

**Graduate Council Minutes**  
**October 19, 2021**  
**Webex**

Present: Wissam AbouAlaiwi, Defne Apul, Brian Ashburner, Larissa Barclay, Sharon Barnes, Jonathan Bossenbroek, Saurabh Chattopadhyay, Madeline Clark, Wendy Cochrane, Heather Conti, Bashar Gammoh, David Giovannucci, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Heather Huntley, Marthe Howard, Ali Imami (GSA), Gary Insch, John Laux, Abraham Lee, James Ferris, Andrea Kalinoski, Ken Kilbert, Linda Lewin, Mike Mallin, Jeanine Refsnider, Jerry Van Hoy, Geoffrey Rapp, Patricia Relue, Connie Schall, Beth Schlemper, Martha Sexton, Rebecca Schneider, Zahoor Shah, Ruslan Slutsky, Ekaterina Shemyakova, Snejana Slantcheva-Durst, Jami Taylor, Amy Thompson, Kandace Williams.

Absent: Bindu Menon, Varun Vaidya.

Excused: Frank Calzonetti.

Guests: Svetlana Belyukova, Teri Green, Heather Huntley, Tim Mueser.

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order, roll was called and the Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of April 20, 2021 were approved.

***Executive Reports***

**Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair Dr. David Giovannucci, reminded Council members that any issues or concerns should be sent to him or anyone on the Executive Committee. He gave the following report:

- ***Standing Committees***  
Are completely populated. The Graduate Program Review Committee (GPRC) has not met in a while and will need to look at to discuss further. It will remain a standing committee for the time being before determination of whether to make it ad hoc or sunset. The Constitution and Bylaws Committee meets every few years to review and make updates as needed. Because of change in budgeting and possibly COGS, this will necessitate review for potential updates. Changes are brought to GC for review and vote. The Academic and Programs Regulations Committee (APRC) reviews policies that affect graduate education and graduate faculty. Dean Thompson sent a list of policies for graduate programs that need to be reviewed or are overdue to forward on to that committee chair, Dr. Geoffrey Rapp. We will work with Faculty Senate on any policies that overlap with them and I will speak with Dr. Rapp about scheduling communications with Faculty Senate and the APRC.

○ *Invitations for Presentations to Graduate Council*

Heather Huntley will give an update overview on the upcoming HLC site visit on November 8-9, 2021. Invitations have been extended to hear presentations on Program Review, Assessment and to Dr. LaFluer Small, the new Vice Provost Academic Administration and Faculty Affairs. She is an accomplished and engaging faculty member and is glad she will meet with us. We have invited the Provost to attend Council when there is more information to share on RCM budget progress.

○ *President Postel*

We have reached out to President Postel for regular standing meetings with the GCEC and GC each semester and are working with his office to arrange. This is new, not something we have not done in the past. President reached out to GCEC with request for nominees for Strategic Planning Committee.

President reached out to use for nominees for Strategic Planning Committee which will do under Information and Discussion items. We can put forth five names.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Amy Thompson, Senior Vice Provost of Academic Affairs and Acting Dean, College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

○ *COVID Update*

Covid Operations Team Meeting this morning. Within our state, we are seeing slight decline in cases. As of yesterday, there were under 3000 new cases in a day. In Lucas County there were 83 cases. Nationally, there was a significant decrease 122,,000 just yesterday. Still seeing a significant number of deaths at just under 1,900 in a day. On Campus we will report on our dashboard last week’s numbers of 41 cases on campus.

As we look forward vaccination rates, this is a representation of the number of those who have uploaded proof of vaccinations. We are at 58.2% of faculty, 49.3% of UTMC staff, roughly 70.7% of UT staff, and 55.6% of students for an overall average of 56.3%

**The University of Toledo**

**COVID Vaccination Rate**

UToledo Population	Reporting COVID Vaccines	Total Population	% Reporting COVID Vaccines
Faculty	1,171	2,013	58.2 %
UTMC Staff	1,033	2,097	49.3 %
UT Staff	1,181	1,670	70.7 %
Students	9,276	16,691	55.6 %
<b>Total</b>	<b>12,661</b>	<b>22,471</b>	<b>56.3 %</b>

Requirement as of October 15 that everyone would have their first vaccine or submit their exemption. Second vaccination should occur by November 15<sup>th</sup>. After that date, individuals who are not vaccinated and have an exemption, would be tested on a weekly basis. Hoping as we approach the deadline, that we will see increased numbers in vaccines.

Pfizer boosters are being offered, and should Moderna be approved by FDA and CDC shortly as expected, UToledo will be prepared to offer right away. It is expected there will be mix and match of boosters. More information should be coming. Also offering flu vaccine on campus. Also expect to be testing a significant number of students on campus, particularly if proof of vaccine is not uploaded. Asymptomatic testing is available in the lobby of Health and Human Services building on Main Campus. And, of course, symptomatic testing is available.

- *Strategic Enrollment and Student Success subgroup*  
We have held our second meeting. We will be talking about how to create pipeline programs, direct from high school admittance. Very excited in working with IR on disaggregated sets. We just received a 10-year trend for each graduate program and I will be talking with Dave Meredith on best way to make this information available to programs. We are focused on using data driven approaches. A representative from GC is still needed on this committee. Strategic growth planning will be started in those on meetings.
- *GA/TA Budget Allocation Process*  
There will be a call for proposals process for TA/GA allocations. Met with deans and associate deans to go over process for feedback. Discussed with GCEC. RFP did go out to deans. Due date is mid-November. Will be asking Chair Giovannucci for GC representation on this group. The goal is to have allocations made by December 17, 2021.

#### Report of the Vice President for Research

Dr. Calzonetti was unable to join GC today as he is working on a large grant proposal.

#### Report of the Graduate Student Association

On behalf of the Graduate Student Association, Ali Imami, President, reported:

- *Executive Board*  
Actively working on election for a full e-board.
- *Invonet*  
Have been able to integrate into INVONET. Capable of sending information to all graduate students without having to rely on anyone else.

#### ***Information and Discussion Items***

##### HLC Site Visit November 8-9, 2021

Heather Huntley, Assistant Vice Provost for Accreditation and Program Review, thanked Council for inviting her to give a brief update on the upcoming HLC site visit on November 8 and 9, 2021.

Although the schedule is not finalized, the format is confirmed and will be posted on <https://www.utoledo.edu/hlc/>. The full documents can be found here and the Executive Summary will be posted this week.

February 2012 was the last full comprehensive visit. They then moved to pathways and we were assigned the Standard Pathway.

HLC Comprehensive Evaluation Standard Pathway Timeline:

2012: Comprehensive visit, accreditation continued

2016: Mid-cycle visit under Standard Pathway  
Actionable goals associated with the Strategic Plan.

2017: Interim monitoring report  
In fall 2019, we had writing teams working on the documents throughout summer 2021, with fact checking in fall 2021 and submission last week.

2021: Comprehensive visit scheduled Nov. 8-9

HLC Changes

- Self-study versus assurance argument
- Move to online documentation/evidence files
- Student opinion survey
- Shortened timeline, shorter visit
- Federal compliance virtual review

Additional factors

- COVID
- Fall versus Spring visit

There are 5 Criteria areas for Accreditation:

1. MISSION

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations. Initially led by Dr. Laurie Dinnebeil prior to retirement and then by Dr. Flapp Cockrell before he finished his term.

2. INTEGRITY: ETHICAL AND RESPONSIBLE CONDUCT

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible. Led by Julie Quinonez.

3. TEACHING AND LEARNING: QUALITY, RESOURCES, AND SUPPORT

The institution provides quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered. Led by Dr. Diane Cappelletty in Pharmacy.

4. TEACHING AND LEARNING: EVALUATION AND IMPROVEMENT

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement. Led by Professor Holly Monsos.

5. INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS, RESOURCES AND PLANNING

The institution's resources, structures, processes and planning are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities. Led by Dr. Scott Molitor in Engineering.

Federal Compliance is led by Dave Cutri, Executive Director of Internal Auditing.

If contacted to meet with HLC, so that you feel comfortable and prepared, feel free to contact Heather Huntley with any questions or concerns. HLC is about continuous improvement and have not been punitive by past experience. Their goal is help us know what we are doing right and where to improve.

*Discussion:*

Q: How many site members will visit campus?

A: Six people to visit and will be posted on UToledo's HLC website tomorrow.

Q: Are syllabus checks with UToledo people scheduled or random?

A: Syllabus checks are part of the compliance piece and we have been contacting individuals already or pull the syllabus directly from the CIM system. HLC looks at syllabus for federal compliance, particularly so that the number of credit hours and amount of coursework coordinates and the times of course meeting. They might look at a course with a lot of credits that might meet once per week. We do not know who will meet with them yet. Once I know, will reach out to folks and provide as much guidance as I can.

Q: Are there specific items graduate faculty should be cognizant of during this visit?

A: They may want to know processes for evaluating new courses and programs including through the GC Curriculum Committee and the Graduate Council. Graduate Faculty have a vetting review process. Shared governance. They are looking at processes at the institution. If there are any concerns relating to Graduate Council and Graduate Faculty, will be happy to share and return to a Council meeting.

#### President's Strategic Plan Committee nominations

Chair Giovannucci sought names of five volunteers of which the President's Office will selected two to serve. He read the key initiatives of the Strategic Plan:

- Enrollment Growth,
- Partnership Opportunities,
- Institutional Effectiveness,
- Diversity, Equity and Inclusion,
- UTMC Partnering with UTPhysicians,
- Research Priorities,
- Specific aspects of Student Success,
- Investment Priorities,
- Development Goals,
- Integrate Support for Athletics, and
- Enhance our Image.

Graduate Council Volunteers:

- Dr. Jonathan Bossenbroek
- Dr. Jim Ferris
- Dr. Samir Hefzy

- Dr. Marthe Howard
- Dr. Beth Schlemper
- Dr. Jami Taylor

Expect that work will move quickly. Chair Giovannucci will forward the volunteer names to represent GC on this important committee and two will be selected. We are all very busy but nonetheless glad that the President reached out to our group and for your service.

#### Update on Policies

Chair Giovannucci provided an update on the status of policies, some of which are reaffirmations and others required corrections and/or updates. Our policy committee with work with Faculty Senate on the first two policies for a coordinated response.

- University Academic Dishonesty 3364-71-04  
Under review by Faculty Senate and for Graduate Council. Drs. Patty Relue and Geoffrey Rapp will assist in working on this document with Dr. Mike Dowd that is currently expansive but may be more concise.
- University Evaluation of Faculty Qualifications 3364-72-11  
Faculty Senate had made some additions to this policy, in response to what appears to be HLC requirements. Graduate Council may need to review for impact on graduate faculty and determine whether bylaws need revision for alignment.
- Graduate Student Leave of Absence 3364-77-04
- Graduate Student Enrollment Status 3364-77-05
- Graduate Student Academic Grievance 3364-77-02

GCEC will review the policies and if needed pass on to our policy committee for any substantive review/suggestions. Will bring for discussion, particularly if there are substantive change to an existing policy.

#### *Discussion:*

On a different topic inquiring whether there is a policy about recording without consent in class. Chair Giovannucci is not aware of guiding policies. Dean Thompson had checked with Legal and learned it is not a violation of FERPA. Dr. Williams did not think it was a violation of law in Ohio. Dr. Schall added that University policies can exceed what is required by state and federal regulators meaning the University could impose different policies whether faculty have freedom to impose no recording in a classroom. People want to feel free to speak openly and not fear it will be on social media. Dr. Marthe Howard suggested bringing the topic to Legal. Chair Giovannucci indicated that at Graduate Council's suggestion, he would be glad to investigate further.

## ***Standing Committee Reports***

### Curriculum Committee Report

On behalf of the Membership Committee, Chair, Dr. Tim Mueser presented the committee's report to the GCEC for informational purposes. The report came from committee so a motion was not needed. There was one course modification:

#### CCR BMSP 8250: Grant Writing Workshop

Also listed as: ~~BMSP-6250~~

Is this course also offered at another course level (co-listed)? No ~~Yes~~

Credit Hours 2 Lecture 1 ~~2~~ Lab 0 Other 1 ~~0~~

May the courses be repeatable for credit? No ~~Yes~~

Catalog course description: This standard letter-grade ~~is an interdisciplinary~~ course is designed to guide predoctoral ~~teach~~ students through the process of converting their qualifying exam into ~~skills in developing~~ a competitive fellowship application to the NIH (F31), the American Heart Association, or other external funding agency; submission of an application is required for course completion. ~~research plan in the form of a grant proposal.~~

Is there a prerequisite(s)? Yes ~~No~~

Modified or New Prerequisites: The course is restricted to second-year or later PhD graduate students, or MD/PhD students, who have passed their qualifying exams in the PhD program and have the approval of their doctoral committee to register. Enrollment is limited to ensure an effective student-teacher ratio; to prevent over-enrollment, preference may be given to BMSP students. Masters' students are not allowed.

Because the committee reviewed applications during the summer, the Fall I group of applications manageable. Follow up was required on 15% of applications, typically for these reasons:

1. Endorsements - from chair and or dean missing.
2. Non-tenure track - marked but requesting Associate or Full Membership. Tenure or track is required for these membership levels. We had a case like that and granted Professional membership instead.
3. Non-terminal degrees - endorsements should be very explicit that an evaluation process was used considering evidence of five years of years of equivalent experience, which must be clearly stated in the endorsement. This was an issue for there of the applications.
4. Application Form Instructions - Terri Hayes updated the instructions ensuring the directions are as clear and straightforward as possible. Unfortunately, people are not reading the instructions, so we are communicating that information.

There was an application for an external person not from academia, so the committee approved for Special membership as specific set of duties were required.

COLLEGE	Total Applications rec'd	Applications Rec'd/Approved by Category					# Approved as Applied	# Approved in Diff. Category	# Pending	# Apps Internal	# Apps External	# Apps -- Renewal	# Apps -- New	# Apps -- Change
		Full	Associate	Professional	Adjunct	Special								
Arts and Letters (AR)	2	1/1				1/1	2		1	1	1	1		
Business and Innovation (BU)	1	1/1					1		1		1			
Education (CE)	3				1/1	2/2	3		3			1	2	
Engineering (EN)	4				1/1	3/3	4		3	1	2	1	1	
Health and Human Services (HHS)	8		2/0	0/2	4/2	2/3	4	3	1	7	1	4	3	1
Honors														
Law														
Libraries														
Medicine and Life Sciences (MD)	3	3/2		0/1			2	1	3		1	2		
Natural Sciences and Mathematics (SM)	1					1/1	1		1		1			
Nursing (NU)	8	4/4		3/1	1/1		6	2	8		2	3	3	
Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences (PH)	1					1/1	1		1			1		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>9/8</b>	<b>2/0</b>	<b>3/4</b>	<b>7/5</b>	<b>10/11</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>28</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>7</b>

**Discussion:**

Dr. Giovannucci pointed out that in the College of Medicine and Life Sciences, there is a non-tenure track (research), full-time faculty category and they are likely to have applied for Associate Membership. Their primary duties are toward research although they contribute to teaching. Are they eligible?

Dr. Beltyukova noted that the membership definitions have not changed and that Associate or Professional Membership may be appropriate.

**Old Business**

None.

**New Business**

Dr. Sharon Barnes requested guidance in offering r graduate certificate in Women’s Studies in remotely per inquiries she has received to reach those in the Cleveland area who have inquired. Dean Thompson noted that her office is happy to work with Women’s Studies.

**Adjournment**

There being no new business, the Council adjourned at 1:51 pm.