Graduate Council Minutes
October 16, 2018
Health Science Campus, Collier 1000A

Present: Wissam AbbouAlaiwi, Brian Ashburner, Sahar Atshan, Tomer Avidor-Reiss, Rodney Gabel,
         Bashar Gammoh, Daniel Georgiev, Cyndee Gruden, Lee Heritage, Edward Janak,
         Sara Lundquist, Jyl Matson, Nikolai, Daryl Moorhead, Nagalakshmi Nadiminty,
         Alisa Nammavong, Douglas Nims, Lori Pakulski, Penny Poplin Gosetti, Jennifer Reynolds,
         Constance Schall, Beth Schlemper, Rebecca Schneider, Martha Sexton, Ozcan Sezer, Zahoor
         Shah, Lirim Shemshedini, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Robert Topp,
         Jerry Van Hoy, James Willey, Kandace Williams.

Absent: Terry Bigioni, Frank Calzonetti, Patricia Case, Marcia McInerney, Geoffrey Rapp.

Excused: Ben Davis, Christina Fitzgerald, Hassan HassabElnaby, Jason Huntley, Patty Relue,
         Barry Scheuermann.

Guests: William Ayres, Hao-Wei Chen, Jerzy Kamburowski, P.S. Sundararaghavan.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes
The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of September 4, 2018 were approved.

Executive Reports
Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council
On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair, Dr. Jerry Van Hoy provided the following updates:

The Provost asked the Graduate Council Executive Committee (GCEC) and Faculty Senate Executive Committee (FSEC) to review policies with upcoming expiration dates to determine those that can be reposted. The GCEC is revising policies and does not want to re-post as is at present. As far as we know, existing policies are in force as the expiration date serves as a review date. Polices can undergo minor changes, major revisions or can be reposted with no changes. Both the Graduate Academic Grievance Policy and the Graduate Academic Dishonesty Policy have gone through revisions and will be sent to Graduate Council for review.   Council agreed that existing policies would remain in effect until a new revision supersedes.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies
Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Interim Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

o *UT Day of Giving, October 16-17, 2018*
Graduate advocates and supporters are encouraged to participate in this year's Day of Giving by supporting COGS general scholarship fund and any of your favorite UT colleges, departments, or activities at https://www.utfoundation.org/rocketforward/.

o *Responsible Conduct in Research Training – Saturday, October 20, 2018*
RCR training will occur in face-to-face format for first year students in NSM, COE, and PHARM. Face-to-face training will be followed by online CITI training and a survey to evaluate training. RCR is being offered for the first time in conjunction with Office of Research and Sponsored Programs, the Libraries and the academic colleges including several faculty volunteers.

o I went to de-escalation training this morning. It was great. More opportunities to attend should come. Important stats –32% say they have had a crisis in the last 30 days, may cause escalation. Recognize when you are dealing with crisis situation and be the one to deescalate. Helps keep us safe.

We have presentation today for a new program. If you have a new program in the works, contact myself or Beth Schlemper. If you are starting something new, let us know so we can help you with that process.

Comments:
Dr. James Willey suggested that a definition of crisis be part of the process.

Report of the Associate Vice President for Research
Dr. Connie Schall, Associate Vice President of Research, reported that IRB manager will be operating shortly. Ms. Jamie Van Atta has trained department chairs and committees have been trained on the software. Favorable responses have been received thus far. Current plans are to roll out university wide for all IRB protocols by end of October. Stay tuned for training. There may be two systems for a short while. Hopes are to transition old data into new system as soon as possible. Existing protocols will be rolled into system in November. This will be the software for human subject research and animal research. Jamie and Rick are trying to put together help menus. IBC and IACUC will eventually roll into it.

Report of the Graduate Student Association
Ms. Alisa Nammavong, President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

o *GSA General Assembly, Oct. 16th in Student Union Ingman Room 6 -8 pm*
Please let us know if any events to include on the GSA agenda?.
Introduction to MGRS and finding coordinators.
Still looking for keynote speaker that can speak to graduate students about success, motivational or inspirational messages without delving too much into a specific topic/field. Suggestions from GCEC include:
Chair of General Surgery at UTMC: Francis Charles Brunicardi
Jack Schultz, Office of Research

Dean of the College of Arts and Letters, Charlene Gilbert
Dr. Jim Ferris,Ability Center of Greater Toledo Endowed Chair of Disability Studies
Dr. Tom Bridgeman, Director of the Lake Erie Center
Introduction to Graduate Research Award with Dr. Gruden

o *GSA Committees*

Constitution Review Committee
   Finalizing first draft of the updated Constitution.
   Reviewing process for selection of reps as suggestion from Dr. Gruden.

Research and Development
   Tasked with going through survey answers from MGRS.

Professional Development
   Planning an information session about the Graduate Research Award. Considering inviting
   those who have been awarded in the past and clarifying questions that may come about.
   Discuss the review selection and application processes.

Planning date for student concerns forum/open discussion as an opportunity to gather
information and data about student concerns. Continuing discussion about health care and
concerns with UT insurance.

o *Student Advisory Board meeting with Dr. Flapp Cockrell*
   Meeting with other student organizations to discuss and share campus concerns, resources, etc.
   Encourage students and faculty to download the UT Parking app to learn about updates and
   changes to parking, pay for tickets, and other resources. And inform students of the benefits of
   the Downtown Connect shuttle service. Simply show UT Rocket ID for free ride downtown on
   Thursdays and Fridays 11 pm and Saturdays 8 pm - 2:35 pm.

o *Midwest Graduate Student Leaders*
   Planning to meet with BGSU's Student Senate in November in an effort to continue
   communication between graduate student governments and senates throughout Ohio and the
   Midwest. Possibility of finding way to meet during the Dean's Retreat.

Information and Discussion Items
Master's in Business Analytics – New Graduate Program Proposal Presentation
Dr. Hao-Wei Chen, Dr. Jerzy Kamburowski and P.S. Sundararaghavan from the College of Business and
Innovation were present to review the new degree proposal and answer questions.

Dean Gruden explained that the first step after curricular review is the presentation and discussion of
expectations of the new program with the Graduate Council, followed by presentations to the
Provost, President, Board of Trustees and the state's Chancellor's Council of Graduate Studies.

Dr. Chen led the presentation describing the new degree program as utilizing predictions from data to
help guide solutions. Due to technology, we can better collect data.

This field seeks those with a background in data analysis, particularly a master's degree. Job growth is anticipated in this field for next 20 years.

Several other Ohio universities offer advanced degrees in data analytics, and three of them are online. BGSU has a joint inter-departmental program. UT's program, however, has a unique concept and tools with differential functional areas that focus more on the application side.

The proposed MSBA program is unique in that it:
- Combines business analytics concepts and tools with a business functional area chosen from among Accounting, Finance, Information Systems, Marketing, and Operations and Supply Chain Management.
- Includes capstone project/internship/thesis options to give further opportunity to specialize.
- Able to marry a functional area and business analytics.
- Allows the student to hone their skills in one application area as opposed to a scattered set of business courses.
- Will also give an opportunity to interact with faculty from a functional area and specialize on such application during the capstone project, internship or thesis.
- Some of the graduates opting for a thesis may be able and willing to go on to a doctoral program and contribute to the field's development.

Based on a (Qualtrix) survey among members of all advisory committees of the COBI, Toledo APICS, EPIC-Toledo (a young professional organization), employers of UT graduates, recent UT-BBA graduates, there was strong recommendation for UT to create this program.

Admission Requirements
- Candidates for admission must have taken either the GMAT or the GRE tests within the last five years. The admission decision will be based on a composite profile of the applicant including test scores, academic background, grades, work experience, letters of reference, and also the statement of purpose. Applicants whose native language is not English have to satisfy the TOEFL requirements of the UT College of Graduate Studies.

- Entering students must demonstrate proficiency in the use of spreadsheets, familiarity with programming languages, and must have some analytical aptitude demonstrated by having taken a calculus course. They should know how to do analysis. Applicants are screened to ensure the student can perform successfully.

Curriculum Overview
- Foundation Courses; up to 12 credit hours (taken in the preceding summer). Entering students with a business major will be released from taking the foundation courses if they complete their undergraduate equivalent courses with a grade C or better

- The MSBA degree would require 10 courses (30 credit hours):
  · Business Analytics Core; 15 credit hours

- Applied Functional Area (Electives); 12 credit hours
  Accounting
  Finance
  Marketing
  Information Systems
  Operations and Supply Chain

- Capstone Project/Internship (3 credit hours) or Master's Thesis (6 credit hours)
  Note: In the case of master's thesis, a student will be released from taking one course in the functional area.

Sample plans of study for both full-time and part-time students were presented. Three new courses are proposed as part of the curriculum. Depending on functional area of study, they will select 4 courses from that area:

Prospective Effective Term and Enrollment
- The earliest potential effective term would Summer/Fall 2019 or Summer/Fall 2020 depending on completion of new program processes. Anticipated enrollment for the first cohort is 20 with a steady increase to 35 over three years.

Faculty and Resources
- Faculty
  The department has recently hired two new tenure-track faculty members, two research lecturers (with Ph.D. in Operations and Information Systems, and Ph.D. in Statistics) who specialize in business analytics. Will use existing faculty members but new one may be needed due to growth projections. Other than the anticipated stipend for the MSBA Program Director, we do not project any other significant expenses. The addition of tenure track position in fall 2020 is already built in the COBI hiring plan. Courses will be delivered by faculty members.

- Facilities
  Physical space limitations will not be an issue because of the college's new Savage Business Complex building. In addition, a classroom will be equipped with the latest technology to add a business analytics lab with state of the art software and hardware, which should be ready in about 18 months.

Discussion:
GC questioned whether with the required pre-requisites, a two-year completion rate would not be feasible.

Dr. Chen explained that the preceding summer would be utilized to take Accounting 5000, for example, if the Accounting specialization is selected. Non-business majors are required to take three courses.

GC questioned the GRE being an option to the GMAT. Dr. Chen replied that those who do not have business background, the GMAT is preferred.

The presentation included several slides listing competing degree programs to which Council suggested summarizing rather than going into detail so that more emphasis is placed on UT's program. Dean Gruden stated that although the state requires existing programs be identified, she suggested that the presentation move through this section more quickly.

Council suggested emphasizing the market for this degree in the local area and state.

Dean Gruden indicated that diversity and inclusion must be addressed.

It was noted that pre-reqs in competing programs required some calculus experience.

Dr. Jerzy Kamubrowski responded that benchmarking other schools shows that 75% of students in this program are international and most have an extensive match background including calculus. Since other programs require one course in calculus, we decided to require it as well. Dr. Sundararaghavan added that students may be apt to solve problems using models.

Dr. Gammoh asked if there are plans for an undergraduate minor that could serve as a positive link from undergraduate to graduate programs in this field.

Dr. Sundararaghavan said there were no plans for a UG major at present. The program does not assume the same population for the graduate program would be a typical MBA or engineering student.

To assist with strengthening the presentation (10 minutes and approximately 12 slides) Dean Gruden suggested meeting with the COBI faculty representatives to provide feedback.

[MOTION TO ENDORSE THE MASTER'S IN BUSINESS ANALYTICS NEW GRADUATE PROGRAM PROPOSAL PRESENTATATION WITH RECOMMENDADTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN FINAL PROPOSAL. COUNCIL APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.]

UT Access to US News and World Report data
Chair Van Hoy thanked Dr. Ayres for meeting with the GCEC and the GC to speak about UT's access to data used for US News and World report and if programs want more access.

Dr. William Ayres, Senior Vice Provost for Academic Affairs thanked Council for inviting him. While there seems to be a lot of mystique about U.S. News and World Report rankings (USNWR), most of the information is available without having to spend money. He displayed a list of programs at UT that are either ranked or could be by USNWR.

Three reports are most popular each year:
1. Best Colleges
   This report, the most popular, identifies best undergraduate colleges as a whole. For the purposes of that number, you are either a university or a liberal arts college, either national or regional, and ranked against peers in that area. We don't get ranked against Amherst. We are national, large enough and public. We are among all national public and private.

2. Best Online Programs
    Comes out each January.

3. Best Graduate Programs
    Comes out in March. A lot of graduate and professional programs get ranked. There are metrics in our strategic plan that indicate there are five things we are ranked on and we should obtain five more.

    The 2018 edition shows our graduate ranked programs as primarily doctoral. However, Nursing is ranked at both masters and doctoral levels. Best Public Affairs is a master's program that received an RNP designation (Ranked Not Published). Public affairs is masters.

There is a methodology link on website. There are various reasons why a program is unranked, including because not enough people have ranked you. The RNP = an average below two on a five-point scale. Some programs have more metrics. UT's College of Law's formula is a seven-page plan with a lot of variables. If your program is ranked on a survey, you don't need to pay them money for one data point, unless you have a program with complex data. Department chairs and graduate program directors typically complete the survey which is compared against other similar programs.

Improvement in UT's USNWR ranking is a 2022 target that is part of our Strategic Plan as well as increases in RNP numbers.

Dr. Rodney Gabel asked who provided information on the target. Dr. Ayres responded that programs and/or colleges provided the information and the numbers can be adjusted if needed. This is not carved in stone.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss asked if the rankings could be listed as percentile.

Dr. Ayres responded that they provide rank ordering, but that the website offers additional information.

Dr. Lori Pakulski inquired whether funding from the Provost's office would help support improved rankings.

Dr. Ayres indicated that that Provost's office would share plans of other programs, some of which are creative. If you decide to do marketing, we can work with you to help identify some areas. Some programs see the significance of having faculty attendance at the right conferences to be seen.

USNWR has a tool for academic insights. We pay them $5,000 per year for a single data set. Is it $5,000 a pop? Not sure if it is rated to the size of our institution or what others pay. We do get a lot of data. In 2003 we were 215th, in 2006 we were 201st, then downhill since. I can compare UT to a peer group of schools that I define. We want to get into top 100 of public universities. Who was in 90-100 range? Ball State, Kent State, University of Central Florida, Idaho, University of Maine, etc. On a six-year graduation rate, it tells us something. We are comparable but need to improve

retention and graduation rates. They do not tell you when they are going to do surveys, but it is approximately every three years. There is a lot of lag built in. Colleges can pay for this if interested.

Dr. Sara Lundquist inquired whether we have other ways to track program progress.

Dean Gruden indicated there is.

Dr. Ayres emphasized the importance of USNWR rankings because reputation matters and we are interested in it. If more students succeed, it is not a trade -off.

Dr. Jennifer Reynolds indicated that the formula and metrics used are provided, but not the weights.

Dr. Ayres affirmed that methodology is provided and that UT is aware of the factors because we paid for it.

Dr. Megan Stewart pointed out that Criminal Justice is a master's program, not doctoral.

Dr. Ayres indicated that we are in a quasi-status because there are others below us. The top 50 are ranked in order. We would be pleased to see our rankings go up. Masters and doctoral rankings in Nursing went up. It is important to pay attention to what goes into the ranking and working to improve those factors.

Dr. Rodney Gabel asked on a 1-5 scale, how do you come up over 200 distinctions? That is essentially useless.

Dr. Ayres replied that it is an average with a lot of ties. The value lies is what are we being ranked on and is it something we ought to be doing anyway. We should raise undergraduate retention rates anyway, and this may help.

Dr. Lori Pakulski pointed out that UT's Speech Language Pathology program is ranked by other agencies whose metrics are tied into accreditation standards that do not meet up with these numbers. The answer has nothing to do with quality.

Dr. Ayres responded that where we have programs that are ranked highly, we can brag about those and post about it. If your number one concern is quality, there is a correlation somewhere, but there may be other things you may want to work on. We have to put this in context to our reputation within the Strategic Plan, Goal 5, which is behind the other four.

Standing Committee Reports
Report of the Curriculum Committee
On behalf of the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (GCCC), Co-Chair, Dr. Rodney Gabel reported on only one proposal. Approved unanimously.

No.	Proposal Type	College	Department/Program	Title	Course Number	Summary
12	NCP	BU	Info Operations and Tech Managen	ERP Systems Process Management	OSCM 6780	ECM #118 Summer 2018 reentered as an NCP

Old Business
None.

New Business
GC vice Chair Election
Main job of Vice Chair at this point is less involved than at the beginning of the fall semester, when populating standing committees is primarily done. The Vice Chair attends meetings and helps solve problems that come up. The commitment is that the Vice Chair will serve as Chair next academic year. It is helpful to spend some time in Vice Chair position first. If your term on GC ends you can still serve in the executive position.

Nominations open:
If you nominate someone who is not here, we will contact them and ask them if they accept.
This will come back each meeting until we have a Vice Chair.

Dr. Schall nominated Dr. Song-Tao Liu. Chair Van Hoy said that he would follow up with Dr. Liu to determine if he is interested and willing to serve.

Motion to close nominations. Closed.

Adjournment
There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:00 p.m.