and fall 2019. We didn't do annual reports last fall because we were rebuilding the template. Going forward we will be in better shape.

Jillian Kinzie, AAC&U's High-Impact Practices, will be here all day on March 27 to speak. She is one of the faculty members involved in developing the National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE), she's deeply involved in the national analysis of that data. She's worked for a very long time on high impact practices. She also a senior scholar of the National Institute of Learning Outcomes Assessment (NILOA). The morning will be about high impact educational experiences. The afternoon will include introductory talks and organizing tables to work on high impact practices. She will meet with the university assessment committee following the workshop (3-4pm). Alana will email you the flyer.

<https://education.indiana.edu/about/directory/profiles/kinzie-jillian.html>

Office Updates:

Core Curriculum update – still working on it.....

Curriculum Mapping – very busy looking at outcome statements and getting ready to talk with folks.

Faculty Senate/Graduate Council Spring Updates – Holly and I are going to meet with them soon with updates. Grad council is scheduled before our next assessment meeting.

Bill McCreary was in talks with the campus labs to try and accommodate some of our needs through a software system campus labs provides; more to follow....

Items for Discussion:

Co-Curricular vs. Extra-Curricular definitions

Service Unit Review Letter to Provost

Deans Meetings

Curriculum Mapping Timeline:

Action Item	Target completion date	Person(s) responsible	Status
Determine the purpose and scope	September 2019 UAC Meeting	UAC membership	Complete
Communicate plan with university leadership	November 2019	Barbara Schneider, with support from college liaisons	Complete
Develop the template(s) and other developmental materials	December 2019 UAC Meeting	Alana Malik, with approval from UAC membership	Complete
Train faculty and staff to complete their maps	January	Alana Malik, with support from college liaisons	Kick-off-Complete Individual help-In progress
Collect maps	April 30 th	Individual Programs submit materials through online system	In progress
Provide feedback	By August 31 st	UAC liaisons	Not started

Upcoming 2019-2020 Meeting/Event Schedule

March 27	Jillian Kinzie	TBD	TBD
April 1	UAC Meeting	1-2:30pm	1022 North Engineering
May 6	UAC Meeting	1-2:30pm	1022 North Engineering

The Curricular and the Co-Curricular

The importance of what takes place outside the classroom.

[Michael Patrick Rutter](#) and [Steven Mintz](#)

October 20, 2016

<https://www.insidehighered.com/blogs/higher-ed-gamma/curricular-and-co-curricular>

Where do students devote much of their time and intellectual energy? A common line you hear on admissions tours and in peppy brochure ware suggests an answer: “Most students learn the most outside of the classroom.” Why such an outcome might not be measurable, the advent of enhanced / experience transcripts from [places like Elon University](#)) suggests it goes beyond marketing copy.

Co-curricular activities, structured learning activities that complement the formal curriculum (and more often than not do not count for credit or toward graduation), are often more “core” than you might think.

These include research intensive experiences (like the famed [Undergraduate Research Opportunities Program \(UROP\)](#) at MIT), internships and externships, global opportunities, innovation activities (like [Harvard’s I-Lab](#) or [Stanford’s StartX](#)), and community involvement.

Moreover, freeing up time so students can engage in co-curriculars suggest that institutions are meeting students where they are. The move towards flipped classrooms and experiential learning spaces also indicates that such activities are becoming part of the infrastructure, rather than just add-ons.

The co-curriculum, however, differs in important respects from traditional extracurriculars: athletics, student government, theater, and various clubs, which historically constituted a big part of the college experience. Unlike extracurriculars, the co-curriculum intentionally aligns with and augments and enhances standard curricular goals. Sometimes, the co-curriculum is embedded within existing academic programs, as is the case with study abroad, formal undergraduate research experiences, and the growing trend toward requiring students to participate in a service learning activity. In other instances, the co-curriculum stands somewhat apart, as is the case with the various maker spaces and entrepreneurship incubators: the idea labs accelerators, greenhouses, workshops, and innovation hubs that are sprouting up on many campuses and which give students an opportunity to transform abstract ideas into concrete accomplishments.

Today, students frequently complain about high tuition costs, boring classes, and being unable to get into their chosen classes. But when students protest, it's rarely about such matters. That is likely because they find the true meaning of college elsewhere.

Students need to acquire core skills; but they also want to build their own education. That's what the co-curriculum provides. For many students, it's the co-curriculum that offers the most interesting, compelling, and institutionally-defining educational experiences.

The co-curriculum does what the standard academic curriculum generally does not: It is developmental, transformative, and future-focused. It is also experiential, offering authentic, hands-on opportunities to hone skills, put ideas into practice, and showcase achievements of potential interest to employers.

Among the challenge facing institutions is to make the co-curriculum intersect better with the current academic curriculum, for example, by making the course schedule more flexible, with more classes online, to give students more time to invest in a start-up. Similarly, it might make sense to scale certain introductory courses so that faculty can devote more time to higher impact practices such as mentoring expanded research opportunities.

Going back to the phrase we started with---“most of your education takes place outside of the classroom”----that certainly seems the case. What does that mean in practice?

For most college students, it's outside the classroom that they learn about interpersonal relationships, intimacy, managing emotions, and developing an adult identity and sense of direction. But it's also outside the classroom that students can acquire the proficiencies, expertise, and experience that will matter most after graduation.

For most faculty, deans, and administrators tasked with developing a more innovative curriculum or one that leads to various ends like specific learning outcomes and job skills/employability, it's outside the classroom where they might be able to make the most impact---and do so quickly. It's also outside the classroom where learning innovation and experimentation can happen in a far more unfettered way.

Steven Mintz is Executive Director of the University of Texas System's Institute for Transformational Learning and Professor of History at the University of Texas at Austin and Michael Patrick Rutter is Director of Media Relations at the MIT School of Engineering.

Institution	Description of Co-Curricular
Elon University	Global Engagement Internships Leadership Research Service
Michigan State University	At MSU, we identify <i>co-curricular activities</i> as those requiring student participation outside of the scope of academic (or for-credit) coursework that contribute to achievement of undergraduate learning goals, competencies, and/or specified learning outcomes. Whether a student is conducting undergraduate research with a faculty member, engaging in community volunteerism with a local non-profit, working on-campus as a resident assistant, or serving in an elected leadership role in a student organization—opportunities for co-curricular involvement abound at Michigan State University.
Ohio State University	<p><i>From their 2017 HLC assurance argument:</i></p> <p>Programs offered by the Office of Student Life (SL) align with the institution’s mission and values and are consistent with both the diversity and the scale of the student population. With more than 1,000 student organizations, over 300 of which are specifically targeted to graduate and professional students, students can select engagement experiences aligned with academic and career goals and cultural and personal interests. Other programs engage students in community involvement and leadership development, with the particular lens of exploring social justice and global awareness.</p> <p>The Buckeye Leadership Fellows Program is a cohort program for juniors and seniors designed to build, in partnership with alumni and community leaders, unique transformative experiences for undergraduate students so they are prepared for their post-graduate pursuits and remain connected to the university.</p> <p>Students who participate in Ohio State’s Greek Life are held to established academic standards and offered intentional, structured opportunities to participate in guided leadership development and personal reflection.</p> <p>Several intentional cohort experiences are offered to students, many of which include a residential component. Programs such as the Mount Leadership Society are designed to assist students in integrating their classroom experience with their co-curricular activities.</p> <p>Multicultural Understanding through Non-traditional Discovery Opportunities (MUNDO) is a program that encourages students to engage in a yearlong exploration of their personal identities and the ways in which others’ values and beliefs were formed,</p>

and to develop ways to promote cross-cultural dialogue and action through a series of workshops, classes, travel, and service-learning.

Pay It Forward is a student cohort that educates and exposes students to avenues of civic engagement in a variety of areas, including voting, access to education, direct service, and longterm service commitments.

Buck-I-Serv is a substance-free alternative break program, designed to engage students in reflection, social justice, and civic engagement via week-long community service projects throughout the United States and beyond.

In addition to co-curricular programming that engages students in service and service-learning (see 3B), the university also provides them with multiple opportunities to develop leadership skills. For example, students gain leadership skills through involvement in university governance that includes Undergraduate Student Government, the Council of Graduate Students, and the Inter-Professional Council, or through leadership positions in student organizations. SL also provides programming designed to help students become stronger and more effective leaders, including LeaderShape and Leadership Week.

Examples below illustrate exceptionally enriching educational experiences, some highly ranked, and all with strong academic ties.

Living Learning Communities. Students living in residence halls have the opportunity to participate in one of 18 Learning Communities. They also have the option to apply to live in Honors housing or one of 17 Scholars Programs supported by the Honors and Scholars Center. Each Learning Community is unique in the mission, goals, and events offered, but all provide students with a direct connection to the classroom experience, focused events and experiential learning opportunities, and dedicated staff members to ensure their success within the community. Approximately 1,300 first- and second-year students choose to participate in a Learning Community, and another 1,700 students live in Honors housing.

Service-Learning. The Office of Service-Learning supports the development, implementation, and evaluation of sustainable service-learning courses and encourages community-based scholarship across the curricula to enhance student learning, develop student engagement, and foster ongoing collaboration with local and global communities. In the last academic year, more than 80 courses in nearly 40 departments reached some 2,500 students who contributed over 30,000 hours of service at home and abroad. These service-learning courses provided for experiential education that took students out of the classroom and into communities, allowing them to work with partners to meet real community needs and learn how to connect academic experience to active citizenship.

Education Abroad. The Office of International Affairs works with academic units to identify and coordinate international programming of curricular relevance to major and degree programs. The office provides a wide range of support services to students engaged in field research, Third Party Provider programs, service-learning, or international internships, as well as to

students who are participating in Ohio State faculty-led study abroad programs. Students at Ohio State can participate in over 200 study abroad programs in more than 50 different countries and on six continents. These programs give students an opportunity to develop global competencies and have a rewarding educational experience in numerous fields of study. Close to 20% of undergraduates have a study abroad experience before they graduate.

Research opportunities (see 3B). The Undergraduate Research Office provides a variety of opportunities and guidance to students who are interested in participating in research. Research participation has increased since the office was established in 2006. Between 2008 and 2014 (page 16), student enrollment in courses offered for research credit increased from 1,347 to 2,296, and the number of students presenting at the annual Denman Undergraduate Research Forum increased from 415 to 629. Students also have the opportunity to submit manuscripts to The Journal of Undergraduate Research at Ohio State, a student-led, peer-reviewed online publication. In 2011, the Board of Trustees approved a proposal to allow all students the option to complete an undergraduate research thesis in order to graduate with research distinction. For the 2013-14 academic year, 98 students graduated with Research Distinction and 238 students graduated with Honors Research Distinction.

Honors and Scholars. The University Honors and Scholars Center offers Honors and Scholars programs for high-achieving students. It also provides support for all Ohio State undergraduates who wish to apply for prestigious post-baccalaureate fellowships. In Honors, approximately 4,000 highly motivated students are able to pursue an enriched academic experience that integrates curricular and co-curricular opportunities, including a rigorous curriculum, experience with scholarly research, exceptional leadership, dedication to service, and global competencies. Ohio State offers over 500 Honors sections of courses, Honors housing, special study abroad programs, and the opportunity to graduate “with honors” or with “Honors Research Distinction.” The Honors program also includes two specialty sub-programs. The Collegium supports about 50 students in their second year with self-reflection in the pursuit of their goals. The Eminence Fellows program consists of about 100 students who have been awarded the university's top full-cost-of-attendance merit award. A staff member guides each class in developing a cohort-based service project, and also mentors and connects students with faculty. These students typically attend top graduate and professional programs after they graduate from Ohio State. The Undergraduate Fellowship Office is another resource for undergraduates pursuing national scholarships and fellowships such as Rhodes, Marshall, Truman, Goldwater, Udall, Fulbright, and National Science Foundation.

Graduate/Professional. Several of the professional colleges, including Dentistry, Law, Medicine, Nursing, and Pharmacy, offer students opportunities to gain practical experience while serving the community.

BGSU	<p><i>From their 2013 HLC assurance argument:</i></p> <p>The co-curricular opportunities for undergraduates that promote acceptance of human diversity include: living in one of three residential learning communities (Global Village, La Maison Française, La Comunidad); studying abroad in programs sponsored through the university (approximately 12 short-term programs in 11 countries) or through the Ohio International Consortium; participating in the Academic Investment in Math and Science (AIMS), a program whose goal is to increase the number of women and students of color who graduate from BGSU with majors in STEM disciplines; receiving encouragement and support as a McNair Scholar to pursue graduate studies; undertaking a service learning project in communities with need through the Alternative Spring Break program; and participating in conferences and programming offered through the Office of Multicultural Affairs.</p> <p>Co-curricular programs of many kinds at BGSU promote involvement in activities outside the classroom, build commitment to the institution and its principles, and inculcate normative beliefs about the purposes, mission and values of the University. Examples include: • Residential living/learning communities (16) • First-year programs • Student organizations (347) • Center for Undergraduate Research and Scholarship (39 awards Summer 2010-Spring 2011) • Common reading experience • First Year Success Series • Residence Education (residence life jobs, residence hall councils, SMART program) • President’s Leadership Academy • Nontraditional Student Services • Department of Recreation and Wellness</p> <p>3.E.1. Co-curricular programs of many kinds at BGSU promote involvement in activities outside the classroom, build commitment to the institution and its principles, and inculcate normative beliefs about the purposes, mission and values of the University. Examples include: • Residential living/learning communities (16) • First-year programs • Student organizations (347) • Center for Undergraduate Research and Scholarship (39 awards Summer 2010-Spring 2011) • Common reading experience • First Year Success Series • Residence Education (residence life jobs, residence hall councils, SMART program) • President’s Leadership Academy • Nontraditional Student Services • Department of Recreation and Wellness</p>
Kent State University	<p>Kent includes an Experiential Learning Requirement to graduate, the program has multiple pathways for students to complete the requirement –either through a designated course, a plus-1 credit course, or non-course activity. It includes a reflective assignment.</p> <p><i>From their 2013 HLC assurance argument:</i></p> <p>The university’s strategic plan provides a framework by which to align co-curricular developmental goals with curricular learning objectives. The university is committed (as stated in the undergraduate philosophy statement) to developing ways for all students to be informed about the world, to develop capacity for applying their learning to solve problems, and to communicate</p>

	<p>across ethnic, racial, religious, cultural, class and national differences. Beginning fall 2012, all incoming students must complete the ELR. The development of co-curricular experiences helps fulfill this commitment to experiential education and civic engagement, as can participation in a Service Learning course, internship, undergraduate research project, etc. Many students participate in an ongoing Alternative Winter and Spring Break program. The ELR was endorsed by Undergraduate Student Government and passed by Faculty Senate.</p>
<p>University of Cincinnati</p>	<p><i>From their 2018 HLC assurance argument:</i></p> <p>A variety of co-curricular programs also incorporate human and cultural diversity within stated student learning outcomes. The Racial Awareness Program (9-month) and Accelerating Racial Justice (5-day) are experiential-learning-based intensives designed for participants to understand individual, institutional, and systemic oppression while practicing active listening, self-awareness, and reflection. Participants are expected to apply these concepts to life at UC and beyond.</p> <p>Co-curricular programs are suited to the institution’s mission and contribute to the educational experience of its students. The university recognizes that co-curricular experiences are a critical component of students’ overall learning experience. The Division of Student Affairs is the major resource for – and provider of – cocurricular experiences at UC. The division advocates for and meets students’ diverse needs by providing innovative co-curricular experiences that enhance wellbeing, foster life and academic skill development, engender responsibility, and grow leadership capacity. This purpose is rooted in the notion that co-curricular programs are integral to the overall student experience. The division supports the mission of the university in providing educational programs that actively engage students and enrich and support the academic experience. In keeping with the university mission statement’s goal to develop educated and engaged citizens, the Office of Student Activities & Leadership Development (SALD) provides a co-curricular leadership certificate in partnership with the College of Arts and Sciences. This twelve-credit-hour certificate offers students the opportunity to combine classroom learning with a student leadership practicum experience. In some instances, student leaders use their student organization leadership experiences to fulfill this practicum; other times practicums inside and outside the UC community are found. In addition to this certificate, SALD connects students to 600+ registered student organizations (ranging from academic, multicultural, and religious organizations to business and recreational), annual leadership conferences, retreats, teaching experiences, campuses, internships, workshops, and other developmental experiences. The Division of Student Affairs also supports the university’s commitment to excellence and diversity in our students by providing many opportunities for students to participate in programming that reinforces and supports UC’s core values of equity and inclusion. Ally trainings offered through the LGBTQ Center and Ethnic Programs and Services allow students to better understand how to create inclusive spaces. The Racial Awareness Program and Accelerating Racial Justice (described in 3.B.4) are intensive dialogue programs that enhance cross-cultural competency for students. The UC Women’s Center is committed to the personal, political, professional, and intellectual growth of women students at UC by facilitating action, promoting intersectional justice, and fostering connections for all students. University of Cincinnati - OH -</p>

	<p>Assurance Argument - 8/6/2018 Page 64 The Office of Ethnic Programs & Services also hosts the Darwin T. Turner Scholars program, a scholarship that centers on building diverse and inclusive communities. 135 students participate in the program each year. The program includes a variety of leadership development activities, academic coaching, and one-on-one advising. UC International supports the global focus of our mission statement by providing support and programming for our international students and domestic students interested in studying abroad. UC International is described in section 3.D.1.</p> <p>Co-curricular assessment is annually conducted by the Office of Student Affairs, with concentrated program reviews occurring on a three-year cycle. All assessment plans utilize guidelines for continuous improvement as defined by the National Council for the Advancement of Standards in Higher Education. Collected data is shared in aggregate via an annual report. Unit-specific data is also shared via key academic partnerships. For example, there is a regular sharing of data between the Learning Commons with Great Gateways faculty and programs for the purposes of continuous program improvement and stronger student success. In addition to unit-based partnerships, Student Affairs also sponsors an annual assessment conference and maintains a Student Affairs Assessment Council as a central resource and forum for continuous improvement efforts.</p>
--	--

- Elon: <https://www.elon.edu/u/elon-experiences-transcript/wp-content/uploads/sites/803/2019/08/Elon-Experiences-Report-2018.pdf>
- MSU: <https://hub.msu.edu/tracking-co-curricular-contributions-to-student-success-at-msu/>
- OSU: <https://u.osu.edu/pellicane2hseportfolio/2016/10/01/definition-of-goals/>
https://oaa.osu.edu/assets/files/caa/proposals/2015-16/2015-11-04/CAA-Proposal-2015-11-04_Co-CurricularCompetenciesUpdate
- BGSU: <https://www.bgsu.edu/content/dam/BGSU/ir/documents/hlc-accreditation/AssuranceArgument.pdf>
- Kent: <https://www.kent.edu/community/how-complete-elr-and-project-examples>
<https://www.kent.edu/community/reflective-assignment-guide>
- Cincinnati: https://www.uc.edu/content/dam/uc/provost/docs/assurance_argument_Final_use%20for%20Print.pdf

Provost Karen Bjorkman
Office of the Provost
3340 University Hall



OFFICE OF THE PROVOST

THE UNIVERSITY OF TOLEDO

Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review

Dear Provost Bjorkman,

The University Assessment Committee (UAC) recently completed a review of the service areas affiliated with the committee that relate their work to student learning and success. The committee discussed the strengths and weaknesses of the 2018-2019 annual service unit assessment reports. Based on our analysis and evaluation of the data, the UAC reports the following conclusions:

- 1) The service units expressed a sincere desire to learn how to improve their assessment practices, specifically how to distinguish between student learning, operational, and program outcomes.
- 2) They are heavily dependent on indirect measures of student success and learning through the use of surveys to determine students' perceptions of learning and satisfaction with services. They are using surveys appropriately and gathering good data related to their individual needs.
- 3) In general, the review of reports did not provide the types of data or discussion that the University Assessment Committee needs to develop meaningful feedback for consideration in budget and resource allocation decision-making at the institutional-level, nor was there adequate evidence of assessment data used in consideration of decision-making at the unit/college-level.
- 4) In addition to the lack of evidence of assessment data used for decision making, further challenges from the reports mirror other previous HLC findings from 2016. These challenges include: a) outcomes statements are not always well-written, and measureable; b) the reports lack evidence of closing the loop between previous year's intended changes, and the impact they have on programs; and c) programs tend to rely heavily on usage data, and survey results that indicate perception of learning vs. direct evidence of learning.

Based on the UAC's discussion, and the need to address the Higher Learning Commission's feedback regarding the assessment of co-curricular learning, the committee is working to clarify the definitions and make a distinction between co-curricular, and extra-curricular offerings at UT. By defining these terms, the committee hopes to refocus and narrow the scope of the service units' contribution to assessment work. We intend to include those definitions in future assessment policy statements.

Other themes from the reports were a) a desire for more support for discipline specific professional development on best practices in assessment; and b) requests for stronger messaging from senior leadership as to the importance of the role of assessment in improving student success and learning, and how it impacts resource allocation and budgeting.

Once we define which service units will remain included under the scope of the new institutional definition of co-curricular, the UAC plans to address their professional development needs. The UAC also affirms the requests noted in "b" as particularly important as the institution prepares for HLC reaccreditation, and asks for more direct support from senior leadership in holding people accountable for their effort to improve assessment practices.

Sincerely,

Holly Monsos
University Assessment Committee Chair

Alana Malik
University Assessment Director

Individual Meetings with the Deans Potential Topics	
Items to Share:	Requests for Help:
HLC Criterion 4-need to show evidence of assessment data used in resource allocation decision-making, and that the process is faculty driven	Agendas and minutes from college assessment or curriculum committees demonstrating use of assessment data with evidence of action taken based on review and analysis of data. (need to collect from colleges)
Program reporting strengths and weaknesses	Reports indicating the use of direct measures for assessment of student learning (program reports)
Definitions of co-curricular vs. extra-curricular	Documentation of co-curricular assessment and improvements based on data, including direct measures of student learning-not only reporting usage and satisfaction data (service unit reports)
State of curriculum mapping project in their respective college	Curriculum maps
Assessment calendar cycle	
Areas where we are trying to align assessment to other processes (annual reports, CIM/and hopefully CAT, program review, strategic plan)	
Measuring core curriculum and Institutional SLOs	
Drafts of assessment policy statements	