

**Graduate Council Minutes
April 7, 2020
Virtual Meeting via WebEx**

Present: Wissam AbbouAlaiwi, Brian Ashburner, Defne Apul, Tomer Avidor-Reiss, John Bossenbroek, Timothy Brakel, Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Frank Calzonetti, Wendy Cochrane, Heather Conti, Raina Dawson (GSA), Christina Fitzgerald, Daniel Georgiev, Cyndee Gruden, Daniel Hammel, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Terry Hinds, Andrea Kalinoski, Ken Kilbert, Anand Kunnathur, Abraham Lee, Song-Tao Liu, Sara Lundquist, Michael Mallin, Marcia McInerney, Nagalakshmi Nadiminty, Kelly Phillips, Penny Poplin Gosetti, Patricia Relue, Barry Scheuermann, Beth Schlemper, Rebecca Schneider, Martha Sexton, Ozcan Sezer, Ruslan Slutsky, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Steve Sucheck, Varun Vaidya, Jerry Van Hoy.

Absent: Alisa Nammavong (GSA), Kandace Williams.

Excused: Saurabh Chattopadhyay.

Guests: David Giovannucci, Alana Malik, Holly Monsos, Allison Spencer.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. So that Council has sufficient time to review the Draft Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of January 28, 2020, comments may be sent by 5 pm on April 8th to Song-Tao Liu and Terri Hayes. If there are no changes, we will assume you are in favor.

Executive Reports

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

On behalf of Graduate Council, Dr. Song-Tao Liu reported

- *Curriculum Committee Report*
Comments and/or concerns should be sent to Chair Song-Tao Liu or Ms. Terri Hayes by 5 pm on April 8th. This will allow additional time to review the committee's extensive report. If no changes or objections, we will assume in favor and will make the voting process easier.
- *Remote Learning*
This unusual time has created some chaos. Chair Liu sent an email to thanks to the administration for faculty to switching to online delivery of classes. The Provost, Dean Bryant-Friedrich and Vice President for Research have echoed the need for faculty to be flexible. We do not want to lose students, especially in this difficult time.
- *GCEC Meeting March 31, 2020*
Reviewed revisions to the Transfer of Credit to Graduate Degree policy 3364-77-06 and the new Graduate Student Short Term Leave of Absence policy 3364-77-xx. One being reviewed by committee is Transfer Credit. We send feedback to them and hopefully still have a chance to vote on this by the end of the semester.

- *College Rep Elections to Graduate Council 2020-2021*
College elections should be underway for representatives to Graduate Council. Associate Deans are encouraged to help with this process as the last meeting of the academic year is May 5th where the election of officers for next AY takes place.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

- *Graduate Student Degree Progression and Wellness*
Faculty should continue to communicate with their student to assess degree progression as our graduate students work hard to meet their milestones. We need to make sure they are staying on track as best they can and are comfortable in this environment. COGS distributed guidelines on remote exams. Continue to facilitate degree progression through remote oral and written examinations and continue to help students meet milestones. Questions may be addressed to Dean Bryant-Friedrich or Associate Dean Gruden. The more guidance they receive, the better off they will be.

Students on grant funding must remain engaged in their projects as we have an obligation to our funding agencies. They need to continue to receive the funding and work. We are requesting your help to help them remain focused on projects and doing what they can. Making sure resources are available as much as possible. Reach out to let us know if we can further support you or your students.

International graduate students currently at UToledo are having a difficult time. If you have some working with you on projects, reach out to them to check how they are doing, that they are eating, have a place to stay and are healthy. The survey data coming in to the Provost's office indicates they are dealing with food insecurity, housing issues and issues with general well-being. We have to keep in touch with program directors. Let us know if we can help get them support.

Consideration of starting international graduate students online. Embassies are closed which means obtaining visas is not possible. International students are concerned with what will happen for fall as there will be a backlog of interviews. Discussions are occurring to determine viability for international students to begin their programs online while in their home countries. We are not certain what that will look like from a funding model. If you have suggestions for us to consider, let me know. Not every student in every country has the ability to have internet in every home and this is not always possible, even in U.S. Feedback is appreciated.

- *CAS Admissions*
Continuing with implementation of integration of CAS with banner. Continuing to discuss implementation of Business, Engineering and GradCAS.
- *Budget*
Summer 2020 –Currently
Minimize expenditures while maintaining stipends for graduate students. Will need to minimize tuition spend. If students do not have to take courses during the summer, this should be limited.

All courses online for summer. Graduate students are usually engaged in research during summer.

Many programs have a very limited number of didactic courses. Students who are fulfilling research and teaching responsibilities will be required to register for the minimal amount of credit hours feasible. Feasibility should take student loan and visa restrictions into consideration. Exceptions for these reasons will require verification through the submission of supportive documentation.

Fall 2020

The final budget for COS has not been provided. Budget hearings with the Provost will begin shortly. When we have those numbers, programs and colleges will be provided final budgets. To complicate matters, as we were going through budget preparations, the pandemic occurred. Due to the expected decline in revenue the budget will be cut further. Expect reductions in your allocations. This is a new reality. How are we doing to deal with this, we will need to talk about here.

Considerations:

Admit Students

- Continue to admit students.
- We generate revenue by SSI. There are paying students that should not be left lingering. They need to be admitted when eligible.
- Admission is not tied to funding. Send them the right message that you want to admit them.

Offer Letters

- Official offer letters are the only ones we can look at as the binding agreement between UToledo and the student.
- Will include language that the offer depends on available funding. A lot of institutions are putting this language in the offer letter. Office of Legal Affairs is looking at language.
- Because we will have limited dollars, we have to prioritize. Ph.D students need to be in labs where they're needed as a workforce. If we don't admit them, we won't have them going forward.
- Want to maintain staffing for teaching. Looking carefully at utilization. Labs, lectures, recitation, supplemental instruction. Continuing TAs and GAs a priority. If we feel we have to move continuing onto funding, we need justification.

Zero Credit Hour Course

- We are working with the Provost Office to develop a zero credit hour course. There are COVID related situations in which students cannot finish their work to continue progress toward degree. For example, they cannot get into labs to gather data or work with human subjects or interviews. A zero credit hour course option provides a way to keep them enrolled at UToledo. Looking at how far it is going to reach and what students it will reach and what assessment would look like.

Discussion:

Tim Brakel stated that health insurance is necessary for students in Nursing, Pharmacy, Medicine and Life Sciences, who may be on the front lines in healthcare.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if he has heard of any issues.

Tim Brakel replied that it was mentioned in meeting with the Provost.

Wissam AbbouAlaiwi noted that his program had sent admission letters to five graduate students, domestic and international, and those letters did not have commitment regarding tuition and stipend. Are there any plans to prioritize domestic admissions?

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that domestic students cannot be prioritized over international as far as funding is concerned. Any offers made before and accepted, we will have to honor those. If we run out of funding, we will have to figure out how to address.

Samir Hefzy asked if departments can make offers with the statement that includes 'depending on availability of funds'?

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that the Office of Legal Affairs is looking at language and will state it is contingent on available funding. We expect the language to be finalized soon, hopefully within a week. Then you can make those offers. Make sure students are admitted too!

Research and Sponsored Programs Update

Dr. Frank Calzonetti, Vice President of Research reported that he and Dean Bryant-Friedrich have been discussing charging tuition on grant proposals and are working on the details. We are not doing yet, but need to make sure it is consistent across institutions and funding agencies, so that we follow federal government uniform requirements. We will identify a future effective date. UToledo is an outlier in this practice as most universities do charge tuition on grant proposals.

Feedback from faculty already is that it is better to get a post doc rather than a GA. That is not necessarily good for graduate programs. We ask them to do their best to bring in graduate students. The Research Office is in the business and processing grants and awards and continues to be very busy doing that work.

We have sent out a number of memos only essential personnel to be in labs working on critical research, COVID 19 research, or critical maintenance of research. Graduate students may come in for this type of research but are not required nor can we require them to do so. If they can't come in to the lab, they should work on data, paper analysis or other.

Tomer Avidor-Reiss stated that from the research point of view if faculty need to finish the student for higher cost than post doc, administration has to think about ways to encourage faculty.

Frank Calzonetti noted that there should be a desire for strong programs from the deans and chairs, and graduate faculty and COGS Dean. The University does not want to see a wholesale switch over of graduate students to post docs on grant programs.

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Ms. Raina Dawson, Vice President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported that nominations for GSA Officers have closed. Next General Assembly meeting will be April 21st. There is no update on student health insurance at this time.

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Ms. Raina Dawson, Vice President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported that nominations for GSA Officers have closed. Next General Assembly meeting will be April 21st. There is no update on student health insurance at this time.

Information and Discussion Items

Updates to the institution's curriculum mapping project; and draft definition of 'co-curricular

Dr. Alana Malik, University Assessment Director and Ms. Holly Monsos, chair of the University Assessment Committee presented an update on current projects within UAC; curriculum mapping and defining 'co-curricular'. This PowerPoint will be posted on the Graduate Council website.

Holly Monsos explained that the UAC asked academic programs to focus on developing a curriculum map this year instead of submitting their annual assessment report. Due to the current pandemic, the curriculum mapping submission deadline has been extended from end of April to September 15th.

If you are not familiar with the curriculum mapping project, please contact us to discuss with your program. The goal of the curriculum mapping project is to better align curriculum design with defined assessment measures, resulting in a more useful and practical assessment process. Holly is chairing the criterion 4 team for the institution's Higher Learning Commission's (HLC) assurance argument, which is about assessment. The completed curriculum maps will be used as evidence for this section of the HLC report.

The second update from the UAC is the development of a definition of the term 'co-curricular.' Feedback from the 2016 HLC visit indicated a need for the institution to improve its assessment of co-curricular learning. The HLC also recently acknowledged that many institutions often struggle to understand what functional areas of the institution are to be included under the umbrella term, and encourages individual colleges and universities to define the term to best meet their individual needs. Examples of offices offering co-curricular learning at UT would include areas under Student Affairs, the Center for International Students and Programs, libraries, and the Learning Enhancement Center. Examples of specific co-curricular programs, including program learning outcomes aligned with institutional learning outcomes and sample assessment measures were shared.

New Interdisciplinary doctoral program, PhD in the Public Humanities

Dr. Ammon Allred, Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies, and chair of the new innovative interdisciplinary doctoral program in Public Humanities presented the program structure and benefits (see attached PowerPoint for full presentation).

The presentation addressed:

- What Are the Public Humanities
- We Need the Public Humanities in 2020
- Areas of Focus
- Course of Study and Practicum
- Strengths of Public Humanities at UToledo
- Careers in the Public Humanities

Interdisciplinary humanities has relevance in engaging with the general community particularly doing the present time of readjusting how we live and address public health interactions and productions. The aim is to work with faculty in multiple departments on the interdisciplinary tracks. The dissertation will have a narrow focus.

The course of study has includes about ¼ of electives. Students are introduced to the idea of public humanities in public context. The tools specific are more specific doing public scholarship compared to more traditional forms. At the center, is a two-semester practicum.

Work done in public humanities broadly working with institutions that already have good collaborative relationships with Utoledo, such as the Ability Center, TMA, and other organizations that have a public human footprint. Students engage in a project during the third year.

Why Public Humanities at UT?

We have a lot of endowed professors working in programs that emphasize interdisciplinary studies. They are already doing important work and building on graduate resources we offer. Still hopeful students can enroll in 2020-2021, but here is what we are envisioning.

What do folks with this PhD do?

It is a relatively new field. NYU is also starting a program in 2020-2021 and is looking for more folks who can do doctoral level work who have interesting relationships with humanities and media. Concordia works with practicing artists and ways they do public art. And university administration positions.

Questions and Discussion with Dr. Ammon Allred

Q: Are Arts involved?

A: Yes, we have a lot of faculty in the arts who are humanists, such as Ed Ligan and Matthew Foss in Theatre and Film. Although the core faculty are in the humanities, we look forward to working with art faculty too.

Q: Would this be related to health outcomes and the study of culture and taking specific types of drugs?

A: Public Health would be interested in the systems of health practices and medicine regimes, how do doctoral and public health image interact and impact with communities. Race, gender ethnicity enters into that.

Q: What is the culminating experience, the outcome of the Ph.D?

A: It is addressed in the program requirements document. The expectation is that the dissertation would be the culminating experience. The practicum is research done in advance of the dissertation. As the program develops, the form the dissertation takes develops. We envisioning that would be a normative assumption. New knowledge within the Ph.D. would be utilized to discuss the new knowledge within the community.

Dr. Cyndee Gruden explained that this type of information will be helpful in meeting the outcome requests of CCGS. She will forward comments and examples to Ammon Allred.

Q: Does UToledo have a masters in this program? How many student applications are anticipated?

A: We do not have a master's. The proposal is to admit students with a masters in a humanities. We have other masters in humanities we can build off of. As to interest in the program, we have talked to folks who have public humanities/strong public focus backgrounds, and they see 40-80 applications per year. We anticipate classes of four early on. Folks in broader UToledo community have contacted me. We do have senior faculty that will work well with program and who have been contacted by undergrads and community members for a Ph.D.

Q: Due to financial strains, what are sources of financing for this program for four to five students in a year?

A: The financial impact should be low. It is going to depend on university. Our hope these students will do teaching assistantships and do work an adjunct would do. Although it is a relatively new area, Mellon and others have interest in funding them and we are going to be reaching out to places like Mellon for funding opportunities. There are ways we could talk about working with other cultural institutions in the area. For the class of four, we would be asking for TA ship/tuition waivers. Looking for educators in the area, theatre arts and education that need to be doing continuing education.

Standing Committee Reports

Report of the Curriculum Committee

Due to the lengthy report of the Curriculum Committee, GC Chair, Dr. Song-Tao Liu requested that any comments or concerns be sent to him and Terri Hayes by 5:00 p.m. on April 8th, otherwise the vote is for the proposals.

On behalf of the Curriculum Committee, Co-Chair, Dr. Ozcan Sezer reviewed the committee's report that was separated into three parts (see full report attached).

Part 1: #153 - #203 are new proposals.

Part 2: #39 - #60 were old proposals that had outstanding questions/syllabi to be provided, which has been done.

Part 3: #61 - #91 were left over proposals from November, most of which were from the College of Nursing and taken care of by electronic voting in December. The remaining ones are those we are cleaning up and include my comments.

Chair Song-Tao Liu asked Dr. Ozcan Sezer if any proposals need to be withheld or whether all are ready for GC vote.

Ozcan Sezer replied that Dr. Cyndee Gruden is aware of a few proposals with comments and they will be taken care of. He thanked the committee members who did a lot of work in a short amount of time and is grateful to them.

Barring no questions, comments and concerns should be emailed by 5:00 p.m. tomorrow, April 8th.

Dr. Ozcan Sezer stated that there are additional proposals that were submitted by the March 17th deadline for catalog entry and that those proposals will be brought forward for GC review.

The proposals were too numerous for review in one batch.

Dr. Ozcan Sezer also mentioned that it appears that Education re-entered their old proposals into the new system CIM.

Dr. Rebecca Schneider replied that the proposals that were sent back from the Curriculum Committee to the Judith Herb College of Education in the fall, were put in the new system along with additional new proposals this spring.

For GCCC VOTE/ PROPOSALS / #153-203 / April-06-2020								
College Representatives Responses are under "Comments" Column (Total of 51 Proposals)								
# Number	Proposal Type	College	Department/ School/ Program	Title	Course Number	Summary	COMMENTS	
1	157	CCR	AR	Economics	Population Economics	ECON 5050	course change request	
2	158	CCR	AR	Economics	Labor Economics	ECON 5250	course change request	
3	159	CCR	AR	Economics	Behavioral Economics	ECON 5260	course change request	
4	160	CCR	AR	Economics	Health Economics	ECON 5750	course change request	
5	161	CCR	AR	Geography and Planning	Remote Sensing of the Environment	GEPL 5490	course change request	
6	187	CCR	AR	World Languages and Cultures	Teaching Colloquia	FLAN 5160	course change request	
7	188	NCP	AR	Theatre and Film	Administration and Management of the Arts	THR 5250	new course proposal.	
8	189	NCP	AR	Theatre and Film	Promoting the Visual and Performing Arts	THR 5260	new course proposal.	
9	153	PCR	BU	Information Operations and Technology Mgmt	Applied Business Analytics MS	BU-ABAN-MS	A required course that is offered under the special topics name will be offered under its own name. Hence the required special topics course is replaced by the same course under its own name.	
10	191	CCR	EN	Bioengineering	Bioengineering Project	BIOE 6920	course change request	
11	192	CCR	EN	Bioengineering	Bioengineering Research and Thesis Masters	BIOE 6960	course change request	
12	193	NCP	EN	Bioengineering	Graduate Engineering Internship	BIOE 6970	new course proposal	
13	194	CCR	EN	Electrical Eng and Computer Science	Projects	EECS 5920	course change request	
14	195	CCR	EN	Electrical Eng and Computer Science	Masters Graduate Research and Thesis	EECS 6960	course change request	
15	196	NCP	EN	Electrical Eng and Computer Science	Graduate Engineering Internship	EECS 6970	new course proposal	

16	197	CCR	EN	Electrical Eng and Computer Science	Dissertation	EECS 8960	course change request	
17	198	CCR	EN	Mechanical, Industrial and Mfg Eng.	Special Projects	MIME 6920	course change request	
18	199	CCR	EN	Mechanical, Industrial and Mfg Eng.	Graduate Research and Thesis	MIME 6960	course change request	
19	200	CCR	EN	Mechanical, Industrial and Mfg Eng.	Dissertation	MIME 8960	course change request	
20	201	NCP	EN	Mechanical, Industrial and Mfg Eng.	Graduate Engineering Internship	MIME 6970	new course proposal	
21	202	PCR	EN	Chemical Engineering	Chemical Engineering MS	EN-CHME-MS	program change request	
22	203	PCR	EN	Chemical Engineering	Chemical Engineering PhD	EN-ENGR-PHD	program change request	

23	154	PCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Masters in Athletic Training	HH-PATR-MAT	Program Change Revision. Increase credits to 55 (previously 54).	No concerns. Explanation is clear.
24	164	PCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Physical Therapy, Doctorate	HH-PHYT-DPT	Program Modification	No concerns.

25	165	CCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Special Topics in PT	PHYT 6720	course change request	When I read the course change, (1) Lecture change from 0 to 15. Is that supposed to be 1 for hours or does that mean 15 contact hrs which is what is on the syllabus (1 hr class x 15 weeks = 15 lecture contact hrs). (2) In the explanation it reads, This course will be reduced by one credit hour due to the addition of three new courses that have been approved: Medical Screening, Advanced Ther Exercise, and Medical Imaging. This has resulted in a reduction of the breadth and depth of this special topic course. What it needs to say isThis course will be reduced by one credit hour, however due to changes last year in the program and the addition and approval of three new courses, the reduction of the breadth and depth of this special topic course was addressed in the other courses added last year.
26	166	CCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Professional Issues in Speech Language Pathology	SLP 6750	course change request	No concerns
27	167	CCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Adult Internship in Speech-Language Pathology	SLP 6940	course change request	No concerns
28	168	CCR	HH	Exercise and Rehabilitation Science	Pediatric Internship in Speech-Language Pathology	SLP 6941	course change request	No concerns

039	ECM	Network Theory and Educational Reform	TSOC 5100
040	ECM	Sociology of Education	TSOC 5200
041	ECM	Social Justice in American Society	TSOC 5210
042	ECM	Critical Responses to Deculturalization	TSOC 5230
043	ECM	Philosophy of Education	TSOC 5300
044	ECM	History of Education	TSOC 5400
045	ECM	Foundations of Peace Education	TSOC 5600
046	NCP	Professional Seminar in SPFE	TSOC 6100
047	ECM	School-State Relations	TSOC 6140
048	ECM	Anthropology of Education	TSOC 5500
049	ECM	Network Theory and Educational Reform	TSOC 7100
050	ECM	Sociology of Education	TSOC 7200
051	ECM	Social Justice in American Society	TSOC 7210
051A	ECM	Critical Responses to Deculturalization	TSOC 7230
052	ECM	Philosophy of Education	TSOC 7300
053	ECM	History of Education	TSOC 7400
054	ECM	Anthropology of Education	TSOC 7500
055	ECM	Foundations of Peace Education	TSOC 7600
056	NCP	Professional Seminar in SPFE	TSOC 8100
057	ECM	School-State Relations	TSOC 8140
058	PRR	PhD in Foundations of Education: Education Sociology (FEES)	
059	PRR	PhD in Foundations of Education: Philosophy of Education (FEPE)	
060	PRR	PhD in Foundations of Education: Foundations of Education (FOED)	

Report of the Membership Committee

On behalf of the Membership Committee, GC Vice Chair, Dr. Wendy Cochrane, presented the committee's summary report. The majority applied in correct category and committee working hard to make sure definitions are clear. 54 applications. 2 they moved to different categories with 3 pending still gathering information. For students needing committee members for summer, faculty should submit applications by April 20th for review by the end of the spring term. Questions may be directed to Svetlana Beltyukova and Connie Schall.

COLLEGE	Total Applications rec'd	Applications Rec'd/Approved by Category					# Approved as Applied	# Approved in Diff. Category	# Pending	# Apps Internal	# Apps External	# Apps -- Renewal	# Apps -- New	# Apps -- Change
		Full	Associate	Professional	Adjunct	Special								
Arts and Letters (AR)	9	6/5	1/0	1/1	0/1	1/0	6	1	2	9		7	1	1
Business and Innovation (BU)	1	1/1					1			1		1		
Education (CE)	7			1/1	3/3	3/3	7			1	6	1	6	
Engineering (EN)	7	3/3				4/4	7			4	3	2	5	
Health and Human Services (HHS)	1				1/1		1				1	1		
Honors														
Law														
Libraries														
Medicine and Life Sciences (MD)	12	10/9			1/1	1/2	12			12		1	9	2
Natural Sciences and Mathematics (SM)	16	10/9		1/1	3/3	2/2	14	1	1	13	3	12	2	2
Nursing (NU)														
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences (PH)	1					1/1	1			1		1		
TOTAL	54	30/27	1/0	3/3	8/9	12/12	49	2	3	41	13	26	23	5

Old Business

Dr. Patty Relue wished to advocate for supporting continuing GAs in summer who have been with programs.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich indicated she would have to discourage without prior approval, adding that if you cannot cover your labs, that request and information needs to be sent to her and to Ms. Mary Main.

In a situation where a student who was not previously covered and moved to a research assistantship from a grant, we would have to look at it to determine if we could fund that position.

Dr. Patty Relue noted that if the support is written into a grant, that institution pays the tuition.

Dr. Frank Calzonetti suggested that he, Dean Bryant-Friedrich, Dr. Patty Relue and Dr. Brian Ashburner have a conversation to further discuss.

Dr. Samir Hefzy inquired whether a student not previously supported becomes supported on a grant in summer, could enroll for 0 credit hours in summer?

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that a zero credit hour course is being developed, so she could not completely answer that question as we are obtaining guidance and working through this issue and parameters.

New Business

UToledo Minors on campus [webpage](#).

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:01 pm.