

**Graduate Council Minutes
October 2, 2018
Main Campus, Rocket Hall 1530**

Present: Brian Ashburner, Sahar Atshan (GSA), Tomer Avidor-Reiss, Frank Calzonetti, Ben Davis, Christina Fitzgerald, Rodney Gabel, Bashar Gammoh, Daniel Georgiev, Cyndee Gruden, Hassan Hassab-Elnaby, Jason Huntley, Edward Janak, Sara Lundquist, Jyl Matson, Marcia McInerney, Daryl Moorhead, Nagalakshmi Nadiminty, Douglas Nims, Lori Pakulski, Penny Poplin Gosetti, Geoffrey Rapp, Patricia Relue, Connie Schall, Barry Scheuermann, Beth Schlemper, Rebecca Schneider, Ozcan Sezer, Zahoor Shah, Lirim Shemshedini, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Robert Topp, Jerry Van Hoy, James Willey.

Absent: Terry Bigioni, Patricia Case, Michael Dowd.

Excused: Wissam AbbouAlaiwi, Nikolai Modyanov, Alisa Nammavong, Jennifer Reynolds, Martha Sexton, Kandace Williams.

Guests: Brenda Grant, Terry Romer.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes

The meeting was called to order and the roll called.

Introduction of COGS Deans Scholars and Fellows

Interim Dean Gruden was pleased to formally recognize the group of eight inaugural COGS Dean's Scholars and Fellows, representing six different colleges on Main campus and Health Science Campus, four doctoral fellows and four master's scholars. You will see and hear from them as they collect information about diversity and inclusion in their areas. Feel free to reach out to them.

Executive Reports

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

On behalf of Graduate Council, Vice Chair, Dr. Jerry Van Hoy congratulated Dr. Beth Schlemper, in her new role as Associate Dean for Graduate and Student Affairs in the College of Graduate Studies. As a result of her new role and ex-officio seat on GC, her elected seat as vice chair needs to be replaced. Nominations should be sent to Chair Van Hoy. An election will occur at a future meeting.

KINE 4250/5250/7250

To clarify this triple-listed course from last spring, GC approved 5250/7250 and has asked the department to clean up their submission to reflect this to move forward. Last spring, this body reaffirmed its stance that triple listed courses are not allowed.

New Program in Master of Business Analytics

The presentation for this new program proposal, approved by GC September 18, 2018, will be given to GC today. Presentations of new programs are also required to go the Provost, President and Board of Trustees prior to the State.

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Ms. Sahar Atshan, Vice President of the Graduate Student Association presented the report:

The First General Assembly meeting took place on Sept. 19th on Health Science Campus with a great turnout of over 65 students.

- We had 17 representatives present that voted on the Biological Graduate Research Symposium to take place on Oct. 26th. This budget was approved for the full amount proposed of \$2,000.
- Committees were formed and still have plenty room for more graduate students. The Constitution Review Committee has met and discussed future amendments and updates that will include current UT policies and match GSA's future outlook. We are encouraging students who may have missed the meeting to consider joining a committee by visiting our website.
- The Health Insurance discussion occurred with Mr. Dan Boyle of the Office of Student Advocacy and Support answering student questions with great sensitivity and poise. Ms. Tonya Tressler was also part of the health insurance mini-panel.
- Students were able to share their own personal experiences and stories. They shared intimate details on their struggles with chronic conditions and how the change in health insurance has affected their ability to possibly receive life-dependent treatments and medications.
 - Several students spoke about their concerns for international students and how they navigate the complexities of the system, let alone that of a domestic student.
 - Several of the concerns brought up by students reflected upon the poor communication on the university's part and the lack of keeping students involved in decision making.
 - Ms. Tressler brought up that students experiencing UT health insurance issues may consider registering for Medicaid which upset several students present. Graduate students feel that being on Medicaid is unacceptable and further reflects the disparity experienced by graduate students.
 - We would like to extend our thanks to Mr. Boyle who answered questions eloquently in a situation that could have become strained. He listened to difficult stories and offered himself as a resource. He explained the bidding system that happens every year with UT health insurance with the trust and how the number of students mandated affects the costs of insurance.
 - We are working in summarizing the minutes of this conversation to be sent to all students. We hope to continue to conversation and are fortunate to have had Dean Gruden present to advocate for us as well.

- We encourage you to direct your graduate students to the GSA or Mr. Boyle for these types of issues! Going to share this meeting summary with students.
- Ms. Bonnie Murphy and her team were also present to briefly discuss student resources.
 - We discussed the Early Childhood Education Center and its availability (or lack thereof) for graduate students with children. This consists of a year-long waiting list for students that have varying lengths of need but it was good to hear more information on this matter. Further, we are hoping that the university will hold true to conversations in Faculty Senate in which a list of facilities will be formed and available for students. We will follow up with this.
 - Lastly, if there are things that your students feel will improve their experience at UT, please have them contact the GSA so we may brainstorm with Bonnie. These are things like lime scooter, food shops, sleep pods, and more!
- Ms. Nammavong and Ms. Atshan had a meeting with Provost Hsu and the undergraduate Student Government president and vice president. It was great to reflect on roles and especially interesting to compare GSA and SG. We look forward to working with Provost Hsu and Student Government in the future!
- The Midwest Graduate Research Symposium will be held on April 6th, 2019. Although this is far in the future, we are beginning planning to stay ahead! The Research and Development Committee will be branching into separate factions in order to process survey results from last year's MGRS.
 - Currently, we are seeking a keynote speaker. Last year, we had the dynamic and engaging Dr. Clint Longenecker. Students came specifically to hear him speak and spent time chatting with him beforehand. We are looking to have the same inspirational, motivational, non-specific department/topic speaker. In the past, this person has focused on graduate student success. Please let us know if you have suggestions!
 - We will begin discussing coordinator positions at the next General Assembly meeting, October 16th 6-8 pm, Main Campus, Student Union, Ingman Room.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Interim Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates:

- *Graduate Enrollment*

In an effort to collect all inquiries relating to graduate programs/admissions, COGS has a new email box. If and when you receive an inquiry from a prospective student, please forward the email to graduateinquiry@utoledo.edu. COGS will respond, track and include in its communication plan as well as connect the individual with the appropriate program contact.
- *Fall Commencement*

Nominations for graduate student speaker at December 15th Commencement are due by November 1st, 2018 (5 -7 minute speech).

- *Day of Giving*
October 16th is the second annual Day of Giving. Please contribute to the College of Graduate Studies Scholarship Fund or Progress Fund so that we may continue to provide financial support to graduate students in need. Working on a web page and video. Funding will continue to support stipends.
- *Development of New Graduate Programs and Certificates*
If you are planning to develop a new graduate program or certificate, please contact COGS so that we can provide assistance in navigating the process. Contact Beth Schlemper or myself because new programs have to go to BOT and to the state. We will help you get in that process.

Research and Sponsored Programs Update

Dr. Frank Calzonetti, Vice President of Research reported that Dr. Rick Francis is working the new IRB program that is anticipated to roll out by November 1st. Questions or requests for training may be sent to Dr. Calzonetti or Dr. Francis. Ms. Eva English was able to put together funds to hire a part-time grant writer to work with her on grant writing support.

Information and Discussion Items

Graduate Program Budget Information – Mr. Terrence Romer, Director of Strategic Initiatives and Ms. Brenda Grant, Associate Vice President for Academic Finance and Planning

Chair Van Hoy stated that in discussing the upcoming budget process, the GCEC thought it would be helpful to GC to understand the data involved in budget process, the tools available, and to view how the budget is built. This discussion is to understand the data.

Mr. Terrence Romer explained that in the budget and planning process, a budget analysis is developed and assumptions are tested. Ms. Brenda Grant works with departments and programs on hiring.

First, it is important to know the information you are looking for ---basic data, enrollment, FTE, degrees awarded, productivity, or efficiency.

Where is the answer? The sources for data will vary as there are several data tools and strategies. All of these can inform the questions:

- Office of Institutional Research (OIR)
OIR is a good partner for enrollment questions.
- Academic Finance
Your college business manager, department chair, deans, associate deans, provost's office
COGS, Office of Assessment, Accreditation and Program Review.
- Argos Reports (OIR)
Contact Brigitte Norton-Odenthal, Business Intelligence Analyst in OIR
- Web Report Library (WRL)
Credit hours | FTE | Department Expenditures

Contact your business manager. They will have access.

- Ad Astra
Good information on course enrollment vs demand over years, sections, seats filled. A scheduling coordinator would be familiar.
Contact the Provost's office.
- Faculty 180
Contact the Provost's Office. They can pull reports.
- Delaware Study Data (OIR)
Two years ago we restarted involvement. Cost per credit hour, research expense, and operational expense. Can benchmark with others that participate. Aligned by CIP codes. Gives you rough estimate of comparables.
- Integrated Post-Secondary Data System (IPEDS)
Run through federal government. If federal financial aid, have to submit data. Includes a lot of data. Similar to data submitted to U.S News and World Report. Data over long periods of time.
- Ohio Department of Higher Education (ODHE)
Used to benchmark with other Ohio schools.
- Accreditation
Programs with accreditation have great sources of information and program data.

Data can be used to help understand how all pieces fit together and learn how can constituents can be involved in impacting the strategic plan.

Ms. Brenda Grant suggested that GC determine its questions in terms of strategic planning.

Questions and Discussion:

Chair Van Hoy indicated that the Provost has expressed interest in growing programs.

Ms. Grant asked whether Graduate Council has looked at enrollment trends and capacity.

Dean Gruden responded that COGS has looked at enrollment trends, and capacity is a bit more complicated.

Dr. James Willey inquired whether costs vary by college and the sources of funding for graduate students.

Ms. Grant replied that it is a mix.

Mr. Romer explained that the cost is variable for the type of graduate student, based in part on their level and college. For master's level, the fee pay cost varies relatively slightly. The stipend is determined another way for discussion with deans/chairs/COGS. There are budgeted sources, grants, and state doctoral and professional models.

You have to look at tuition and fee revenues and look inward at your graduate students to determine what percentage are funded and from where. That will give you an idea of nuances that may be missed at a higher level.

Dr. Willey asked if this information is part of an annual report.

Mr. Romer responded that internally there is no big report that that says 'this is what it costs'. The Provost does share departmental annual reports with the Deans.

Ms. Grant referenced the Delaware Study and the importance of reviewing the classification of instructional programming (CIP) codes that report into the study and are based on our Carnegie II status. CIP provides faculty/in load comparables and dollar value compared to peers, student to faculty ratio. Argos has 2014-2015 information. Any department Chair can get in touch with Ms. Norton-Odenthal to discuss. Mr. Romer added that CIP codes are set by the federal government, and provides a semi apples-to-apples comparison across the country. So, it serves as a benchmarking resource as well.

Ms. Grant stated that Mr. Bryan Pyles may have a lot of data for the College of Medicine and Life Sciences.

Dr. Patty Relue stated that faculty and GC want to be data driven in supporting the strategic plan. She asked whether faculty can contact her if information is not available through current sources, particularly for enrollment and tracking data?

Ms. Grant suggested meeting with Ms. Norton-Odenthal who develops Argos reports. There are also a lot of requests for data from the WRL.

Mr. Romer and Ms. Grant suggested Graduate Council do a needs assessment, perhaps via an ad hoc committee, and invite them and Ms. Norton-Odenthal to assist.

Dr. Willey thought it would be helpful for the Provost to share what they have and where they want to go with it.

Chair Van Hoy said that graduate program directors and chairs should let Graduate Council know what they need.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss stated that a goal is to increase graduate students.

Dean Gruden added that SSI is based not only on enrollment, but degree completion, which is impacted by time to degree.

Dr. Willey added that sufficient enrollment would support recruitment of faculty.
Dean Gruden added support through research funding.

Dr. Avidor-Reiss said that through data, the state has mechanism to allocate costs down to a course level then come up with a state-wide average. They know approximately how much it costs. They all work hand-in-hand. Isolating costs is difficult.

Some programs are stand-alone and others are different. How much does it cost to run a graduate program? If courses are cross-listed at both the undergraduate and graduate levels, that impacts costs.

Dr. Marcia McInerney noted there are six different graduate programs in Pharmacy, two at the Ph.D. level and four master's. It has been successful with foreign governments funding students, although it has been decreasing. We have heard that we are not on the Shanghai Ranking Academic Ranking of World Universities 2018 Shanghai list (top 500). Only top institutions are included... Harvard, Stanford, Yale, etc.

Dr. Avidor-Reiss pointed out that graduate students generate income and reputation with good quality research.

Dr. Rodney Gabel stressed the importance of student outcome quality. His college has lost faculty lines and has seen higher tuition increases in rehabilitation programs from a few years ago. He expressed concern that we are pricing ourselves out of quality students. Clinical programs require a lot of faculty time. Decisions made in the past influence the path forward. He questioned whether we should increase enrollment if outcomes are not good. Dr. Lori Pakulski would like communication on this.

Chair Van Hoy stated that GC may need to request specified data and handle on a college-by-college basis, keeping in mind Provost's initiatives to increase the number of Ph.D. students which increases the status of the university.

Dr. Sara Lundquist asked what the Provost is asking of COGS.

Chair Van Hoy responded that since the Provost is seeking Graduate Council assistance to implement a portion of the Strategic Plan for COGS in a context where there is not a lot of new budget dollars, is the reason we are asking for a discussion of the data.

Dean Gruden asked Council to let COGS know areas where there is capacity. Areas that do not have room for capacity should consider a focus on student success.

Dr. Bashar Gammoh added that with the appropriate faculty who generate revenue you can study that toward creating a growth program.

Dr. Willey asked about the timeline.

Dr. Gammoh stated in the College of Medicine and Life Sciences, it would go through the College Dean to bring to the Provost, unless it is requested as a GC study to bring forward.

Dean Gruden reminded Council that a fiscal impact statement is required for new graduate programs.

Dr. McInerney said that UT stipends need to be competitive with other universities so that departments are not competing against one another for students.

The same stipend in STEM areas would be helpful. In cases, where we can afford stipends, but not all of the tuition, we may have to choose between taking a student vs. a postdoc.

Dean Gruden responded that the Graduate Student Association completed a study. We know that stipends are not where they should be and that student health insurance costs are high. She is glad to have these conversations with colleges.

Chair Van Hoy suggested college's look at data regarding cost and capacity for future discussion and let GC know if a committee should be formed. Recommendations may be needed on a college-by-college basis.

Dr. Jason Huntley suggested a top down approach where reports are provided to those who do the analyses.

Chair Van Hoy suggested Council talk their deans and associate deans and Graduate Council can make a request to the Provost.

Dean Gruden added that this topic can be discussed at the COGS Council of Associate Deans meetings and requests reports through Ms. Norton-Odenthal.

Dr. Willey requested a summary.

Dean Gruden will continue budget discussions with Graduate Council.

Dr. Relue stated that in her role as an Associate Dean, for the past year, she can attest to the fact that her college, Engineering, can trust the data it has been collecting for 15 years. It would be helpful for everyone to have access to and use the correct data. She also requested that standard data be pulled and shared for U.S. News and World Report.

Dr. Pakulski asked for help to improve our score, the response was your program has to purchase that data.

Dean Gruden said that she would speak to Vice Provost, Bill Ayres, about US News and World Report Rankings.

Chair Van Hoy requested that Council send Dean Gruden the reports you use now and work from that.

Standing Committee Reports

Report of the Curriculum Committee

None.

Report of the Membership Committee

None.

Old Business

None.

New Business

None.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 1:58 pm.