

**Graduate Council Minutes**  
**April 7, 2015**  
**12:30 – 2:00 p.m.**  
**Main Campus, Student Union, Room 2582**

Present: Peter Andreana, Brian Ashburner, Ainsworth Bailey, Debra Boardley, Michael Dowd, Mary Ellen Edwards, Ali Fatemi, Brian Fink, Rodney Gabel, David Giovannucci, Hans Gottgens, Eric Prichard for GSA, Susanna Hapgood, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Ruth Hottell, David Jex, Richard Johnson, Virginia Keil, Kenneth Kilbert, Junghwan Kim, Patricia Komuniecki, William Messer, Holly Monsos, Ron Opp, Susan Rice for Kelly Phillips, Susan Pocotte, Sonmez Sahutoglu, Amal Said, Youssef Sari, Constance Schall, Barry Scheuermann, Joseph Schmidt, Noela Haughton for Rebecca Schneider, Diana Shvydka, Cynthia Smas, Susan Sochacki, Pamela Stover, Viranga Tillekeratne, Jerry Van Hoy, Lois Ventura, Stan Westjohn

Excused: Joseph Dake, April Gardner, Jon Kirchhoff, Marcia McInerney, Willie McKether, Diane Salvador, Kandace Williams

Absent: Dwight Haase, Anand Kunnathur

Guest: Ms. Heather Huntley

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the March 24, 2015 meeting were approved.

***Executive Reports***

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

Dr. Ron Opp, Graduate Council (GC) Chair, stated that today Dr. David Giovannucci will provide a second reading of the Bylaws and Ms. Heather Huntley will provide a brief presentation about Academic Program Review. Ms. Huntley will provide a longer presentation in the fall. Executive Reports and a Curriculum Committee report will be provided. Dr. Alana Malik, Director of University Assessment, will give a presentation on graduate program assessment at the April 21<sup>st</sup> GC meeting. The final GC meeting is scheduled for May 5<sup>th</sup> and will include the GC election process for 2014-15. Dr. Rebecca Schneider will be the Chair for the coming academic year.

Report of the Graduate Student Association (GSA)

Mr. Eric Prichard, Acting Vice President of GSA, reported that the GSA is working to finalize their Bylaws. The GSA elections were held last week and he will report the outcome of the elections at the next GC meeting.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies (COGS)

Dean Komuniecki provided the following updates:

○ *Fall 2015 Applications/Admissions*

The COGS Fall 2015 applications report indicates that we have processed 3,109 completed applications—230 more than this time last year. Currently, COGS is processing about 100 decision pages per week. We hope that by now most of the programs have completed their review process so we can focus on converting the admitted students to enrolled students for Fall 2015. The

national decision day is next week—April 15<sup>th</sup>—so any qualified domestic students not admitted by then may start accepting other offers. Please continue to work hard to recruit a strong incoming graduate class.

○ *Scholarship, Fellowship and Award Applications*

The GC Scholarships and Fellowships Committee met two weeks ago to make decisions on the University Fellowships and COGS Awards for current students. Dean Komuniecki was pleased to announce that four new University Fellows were identified and they are awaiting acceptances of the COGS offer. There was a very strong pool of applicants this year and the committee worked hard to select not only these new Fellows, but also the COGS Scholarship and Fellowship awardees who will be recognized at the last GC meeting this spring. As always, the University Fellows will be recognized at a fall GC meeting. The COGS Diversity Committee is working with Associate Dean, Susan Pocotte, to make the GOAP decisions. She will in turn work with the departments to ensure the match component is available for the identified recipients.

○ *Announcements*

• University Commencement: Sunday, May 10, 2015

There is a call for COGS Marshals for the morning and afternoon commencements. The Provost's office needs names by the end of this week. (Drs. Jerry Van Hoy and Susanna Hapgood stated that they would be willing to assist.)

- Morning ceremony at 9:30 a.m.: College of Health Sciences, College of Social Justice and Human Service, and the Judith Herb College of Education
- Afternoon ceremony at 2:00 p.m.: College of Languages, Literature and Social Sciences, College of Natural Sciences and Mathematics, College of Business and Innovation, and College of Communication and the Arts

- COGS Dean's Assessment survey was sent to all of the eligible Graduate Faculty by the Faculty Senate office on Friday, April 3<sup>rd</sup> and will be open until Friday, April 17<sup>th</sup>. Dean Komuniecki encouraged all eligible graduate faculty to participate in this important process. (Several faculty stated they did not receive any information on the assessment. Dr. Dowd acknowledged that he would look into this situation as faculty should have received the information. He will ask that the deadline be extended to April 24, 2015 and ask that Faculty Senate send out an email blast.)

- Ohio Board of Regents (OBOR) Choose Ohio First (COF) Scholarship Program update: At the Annual COF Review meeting last week, UT received excellent feedback about the current COF programs (undergraduate and undergraduate-graduate pipeline, and graduate programs). There will be a new Request For Proposals (RFP) this summer for new funding opportunities and Dean Komuniecki stated that she will announce that information when it becomes available (e.g., new PSM in Green Chemistry and Engineering program would be competitive).

- Professional Development programs: ETD Open Labs: Formatting and Submission is scheduled for this Wednesday, April 8 and Thursday, April 9, 2015 from 3:00-5:00 p.m. in Carlson Library, Room 1025 (the open lab on the HSC was last week).

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### Second Reading and Vote of Revised Bylaws

Dr. David Giovannucci, Committee Member, discussed the revisions to the Draft Bylaws. The following sentence was added to Article II, Section 2: "On an annual basis, GC will define Main Campus and Health Science Campus prior to elections". Dr. Giovannucci also mentioned that *Graduate Program Review Committee* was added as Article IV, Section C. A change in wording was requested for Article IV, Section 8, C, ii, a to read as follows: "to advise the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of COGS on the award of the COGS University Fellowships and Endowed Fellowships and Scholarships". It was also pointed out that the date needed to be updated to reflect the current date in Article V, Section 1. The GC unanimously passed the Bylaws. There were no opposing votes and no abstentions. A GC member did raise concern about the summer committees but stated it will be addressed as old business.

#### Academic Program Review

Ms. Heather Huntley, Director of University Accreditation and Program Review, provided a quick overview of the process and summary. Academic Program Review (APR) is in its third official year of this cycle and some quick calculations show that 22 graduate programs have gone through the process since 2013. The process starts with orientation in fall semester wherein the programs complete a self-study; a professional template is established and an external review team comes in. The team issues a report and from that report the program and college has the opportunity to respond to the action plan, the self-study and the report. It is a cyclical process and many accredited programs are using this process to prepare for external accreditation. Every program will go through this process and the schedule can change based on feedback.

APR looks at the distinctiveness of programs and examines how The University of Toledo (UT) can be distinctive from other colleges. The external team reviews faculty comments, examines teaching loads, tours facilities and classrooms, and reviews programs.

Ms. Huntley stated that the site visits have been generally positive and that the outcomes are still in process. Examples of outcomes from program review include an undergraduate program working with its outside accreditor to align the accreditation cycle with its corresponding graduate program, and a couple of programs have made changes to courses based upon reviewer information. Obtaining data can be a struggle at times as not everyone collects placement information; however, APR needs to be made aware as the Federal government is asking for that data. Ms. Huntley stated that the schedule for program review can change based on feedback, to allow alignment with the external accreditation process, or with faculty who are sick or on sabbatical. When a GC member inquired about staff reduction, Ms. Huntley stated that a section exists regarding staff support or lack thereof. A question also arose regarding external reviews and how they are chosen wherein Ms. Huntley stated that programs can offer suggestions and that benchmarking other institutions can be an option. Ms. Huntley also stated that programs scheduled for review next year will occur at the beginning of fall, but may start earlier. Ms. Huntley suggested checking the website <https://www.utoledo.edu/aapr/index.html> for processes and ideas concerning Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review.

**Standing Committee Reports**

Curriculum Committee

The following proposals are recommended by the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (GCCC) for approval by the GC. GCCC Chair Plenefisch proceeded to present all of the GCCC recommendations to Council. GC unanimously approved the curricular changes (with modifications) outlined below.

**Program Revision Request**

College	Department	Course Name	Summary of change
COBI	FINA	MBA-major in Finance	Drop requirement for FINA 6130 (Advanced Corporate Finance) as a required course in the Finance MBA, it remains as an elective in the program; Core financial knowledge is still in the program through the required BUAD 6200; Credit hours dropped from 36 to 33.
PH	PHIP	MS in Pharmaceutical Sciences-Industrial Pharmacy	Courses dropped: PHCL 6150, CHEM 6300, EEES 5710, PHPR 6600, plus 6 required elective credits (16 credits total); Courses added: PHCL 5760, PHPR 5770, PUBH 6000, PHPR 6950, CHEM 6350, and PHPR 5680 moved from elective to required courses (13 total credits).
EN	MIME	Master of Engineering: Concentration in Energy Engineering	New concentration with 3 new options in existing Master of Engineering degree program. Existing program is designed for curricular flexibility tailored to students' interests and/or skills training of that fits with the student's employer. The new concentration and tracks provide a way of designating the completion of the degree with a specific circumscribed set of electives in the areas of Energy Engineering. (Specific options are: Power Generation and Distribution option. Energy Utilization and Management option and Advanced Energy Systems option.) (changed references of <i>tracks</i> to <i>options</i> )

**Existing Course Modifications**

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Change in course
SM	BIOL	Advanced Molecular Biology Laboratory	BIOL 6020	Reduction in credits from 3 to 2, change in description to bring it in line with actual content of the course. Course is intended primarily for students in the MES program, changes reflect better alignment with the objectives of the MES program.
SM	EEES	Ecology Field Trip	EEES 5790	Change in course title and catalog description: allows more flexibility in locations of the Field Trip. Also minor change to prerequisites, from "EEES 3050" to " EEES 3050 or equivalent"

**New Course Proposal**

College	Dept.	Course Name	Course Number	Brief description
SM	EECS	Advanced Environmental Data Management	EEES 5160 (changed from original submission of EEES 6160)	Basics of data management for students in the environmental sciences.

**Teaming Certificate(s) and associated courses:**

The goal of the Certificate in Interprofessional Teaming for Early Childhood is to prepare and guide professionals to engage in collaborative best practices in service to individuals with special needs and their families. The certificate will be offered eventually across 7 disciplines, each discipline will submit a separate Certificate proposal and set of common new courses that cross-list with the core certificate courses in the program; the net result is that students in the certificate, regardless of discipline, will take the same curriculum. Although the certificate has only 8 required credit hours, students must be also already enrolled within one of the sponsoring degree programs in order to obtain the certificate, and complete 100% of the competencies. Currently only 2 of the disciplines (SPED/CIEC) have submitted the certificate and cross-listed courses, the others are anticipated to be submitting their versions in the future.

**New Programs (certificate)**

College	Department	Program	Summary of change
JHCOE	ECPSE	Certificate in Teaming for Early Childhood (CEIC)	Certificate consists of 5 courses and meeting 100% of a set of defined competencies (SPED 5/7270, CIEC 5/7610, CIEC 5/7620, CIEC 5/7630, and CIEC 5/7640), for a total minimum of 8 credit hours. At least 75% of competencies can be met through these courses, remainder will be met in additional courses within the students' major program.

JHCOE	ECPSE	Certificate in Teaming for Early Childhood (SPED)	Certificate consists of 5 courses and meeting 100% of a set of defined competencies (SPED 5/7270, SPED 5/7610, SPED 5/7620, SPED 5/7630, and SPED 5/7640), for a total minimum of 8 credits. At least 75% of competencies can be met through these courses; remainder will be met in additional courses within the students' major program.
-------	-------	---	---

**New Course Proposals for the courses within the above certificates:**

College	Dept.	Course Name	Course Number	Brief description	Cross listed with:
JHCOE	ECPSE	Orientation to Inter-professional Teaming	CIEC 5610	Seminar Co-requisite of SPED 5270.	SPED 5610
JHCOE	ECPSE	Orientation to Inter-professional Teaming	CIEC 7610	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply; co-requisite of SPED 7270	SPED 7610
JHCOE	ECPSE	Working Effectively with Team Members	CIEC 5620	Seminar on factors that support and threaten inter-professional collaboration.	SPED 5620
JHCOE	ECPSE	Working Effectively with Team Members	CIEC 7620	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply	SPED 7620
JHCOE	ECPSE	Evidence-Based Practice and Innovation in Teaming	CIEC 5630	Seminar Co-requisite of CIEC 5640.	SPED 5630
JHCOE	ECPSE	Evidence-Based Practice and Innovation in Teaming	CIEC 7630	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply; co-requisite of CIEC 7640	SPED 7630
JHCOE	ECPSE	Practicum in Inter-professional Teaming	CIEC 5640	Capstone experience course for the graduate Certificate of Interpersonal Teaming	SPED 5640
JHCOE	ECPSE	Practicum in Inter-professional Teaming	CIEC 7640	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply;	SPED 7640
JHCOE	ECPSE	Orientation to Inter-professional Teaming	SPED 5610	Seminar. Co-requisite of SPED 5270.	CIEC 5610
JHCOE	ECPSE	Orientation to Inter-professional Teaming	SPED 7610	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply; co-requisite of SPED 7270	CIEC 7610
JHCOE	ECPSE	Working Effectively with Team Members	SPED 5620	Seminar on factors that support and threaten inter-professional collaboration.	CIEC 5620

JHCOE	ECPSE	Working Effectively with Team Members	SPED 7620	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply	CIEC 7620
JHCOE	ECPSE	Evidence-Based Practice and Innovation in Teaming	SPED 5630	Seminar Co-requisite of SPED 5640.	CIEC 5630
JHCOE	ECPSE	Evidence-Based Practice and Innovation in Teaming	SPED 7630	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply; co-requisite of SPED 7640	CIEC 7630
JHCOE	ECPSE	Practicum in Inter-professional Teaming	SPED 5640	Capstone experience course for the graduate Certificate of Interpersonal Teaming	CIEC 5640
JHCOE	ECPSE	Practicum in Inter-professional Teaming	SPED 7640	same as above at 7000 level additional student assignments apply	CIEC 7640

Membership Committee

None.

**Old Business**

GC member Dr. Mary Ellen Edwards requested that consideration be given to Article I, Section 2, e, 2: Duties and privileges of Special Membership: Special members of the Graduate Faculty will be given responsibilities as enumerated by the Membership Committee from the Duties and Privileges of Full Membership. **Individuals holding Special Membership; however, will not be given the privilege or responsibility of proposing graduate level courses or programs.** Individuals holding Special Membership will not vote in elections pertaining to GC or graduate education matters and will not serve on GC or its committees. (She suggests adding the sentence in red print.)

Dr. Edwards also expressed a concern regarding the new section (Article IV, 6, C)—Graduate Program Review Committee (GPRC)—being a 12 month committee. She suggests that the Bylaws Committee consider language which would provide a work around for 9-month programs and faculty and 12-month programs and faculty in the same spirit as what was adopted for the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee in Article IV, 6, A, v. As written, the GCEC cannot act on program review for the GC during the summer but the committee work continues during the summer. Perhaps the GPRC could review 12 month programs during the summer months when the full GC does not meet so that some of the committee work could continue with available GPRC members. The primary concern is that program faculty will not be available to answer questions or issues when the programs are under review. A suggestion is that the GPRC could be charged with meeting prior to the first GC meeting in the fall—perhaps the very first week the 9-month faculty return to campus to finalize any program review reports of the 12-month programs conducted over the summer months for presentation at the first GC meeting of the academic year. By focusing only on 12-month programs during the summer, the GPRC could continue its work during the summer even if a number of the 9-month faculty are not available and thereafter prepare a draft report for consideration by all GPRC members in time for action by the GC at its first meeting.

A motion was made to remand the above concerns to the Bylaws Committee for discussion and consideration.

Dean Komuniecki proposed a resolution of thanks to Dr. Mark Templin for all of his time and hard work on the GC Bylaws over the past two years. The GC supported that resolution

***New Business***

Dr. William Messer stated that the National Institutes of Health is asking all universities to indicate in grant proposals going forward whether or not they have a university policy of post-doctoral fellows. This is indicated as applications are submitted. UT currently does not have a policy and perhaps there should be a university policy rather than each college coming up with individual policies. The Research Council wants to include Graduate Council as there is an existing policy and resources available to help graduate students. If UT has a policy for graduate students and post-doctoral fellows, it would provide a continuum of support. Dr. Messer stated that he is looking to identify a small group of people who are willing to work on a policy and merge what is therefore graduate students with post-doctoral fellows. He asked that anyone who is interested please contact him. His contact information is: ([William.Messer@utoledo.edu](mailto:William.Messer@utoledo.edu)) or 419-530-2291.

***Adjournment***

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 1:43 p.m.