

**Graduate Council Minutes  
February 25, 2020  
Main Campus, Rocket Hall 1530**

Present: Wissam AbbouAlaiwi, Brian Ashburner, Defne Apul, Toomer Avidor-Reiss, John Bossenbroek, Frank Calzonetti, Saurabh Chattopadhyay, Wendy Cochrane, Heather Conti, Christina Fitzgerald, Cyndee Gruden, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Terry Hinds, Andrea Kalinoski, Ken Kilbert, Anand Kunnathur, Abraham Lee, Song-Tao Liu, Sara Lundquist, Michael Mallin, Marcia McInerney, Nagalakshmi Nadiminty, Alisa Nammavong (GSA), Kelly Phillips, Penny Poplin Gosetti, Patricia Relue, Barry Scheuermann, Beth Schlemper, Martha Sexton, Ozcan Sezer, Ruslan Slutsky, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Steve Sucheck, Varun Vaidya, Jerry Van Hoy, Kandace Williams.

Absent: Daniel Georgiev, Geoffrey Rapp, Rebecca Schneider.

Excused: Timothy Brakel, Amanda Bryant-Friedrich.

Guests: Matt Schroeder, Mike Dennis, Svetlana Beltyukova, Connie Schall.  
GSA Graduate Research Award Recipients and non-GC Advisors: Dabiri Darya, Jason Huntley, Sushil Khanal, Joshua Otten, Jeanine Refsnider, Taylor Sasak, Ethel Tackie-Yarboi, Dominique Thomas, Brenden Tully.

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of were approved. The agenda was re-order to accommodate speaker, Mr. Matt Schroeder's schedule.

***Executive Reports***

**Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair Song-Tao Liu reported:

○ *Important Dates Spring 2020*

March 4 Dean Bryant-Friedrich's Annual Address to Graduate Faculty

March 17 Curriculum Deadline

March 24 Next Graduate Council Meeting

We will have two guests, a presentation on a new degree program proposal, Ph.D. in Humanities program and discussion on minors on campus.

April 7 Presentation on faculty behavior and University Assessment Committee.

○ *Above Average Credit Earned*

Dr. Liu noted that the GCEC discussed issues of students earning excessive/above average credit hours. Dr. Gruden noted that the State will not provide SSI after 174 total graduate credit hours. There are students who have earned more than that. Students should follow their plan of study taking classes for the degree. Only 90 is needed post-bachelors for a Ph.D. We understand that most students will earn more than 90 depending on their program's time to degree. Students should not spend a lot of time past their time to degree.

*Discussion:*

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss noted that when a student has two master's degrees, there will be significantly more hours earned before the Ph.D.

Dr. Cyndee Gruden agreed that sometimes students want to complete multiple degrees. However, UToledo is not unique in the regard that institutions are limited with their tuition dollars. We have to be looking for a real academic reason for student to be here within time to degree. There is no policy, but we do have to track tuition waiver dollars. We are looking at students who have too many hours and are asking programs about those situations. Wanting to make sure they are making progress toward their degree.

Dr. Avidor-Reiss asked at what stage a student can shift to 1 credit hour.

Dr. Gruden replied that if the student has financial aid, they must maintain half-time status. International students have other requirements. In summer, there are no requirements, so they do not have to be enrolled. If being paid on an assistantship, they have to be enrolled in 1 hour.

Dr. Avidor-Reiss suggested more information from Financial Aid.

Dr. Gruden responded that she is arranging a workshop with Financial Aid and has discussed with the associate deans the idea of having a presentation/discussion with Financial Aid at the beginning of the fall term. Financial literacy is important for our students.

Dr. Dan Hammel pointed out the 174 credit hours SSI is for Ohio. If out-of-state, it does not matter.

Dr. Gruden noted that newer students are less likely to get to extensive numbers and this is an academic evaluation. Students should have a clear path to make progress toward their degree. It is challenging but we ask you to cut back in summer if you can.

Chair Liu recommended that Council members reach out to COGS with exceptions. If this becomes a widespread issue or if a policy is needed, we will bring to GC for further discussion.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

On behalf of Dean Bryant-Friedrich who is not able to attend today's meeting, Dr. Cyndee Gruden brought up the following item before providing her presentation on Graduate Student Wellness from COGS Student Affairs.

○ *Co-Listed Courses*

Co-listed courses (example, 5000/7000) require unique learning outcomes and must have at least one different outcome and at least one different assessment. It is highlighted on the syllabus template. It seems that some submitters are still struggling with this. 5000/6000 are masters and 7000/8000 are doctoral level. 5000 are more foundational and 6000 are seminar or more advanced courses. Please get word out on that. It is highlighted on syllabus template.

○ *Spring 2020 Commencement*

Saturday, May 9, 2020, Glass Bowl

Undergraduate Ceremony at 10 am  
Graduate Ceremony at 3 pm  
No Commencement Speaker

○ *Graduate Student Wellness*

Attached PowerPoint presentation addresses the importance of graduate student wellness and mental health and provides information and resources to aid in addressing this important topic:

- *Wellness*
- *UToledo Resources*
- *Administrative Resources*
- *Student Behavior – Student Code of Conduct*

***New Business***

Discussion on and vote on the updated Graduate Student Academic Grievance policy 3364-77-02

Chair Song Tao Liu stated that this revised policy has been endorsed by the GC Academic Programs and Regulations Committee and by the GCEC. He asked for discussion or concerns. There were none.

***[Motion to approve. Seconded. Unanimous vote in favor of the policy.]***

Research and Sponsored Programs Update

Dr. Frank Calzonetti, Vice President of Research reported that following UToledo's hosting national lab day in the fall, they have expressed as much interest in working with us as we do them. There is opportunity for graduate students and take advantage of this collaboration.

February 28<sup>th</sup> is the deadline for materials for outstanding recognition of scholarly and creative activity. A reception will be held at the president's house in April (every other year). The alternate year it is for grants where we work with the University Library in identifying journal articles. Assistance is needed in identifying if monograph or performance or work of art.

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Ms. Alisa Nammavong, President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

○ *February General Assembly Meeting*

Invited several graduate student-based student organizations to attend and share their mission statements and why graduate students should join. With the rise of graduate student organizations, GSA feels there will be a need to re-structure to make sure these student organizations are aware of the GSA and its resources as well as connecting so we may all better serve our population.

○ *Executive Board Elections*

- Will be announced at March General Assembly meeting
- Nomination period will open from March 16<sup>th</sup>-27<sup>th</sup>
- Election Voting period will be from April 6<sup>th</sup>-10<sup>th</sup>
- Please encourage students that may be interested

We understand the concern is balancing GSA and lab/TA/RA/other roles but also have proven year after year that this is possible and a great means to explore leadership and advocacy!

- *Student Mentor Relationships with Dr. Daryl Moorhead*  
Seeking students who have experience working with surveys to become active in developing and managing a survey that will explore student and faculty mentorship relationships at UToledo.
- *SICH*  
Resuming monthly meetings with Leanna Glick, Student Health Insurance Plan Administrator.
- *Midwest Graduate Research Symposium*  
Looking for contributions with only Engineering having contacted us thus far. All registration links are open including for graduate students volunteers.

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### **Finance and Budget Situation at UToledo**

Mr. Matt Schroeder, Executive Vice President for Finance and Administration and CFO presented FY 20 budget update on the academic side of house using a fiscal approach to budgeting (referring to PowerPoint slides). This presentation was given at Faculty Senate too. Below are highlights:

#### ***FY 20 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT***

Break down to sources and use of those dollars. Tuition and fees are largest sources of revenue. Faculty Senate asked how we determine where we will end up FY 21. From budget development, we will reach out to Jim Anderson for undergraduate enrollment and to COGS for graduate enrollment. From the budget side, we look at funds coming in, graduation, retention and collections. How many students show up and paid bill in totality.

Resources through university indexes. At the undergraduate level, we see transparency with merit aid via the scholarship matrix. \$55 million at the undergraduate level and up to \$67 million with graduate as it relates to spending. With our discounting practices from our retail price to just around 50% at the undergraduate level. Other than Wright State University, we are the second most affordable. With net tuition around \$4600-\$4700, we are the leader. BGSU is around \$7,100 with discounting. Financial Aid is the lowest hanging fruit, so any reductions need to be made in a way that is thoughtful and does not impact enrollment. We want to grow our tuition revenue. If we don't grow our way out, we have to focus on net tuition revenue. It is a straightforward model, however, there are political roadblocks.

Dr. Dan Hammel suggested the possibility of further cutting the discount.

Dr. Samir Hefzy asked when the State will allow for an increase of undergraduate tuition.

Mr. Matt Schroeder replied that the current biennium budget effective July 1<sup>st</sup> allows for a 2% increase for continuing undergraduate students. However, we have already pledged that current students in cohorts 1 and 2 would not receive a tuition change. The two cohorts that came in this fall, saw an increase of 2%, coupled with 1.5% this time. We engaged with COGS too late last year that put them at a disadvantage, so my team has pledged to get out in front with COGS.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss suggested that Utoledo's affordability be advertised on area billboards.

Mr. Matt Schroeder responded that we used that marketing strategy in 2007-2008-2009. It is a struggle to balance value vs. price.

#### *SSI*

Is based on several factors including FTE, graduation, and 32 different formulas. \$1.5 billion budget statewide. UToledo captures about 1% of that. In FY '20, we looked at various factors and due to the fact that the State increased the pie by 2.1%, we stood to pick up more. We picked up more tangible dollars but lost overall share. We are doing everything we can to retain and graduate students as other Ohio institutions are doing. We are all competing for these dollars and must do it well. Because the pie is large, a loss of 10 points, is large.

#### *COMPENSTATION*

There are 5 collective bargaining agreements, 6 with Law. Additionally, we budgeted for PSA and for overload and part-time instruction. The deans and chairs have done a nice job managing part-time instruction.

#### *OPERATING EXPENSES*

Affiliated with medical school, this year's operating budget is \$40 million.

Dr. Patty Relue inquired about consideration of different discounting sources. Part of subsidy is graduation. Can be low with teacher to student ratio.

Mr. Matt Schroeder responded that there is merit aid, however, for example Dean Lewandowski indicated that the average GPA in Nursing is already 3.8. At the graduate level, there are some programs with more applications than there are slots, Physical Therapy for example PT, that we need to consider how to better manage.

#### *CONTINGENCY*

The contingency fund is \$4.5 million, within the general fund, which is just over 1% of general fund, for use in the event of an emergency.

Our greatest asset and resource is human capital which accounts for 80% of the budget.

There are some variables such attrition that typically play out each semester. We are also looking how summer plays out too, will miss the mark by \$2.7 million.

Dr. Varun Vaidya asked how other funds in addition to the general fund (academic), such auxiliary funds from room and board and parking and from then the hospital that are rolled up on a consolidated basis. This is where the College of Medicine and Life Science lands, which is separate from UTMC.

Mr. Matt Schroeder replied that we are presently off budget about \$2.7 million. The Institutional Aid budget at \$63 million is over by \$4 million dollars. Those two lines drove the need for a mid-year adjustment. The last time we did across the board mid-year adjustment was 2016. We thought we took a conservative approach, but being down 522 students has had a material impact.

Dr. Saurabh Chattopadhyay stated that grants, gifts and contracts were only \$4 million.

Mr. Matt Schroeder stated that around \$13 million.

Dr. Frank Calzonetti added that research dollars for FY 19 was north of \$47M. FY 20 is at \$55M for total expenditure.

Mr. Matt Schroeder continued that budget development for FY 21 will take into account, enrollment, net tuition revenue, and weaning on dependence on institutional aid. If students select UToledo in part for its price, they will see the cost and the available aid.

Dr. Sami Hefzy inquired about transfers.

Mr. Matt Schroeder replied that anytime dollars move from index to index, that is a transfer. There are thousands of transfers. On debt service in 2018 we did our last refinancing of debt which has driven down interest payments for the next 5 years. Those refinance have helped. Some debt will retire.

#### *FINANCE*

Regarding graduate enrollment, Dr. Marcia McInerney agreed that Finance has to engage with COGS sooner. Finance can indicate historical data and trends and enrollment drives what we are going to do. As it relates to COGS and which programs should be up or down, those are key data points we need from the colleges. Our approach is to be fiscally conservative and with Provost come up with reasonable assumption.

Mr. Matt Schroeder stated that the Deans have indicated they would rather take some off during the development stage rather than a mid-year adjustment.

Dr. Marcia McInerney stated that colleges got a 20% cut on tuition waiver revenue and if that were coupled an increase graduate budget of 2% or 3%, we will be in big holes.

Mr. Matt Schroeder indicated that she was referencing the October 2018 adjustment in FY 19. He stated that he would love for the university to be in the position where enrollment outpaces budget. If we see growth in enrollment, we will work find additional aid to meet the needs of increased student population. In budget development, we have to look at all of these areas and some are unfavorable:

- Enrollment
- Tuition and Fees
- Institution Aid/Discounting
- Salary Recapture
- Cash Flow

Dr. Dan Hammel asked if there is a deadline for possible adjustments to discounting this year.

Mr. Matt Schroeder replied that the president would like the university accessible and continuing to fight the good fight with an impact on discounting now or fall 2021.

Dr. Patty Relue pointed out that financial aid is different for undergraduate and graduate students and that they should be evaluated in independent models.

Mr. Matt Schroeder replied that we are having those conversations. In COGS FY 19, graduate fee waiver support was north of \$13 million and undergraduate support was \$55.1 million. We realize that on the graduate level, there are programs where we need to underwrite. On the undergraduate level, we have more flexibility.

**Recognition of GSA Research Award Recipients**

Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Associate Dean for Academic and Student Affairs, COGS, stated that COGS is proud to support and oversee the administration and award process of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) graduate research awards. The awards ranging from \$1848 to \$2047 provide financial support for costs associated with approved research projects. She was pleased to introduce this year’s recipients for formal recognition by the Graduate Council, on behalf of the graduate faculty. Those present came forward along with their advisors, introducing themselves and briefly stating the type of research they are working on. Due to schedule conflicts, the following were unable to attend: Gayatri Subramanian and Dr. Isaac Shiefer.

STUDENT	PROGRAM AND COLLEGE	GRADUATE ADVISOR
<b>Brenden Tully</b>	MSBS, Medical Microbiology and Immunology MEDICINE AND LIFE SCIENCES	Dr. Jason Huntley
<b>Ethel Tackie-Yarboi</b>	PhD, Medicinal Chemistry PHARMACY AND PHARMACEUTICAL SCIENCES	Dr. Isaac <a href="#">Shiefer</a>
<b>Dominique Thomas</b>	MSBS, Oral Biology (Dentistry) MEDICINE AND LIFE SCIENCES	Dr. <a href="#">Dabiri</a> Darya
<b>Sushil Khanal</b>	Ph.D Biology, Cell and Molecular NATURAL SCIENCES AND MATHEMATICS	Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss
<b>Taylor Sasak</b>	MS Biology, Ecology and Organismal Biology NATURAL SCIENCES AND MATHEMATICS	Dr. John Bossenbroek
<b>Joshua Otten</b>	Ph.D Biology, Ecology and Organismal Biology NATURAL SCIENCES AND MATHEMATICS	Dr. Jeanine <a href="#">Refsnider</a>
<b><a href="#">Gayatri Subramanian</a></b>	PhD Biomedical Science, Medical Microbiology and Immunology MEDICINE AND LIFE SCIENCES	Dr. <a href="#">Surabh</a> Chattopadhyay

***Standing Committee Reports***

**Report of the Curriculum Committee**

On behalf of the Curriculum Committee, Co-Chair, Dr. Ozcan Sezer reviewed the committee’s report. All proposals were approved by the committee. He noted that he had communicated with Dr. Ben Stroud and Dr. Sara Lundquist in English and received the requested updated syllabi for #137 ENGL 5660. The committee had recommended all for approval except #135 ENGL 5440 while pending submission of correct syllabi. Dr. Dan Hammel indicated he would check.

Council unanimous approved of all proposals except not #135.

Dr. Sezer apprised Council that there will be a lot of proposals for review at the next Council meeting.

GCCC / PROPOSALS / #134-#152 / FEB-14-2020 || SORTED BY COLLEGE || (Total of 19 Proposals)

# Number	Proposal Type	College	Department/School/Program	Title	Course Number	Summary	COMMENTS by GCC
134	CCR	AR	English Language and Literature	American Fiction 20th and 21st Century	ENGL 5280	course modification	<i>The question asked: Are two additional learning outcomes sufficient to distinguish the course, under vs. graduate?</i>
135	CCR	AR	English Language and Literature	British Literature The 20th and 21st Centuries	ENGL 5440	course modification	Undergrad and grad Learning outcomes are identical. Need to distinguish and submit the revised syllabus (!)
136	NCP	AR	English Language and Literature	Literature of the British Empire, Beginnings to 1850	ENGL 5550	new course	<i>The question asked: Are two additional learning outcomes sufficient to distinguish the course, under vs. graduate?</i>
137	CCR	AR	English Language and Literature	African American Literature n the 20th and 21st Century	ENGL 5660	course modification	Undergrad and grad Learning outcomes are identical. Need to distinguish and submit the revised syllabus (!)
138	PCR	MD	Surgery	Clinical Research_new concentration to existing program	NA	new concentration to existing program	No conflict with catalog
139	CCR	MD	Surgery	Leadership in Health Care	SURG 6010	new course	No conflict with catalog
140	CCR	MD	Surgery	Medical Research, Simulation, Innovation and Education	SURG 6020	Cew course	No conflict with catalog
141	CCR	MD		Current Problems and Research Approaches in Proteins	BMSP 6330	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
142	CCR	MD		Current Problems and Research Approaches in Cell Membranes	BMSP 6360	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
152	CCR	MD		Methods in Biomedical Sciences	BMSP 6380	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
143	NPP	NU	Nursing	Graduate Certificate_Adult Gerontology Acute Care Nurse Practitioner Program	NU-xxxx-CER	New Graduate Certificate	No conflict with catalog
144	NCP	NU	Nursing	Acute Care Nurse Practitioner Clinical I	NURS 6240	New course proposal	No conflict with catalog
145	NCP	NU	Nursing	Acute Care Nurse Practitioner Clinical II	NURS 6430	New course proposal	No conflict with catalog
146	NCP	NU	Nursing	Acute Care Nurse Practitioner Clinical III	NURS 6440	New course proposal	No conflict with catalog



147	CCR	EN	Chemical and Environmental Eng	Chemical Engineering Project	CHEE 6920	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
148	CCR	EN	Chemical and Environmental Eng	Masters Graduate Research and Thesis	CHEE 6960	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
149	CCR	EN	Chemical and Environmental Eng	Graduate Engineering Internship	CHEE 6970	Course modification	No conflict with catalog
150	CCR	EN	Chemical and Environmental Eng	Doctoral Graduate Research and Dissertation	CHEE 8960	course modification	No conflict with catalog
151	CCR	CE	Educational Studies	Master's Capstone Seminar	HED 6980	Course modification	No conflict with catalog

Report of the Membership Committee

On behalf of the Membership Committee, Dr. Connie Schall reviewed the committee's summary report.

COLLEGE	Total Applications rec'd	Applications Rec'd/Approved by Category					# Approved as Applied	# Approved in Diff. Category	# Pending	# Apps Internal	# Apps External	# Apps -- Renewal	# Apps -- New	# Apps -- Change
		Full	Associate	Professional	Adjunct	Special								
Arts and Letters (AR)	1			0/1	1/0	0	1		1		1			
Business and Innovation (BU)	0													
Education (CE)	1				1/1	1			1		1			
Engineering (EN)	3	2/1			1/2	2	1		3			2	1	
Health and Human Services (HHS)	0													
Honors														
Law														
Libraries														
Medicine and Life Sciences (MD)	7	6/5			1/1	6		1	6	1	2	3	2	
Natural Sciences and Mathematics (SM)	6	1/1			5/5	6			3	3	2	3	1	
Nursing (NU)														
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences (PH)														
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>9/7</b>		<b>1/2</b>	<b>8/8</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>4</b>	

**Old Business**

None.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:00 p.m.