

**Graduate Council Minutes**  
**February 5, 2019**  
**Health Science Campus, Health Education Building, Room 105**

Present: Wissam Abbou Alaiwi, Brian Ashburner, Scott Leisner (for Tomer Avidor-Reiss), Dan Hammel, Anthony Edgington, Christina Fitzgerald, Rodney Gabel, Bashar Gammoh, Daniel Georgiev, Cyndee Gruden, Jason Huntley, Edward Janak, Song-Tao Liu, Sara Lundquist, Jyl Matson, Marcia McInerney, Nikolai Modyanov, Daryl Moorhead, Nagalaksmi Nadiminty, Alisa Nammavong (GSA), Penny Poplin Gosetti, Patricia Relue, Jennifer Reynolds, Constance Schall, Barry Scheuermann, Richard Welsch (for Rebecca Schneider) Martha Sexton, Zahoor Shah, Oleg Smirnov, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Robert Topp Jerry Van Hoy, Kandace Williams.

Absent: Terry Bigioni, Geoffrey Rapp, Ozcan Sezer, James Willey.

Excused: Ben Davis, Hassan Hassab-Elnaby, Douglas Nims, Lori Pakulski, Beth Schlemper.

Guests: Debbie Andrews, Karen Bjorkman, Cody Henderson, Holly Myers.

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of October 16, October 30, November 13 and November 27, 2018 were approved.

***Executive Reports***

**Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair, Dr. Jerry Van Hoy reported the following items discussed by the GCEC:

- *Fall catalog curriculum deadline of March 12, 2019*  
The Provost's Office has asked that curriculum that needs to be in the 2019-2020 catalog be submitted by this date so that we can make every effort to get it through this year and have the catalog ready for Rocket Launch. After discussions with the Faculty Senate and Graduate Council Executive and Curriculum Committees, we all agreed to March 12<sup>th</sup>. If submitted after the deadline, it will be reviewed but is not guaranteed to be in the fall catalog.
- *No summer curriculum with new CIM system*  
For discussion. Currently, the GC Curriculum Committee is 12 months and GC must empower GCEC to review identified proposals during the summer on behalf of GC. If catalog won't be updated in summer, the question is should we change the Bylaws to remove the reviewing of curriculum during the summer.
- *Academic Grievance Policy Update*  
GCEC spent a lot of time talking about this. Dean Gruden produced an updated version that is being reviewed by GCEC and will go to the GC Academic Programs and Regulations Committee.

### Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Interim Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

- *New Teaching Assistant Training*  
New Teaching Assistant Training was held all afternoon on February 1<sup>st</sup>, on the Main Campus, in the Field House 1220. Training was led by Dr. Barbara Schneider of the Teaching Center. There will be another training session offered in the fall. Different students need different types of training and we are discussing what that looks like. Some colleges offer training opportunities while others have none. We want to do best job for our students.
- *Responsible Conduct in Research Training*  
Responsible Conduct in Research Training will also take place this spring semester, Saturday, March 23, 2019, Memorial Field 2100. It will be the most beneficial to new, second and third year students. While attendees are primarily from Natural Sciences and Mathematics, Engineering and Pharmacy, others students may want to be involved.
- *Graduate Student Academic Dishonesty Policy*  
Revisions to the undergraduate policy will probably roll out first. Revisions to the graduate policy can be based on whether those changes apply to graduate students and how they might apply. There may be some parallel. Graduate students are different and their processes are different as well. Some definitions will remain same. Most of our policies require that grievances go through college level review prior to coming to COGS and/or the Academic Standing Committee. Colleges should have defined processes. Those are not set by COGS, but by each college. There is a separate Research Misconduct Policy. As the ad hoc committee moves along, we can share definitions with you.
- *2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Three Minutes Thesis Competition*  
3MT competition is underway this year. 32 students signed up. The schedule of events, organized by Ms. Teri Green, are located on <http://www.utoledo.edu/graduate/currentstudents/3mt/>. The final competition is scheduled on February 28<sup>th</sup>, with eight finalists in that round. Your students will benefit from participating in this competition.

### Research and Sponsored Programs Update

Dr. Frank Calzonetti, Vice President of Research, reported that Dr. Debra Boardley has joined the Office of Research & Sponsored Programs (ORSP) in the role of Research Integrity Officer (RIO) with engagement at the assessment stage. Dr. Wayne Hoss is acting as RIO on some existing cases that are currently underway in the inquiry stage through investigation stages. New cases will be directed to Dr. Boardley. There are no new cases thus far. Journal editors have become more pro-active in identifying potential misconduct in submitted manuscripts, particularly in assessing manipulation of images.

We are early stages of planning a National Lab Day in fall 2019 to connect UT researchers and students with Department of Energy national lab (e.g. Argon, Oakridge, Brookhaven) scientists and opportunities. Faculty with established collaborations with DOE national labs should contact Dr. Calzonetti.

### Report of the Graduate Student Association

Ms. Ms. Alisa Nammavong, President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

- *Special Interest Committee on Health (SICH)*  
Dr. Flapp Cockrell and Mr. Brian Pack will be attending the General Assembly meeting on February 12<sup>th</sup> to share information about student health insurance and answer student questions. Mr. Pack will present a slideshow and answer questions. GSA is still working with this group and will continue meetings. Meetings were effective last semester.
- *College of Engineering Graduate Launch Program*  
Ibeh Omodolor is the GSA's College of Engineering Rep who presented information on behalf of the GSA at the College of Engineering's Graduate Launch Program. GSA extends its appreciation to the College of Engineering for including us in their launch program. For first year events, GSA is glad to like to participate. We looking forward to summer and fall for opportunities.
- *Midwest Graduate Research Symposium*  
Saturday, April 6, 2019, UT Main Campus, Student Union and the Field House  
To date, there are 13 Presenters: Indiana Tech, Kent State University, Miami University, Wayne State, UT, and others. There are 28 Judges. Registration is free and open and active on GSA website until March 10<sup>th</sup>. Volunteer registration will open after the February 12<sup>th</sup> General Assembly meeting.
- *Recent budget request approvals*
  - Graduate Research Forum on March 20<sup>th</sup>-21<sup>st</sup>, Health Science Campus: \$4,513.60.
  - Careers in Science Expo on March 26<sup>th</sup>, Main Campus: \$2,551.19.
  - Over \$5,000 remains for college events.
- *General Assembly, February 12, 2019, 6 pm, MC, Student Union Ingman Room*  
Agenda Items:
  - Student health insurance discussion.
  - Election of officers to occur spring semester.
  - Contacted by Office of Research (Dr. Hillary Snyder) to present on changes to IRB. She will present at the March 20<sup>th</sup> General Assembly.

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### Dr. Karen Bjorkman, Interim Provost

Interim Provost Bjorkman thanked Council for inviting her. After only two weeks in this position, she expressed that she was impressed with the number of initiatives underway, which are all connected to the Strategic Plan 2017-2022. She briefly touched on some of the areas affecting graduate education.

- *Professional Development*  
It is important that our graduate students get excellent professional development and training. They need the tools to work effectively in their professions.

- *Enrollment and Retention*  
Both are important at the graduate level. Provost Bjorkman is working with Mr. Jim Anderson, Vice President for Enrollment Management, and will have him meet with the Deans Council to coordinate efforts in this process.
- *Student Support*  
Health insurance issue has been an issue that has been worked on diligently. It now includes support and expertise from Human Resources. Mental health is a growing concern, and we continue to have conversations around this topic in effort to support our students. It influences retention and success.
- *Diversity*  
The Provost's Office is developing a diversity plan that will follow the university plan but with specific components for academic affairs.
- *Retention*  
We want to let our undergraduates know how they can transition into our graduate programs. Pipeline programs are an excellent opportunity that we want to publicize more. We also want to look for ways for students to present their research. The MGRS is a great opportunity to this. In April we will have our first research symposium, focused on community engagement, and community partners are invited to attend. More information will be forthcoming about that. The request for proposals to present research projects is now out. We want our community to hear about all the ways our research efforts have a direct impact locally and regionally.
- *Interdisciplinary Programs*  
We want to work with the colleges and research office to develop unique programs and interdisciplinary work. Water issues and energy, are two examples of these.
- *Recognition of Graduate Students*  
We welcome opportunities to showcase what our graduate students are doing with more stories out about their research and experiential work. Please share those with Dean Gruden.
- *Budget and Stipends/Benchmarks*  
Provost Bjorkman is working with Dean Gruden to make sure stipends are as competitive as we can make them, within our budget constraints. We have to look at what others are doing, how we recruit, how to get the word out, and how best to market our graduate programs. Provost Bjorkman would like to see a coordinated effort on that front. Adrienne King, Associate Vice President of Marketing and Communications, will be at the next Deans Council meeting to discuss.

These are a few of the many things happening in the Provost's Office. Provost Bjorkman again thanked Council for inviting her and said that she will do her best to answer any questions they have of her.

### Admissions/Enrollment Discussion

Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Interim Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies brought for discussion the Graduate Council's recent responses to graduate admissions and enrollment. The goal of today's conversation is to make sure we are representing graduate education and graduate students.

We have new VP Enrollment Management, Mr. Jim Anderson, whose job primarily focuses on undergraduate enrollment, however, we need to do a good job with graduate enrollment too. We want to make sure we are a part of the broader conversation. Dean Gruden sought ideas from the Council to overcome some of the challenges in graduate recruitment. Joining Dean Gruden for today's discussion from COGS are Ms. Debbie Andrews, Director of Graduate Enrollment Management and Mr. Cody Henderson, Marketing, Communication and Enrollment Management Specialist.

### Review of Survey Responses: Admissions

*Which of these elements does your graduate program include in admissions decisions?*

Dean Gruden asked how many elements are needed to evaluate students.

Discussion:

Jennifer Reynolds – We do a spontaneous writing sample.

Marcia McInerney – We do telephone interviews. Same questions and rubric.

Zahoor Shah – On-site interview for those who reside in Ohio and Skype for those who are further away.

*Which of the following is the most important element to consider in admitting students to your graduate program?*

Dean Gruden noted that what is considered the most important element varies by area.

Discussion:

Bashar Gammoh – Standardized tests.

Oleg Smirnov – Transcripts to review courses.

Song-Tao Liu – Skype interviews standard. If publications at masters, we collected and review.

Jyl Matson – Research experience.

*The timeline and relevant deadlines of our graduate admissions process are published online and communicated effectively to applicants.*

Dean Gruden stressed the importance of publishing deadlines. Enrollment Management looks at how these dates are managed.

Discussion:

Jason Huntley – January 15<sup>th</sup> is deadline, but they may not have all of the materials submitted.

Zahoor Shah – PI's are busy and often forget to do letters.

Oleg Smirnov – February 1st is a better date that will provide more time to have all materials in. Some students say they do not know what is missing from the application.

Kandace Williams - Trying to be holistic and attract quality students.

Dean Gruden added that deadlines vary for different programs and that many are developing improved processes. Best practices change so processes are not without some challenges.

*Our graduate program is currently working toward developing an improved admissions process.*

Dean Gruden noted that 59% said yes and 41% said no.

*If so, what is the motivation?*

Dean Gruden asked what kind of changes would graduate faculty/admissions committees like to see, they will be made available. While attending a national conference recently, there was discussion about the admissions process as a holistic process. A lot of folks are eliminating letters of recommendation. Some of you find them helpful.

Discussion:

Bashar Gammoh – A lot of letters seem standardized.

Sara Lundquist – When the letters are very specific to the student, we find that helpful that they remember the student's work and character. That is an indicator they are likely to finish their graduate program.

Bashar Gammoh – Can we be specific in our instructions for letters?

Dean Gruden – Yes, you can do that.

Kandace Williams – We look for research experience in letter.

Dean Gruden – What about interviews, Skype or recorded responses?

Sara Lundquist – We ask our students to submit letter of intent.

Dean Gruden – How many consider that important? *[Majority of GC raised hands]*

Dean Gruden inquired about use of metrics such as the GMAT and GRE. The University of Michigan no longer requires the GRE for biomedical sciences.

Kandace Williams – They only admit U.S. students.

Dean Gruden – Provost Bjorkman provided links to reports that have been shared with you today, alongside the survey responses that state the GRE is not an indicator.

Kandace Williams – We do not have absolute cut off points and international students generally do not do as well on some tests.

Patty Relue – GRE requirement was implemented in Bioengineering as that information is also needed to get into U.S. News and World Report rankings.

Dean Gruden – Part of our standards for COGS is an improved set of standards for admissions. We all want better quality students and the question is, how do we get them?

*Streamlining the Application Process*

Dean Gruden stated that this semester, COGS started sending out reports to the colleges of application incompleteness and what is missing, as well as completed applications that need to be acted upon. She asked Council if this is helpful.

Discussion:

Oleg Smirnov - How he can determine what is missing from an application in the Xtender system?

Debbie Andrews - Cody Henderson notifies the applicant within 7-10 days of receipt of the application that it is incomplete and we send them link to check their status. Link - <http://application.utoledo.edu>.

Oleg Smirnov - Could COGS could copy the program on the email to the student?

Debbie Andrews - We can send you a list of incomplete applications for your program upon request. This list will provide you the applicant's name and items missing.

Patty Relue – Would you provide a demo of the various communications sent to students since the programs do not know what that looks like?

Debbie Andrews – I can take a snapshot and send those to you.

### *Resources*

Dean Gruden referenced the following resources as an awareness of what is happening with admissions practices across the country. Dean Gruden's documents are best practices and two links provided by Provost Bjorkman discussing GRE. We just need to be aware of what is happening.

- Handbook from Cyndee Gruden's on holistic reviews for admissions (2016) [https://CyndeeGrudensnet.org/ckfinder/userfiles/files/Cyndee GrudenS HolisticReview final web.pdf](https://CyndeeGrudensnet.org/ckfinder/userfiles/files/Cyndee%20GrudenS%20HolisticReview%20final%20web.pdf)
- Cyndee Gruden's Master's Admissions document (2018) <https://CyndeeGrudensnet.org/publication-pdf/5396>
- GRE Scores not a predictor for graduate success (2019) <http://advances.sciencemag.org/content/5/1/eaat7550/tab-pdf>
- GRE Scores eliminated from some admissions at top schools [https://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2017/08/updated-biomedical-phd-programmajor-research-university-drops-gre-requirement?r3f\\_986=https://www.google.com/](https://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2017/08/updated-biomedical-phd-programmajor-research-university-drops-gre-requirement?r3f_986=https://www.google.com/)

### *Enrollment*

*Our graduate program communicates directly with new and continuing students to remind them to enroll in classes.*

83% yes and 13% no.

Students that don't have issues, are encouraged to enroll, so that we can help those who do have issues. Most programs communicate with students as does COGS and the Registrar's Office.

### *Advising Before Enrollment*

*Our graduate programs provides direct advising to our students before graduate enrollment begins.*

Students don't feel the urgency to register. How do we create a sense of urgency or encourage continuing students to enroll earlier? This is a focus across the institution. Classes don't generally fill up at the graduate level, so it is not as much of an issue. A lot of feedback was provided including, using more texting. There is talk about using a general platform on campus. We can produce data in Argos and WRL. What do you want for continuing student enrollment data?

Discussion:

Patty Relue – Prefer to obtain data ourselves, directly from Banner and share on OneDrive and contribute to spreadsheet.

Dean Gruden – Do you want this in a folder or sent to you? We already send you reports. The associate deans thought this was okay.

Connie Schall – Does COGS send a blanket email to students who have not enrolled? If so, the graduate program directors need to know that.

Debbie Andrews – Yes.

Dean Gruden – Some graduate program directors want to do that. The process takes some work since there are students have holds on their account and don't send it to them.

Debbie Andrews – I send to the associate deans and admissions people, who should share as appropriate. We partner with departments because students want to hear directly from programs.

Cyndee Gruden – We don't want to inundate students with emails, but we do want to partner with you regarding communication plans.

*New Graduate Enrollment could be improved by?*

New students should be enrolled.

Discussion:

Rodney Gabel – We lose a lot of students due to cost.

Patty Relue – Engineering has a lot of international students who arrive late and must go through the Office of International Services prior to registering.

Dean Gruden – If you have a big cohort, they can sign off a program and get enrolled. COBI does this.

Jason Huntley – When is the earliest they can register?

Cyndee Gruden – March 13<sup>th</sup>. Will get their first bill in July due by August 16<sup>th</sup>. Late fees are typically assigned the last Friday of the month that classes start. Dates posted on the Treasurer's web-site.

Financial fear is a concern we want to display and share payment due dates.

Jason Huntley – We want to tell them register and that they won't be assessed late payment until a specified date.

Cyndee Gruden – Show/share fall registration/payment timeline in spring.

Oleg Smirnov – An early registration incentive might help, such as a discount.

Cyndee Gruden – Unfortunately a financial incentive goes against the student's financial aid. Prize incentives were offered last semester and did not prove to be important to students because they had to be below certain limits.

*Enrollment Summary*

Dean Gruden stated that COGS seeks to help overcome enrollment challenges. How can we help? Move up enrollment?



Discussion:

Tomer Avidor-Reiss – What do other places do?

Cyndee Gruden – Many have firm and earlier deadlines. The culture is different.

Jerry Van Hoy – There should be a concern of cancelled classes due to low enrollment.

Jason Huntley – Workflow is a dramatic improvement. Could it generate a single PDF? That would be great.

Debbie Andrews – There are some things our system can't turn into PDF and link to their file.

Jason Huntley – It is a vast improvement. MCAS does it.

Cyndee Gruden – The CAS systems are expensive.

Kandace Williams – Would like a report indicating those admitted and not admitted.

Debbie Andrews – Sure, I can do that.

Patty Relue – The admission (accept or reject) is typed in the decision page, but is un-retrievable elsewhere.

Debbie Andrews – It is a text field.

Marcia McInerney – Onboarding can be problematic since all papers must be provided prior to being able to proceed with the criminal search prior to coming to campus. That delays everything.

Cyndee Gruden – This is an onboarding process, not admissions. The University is changing its hiring system to Cornerstone, faculty and staff are moving to that platform as well. There is conversation about moving the GA process too. COGS will continue communicating with graduate programs. We will look at auto enrollment of some programs that have lock-step programs. Please contact us with any questions.

***Standing Committee Reports***

Report of the Curriculum Committee

On behalf of the Graduate Council Membership Committee (GCCC), Co-Chair, Dr. Rodney Gabel presented the committee's report. Council approved unanimously.

No.	Proposal Type	College	Department/Program	Title	Course Number
43	ECM	HH	Intervention and Wellness	Internship in Speech-Language Pathology II	SLP 6941
44	ECM	NU	Nursing	Advanced Clinical Seminar in Nursing	NURS 5510
45	ECM	NU	Nursing	Practicum and Seminar in Teaching	NURS 6730
46	ECM	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Neuroscience Seminar	PHYT 5080
47	ECM	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Neuromuscular Rehabilitation II	PHYT 6610
48	ECM	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Integrated Patient Management	PHYT 7100
49	NCP	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Medical Imaging	PHYT 5900
50	NCP	BU	Accounting	Data Analytics for Accountants	ACCT 6600
51	NCP	BU	Accounting	Accounting Information Systems and Controls	ACCT 5310
52	NCP	BU	Accounting	Individual Taxation	ACCT 5210
53	NCP	BU	Accounting	Intermediate Financial I	ACCT 5110
54	NCP	BU	Accounting	Financial Accounting Analysis	ACCT 5100
55	ECM	EN	Electrical Engineering and Computer Science	Power System Management	EECS 5460
56	ECM	HH	School of Population Health	Public Health Nutrition	HEAL 8520
57	NCP	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Pediatric Rehabilitation	PHYT 6620
58	NCP	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Medical Screening	PHYT 7320
59	NCP	HH	School of Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences	Advanced Therapeutic Exercise	PHYT 7300
60	NPP	CE	Educational Foundations and Leadership	Educational Administration & Supervision	NA

### Report of the Membership Committee

The Membership Committee report has been moved to the February 19<sup>th</sup> Graduate Council meeting.

### ***Old Business***

Discussion about moving GC meetings to Thursdays at 4:00 pm next AY.

Interest in changing time by raising of hands gives GCEC some guidance.

Change date and time: 14

Keep current date and time: 12

### ***New Business***

Proposal to remove Article II, sections 5 and 6 and Article IV, section 6, A. vs. concerning summer curriculum from GC Bylaws <http://www.utoledo.edu/graduate/files/GC%20Bylaws%2011.29.2016.pdf>.

Due to lack of time, this discussion move to next meeting.

### ***Adjournment***

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 1:57 pm.