

**Graduate Council Minutes  
December 11, 2012  
12:30 – 2:00 p.m.  
Main Campus, Student Union Room 2582**

- Present: Brian Ashburner, Barbaranne Benjamin, James Benjamin, David Black, Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Laurie Dinnebeil (for Rebecca Schneider), Mary Ellen Edwards, Timothy Fisher, Max Funk, Charlene Gilbert, David Giovannucci, Hassan HassabElnaby, Paul Hewitt, Paul Hong, Wayne Hoss, David Jex, Patricia Komuniecki, Anand Kunnathur, Sara Lundquist, Joseph Margiotta, Surya Nauli, Douglas Nims, Nick Piazza, Frank Pizza, Susan Pocotte, Patricia Relue, Randall Ruch, Constance Schall, Aaron Shaw (GSA), Snejana Slantcheva-Durst, Susan Sochacki, William Taylor, Mark Templin, Gerard Thompson, James Trempe, Joshua Waldman, Kandace Williams
- Excused: Mohamed Hefzy, Ruth Hottell, Jung Hwan Kim, Holly Monsos, Lori Pakulski, Dorothea Sawicki
- Absent: Kay Grothaus, Renee Heberle, Cynthia Smas, James Willey

***Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes***

The meeting was called to order and roll called. The Minutes of the October 16, 2012 and the November 13, 2012 Graduate Council meetings were approved.

The agenda was reordered in order to recognize the 2012-2013 University Fellowship recipients at the beginning of the meeting.

**Recognition of 2012-2013 University Fellowship Recipients**

Dean Komuniecki was pleased to present to the Graduate Council, the new 2012-2013 University Fellowship recipients. This award is targeted for full-time incoming Ph.D. students, or those in the first year of their Ph.D. programs, that have exceptional academic records. It is a highly competitive fellowship and is the highest graduate student award the College of Graduate Studies makes. It includes a stipend for the academic year at the doctoral student level of each departmental program, plus remission of instructional fees, including out-of-state, general and other fees. It may be renewed for a total of four years support, provided the student maintains an outstanding academic record and makes progress toward the degree. There are only ten University Fellows at a time.

For AY 2012-13, we have five continuing students in their third year of their doctoral studies:

- **Robert Layne** from BioSciences working with Dr. Bruce Bamber in the College of Natural Sciences and Mathematics;
- **Maria Hurtado Alvarado** working with Dr. Joe Hovey in Clinical Psychology in the College of Languages, Literature and Social Sciences;
- **Vafa Saboorideilliami** is a third year doctoral student working with Dr. Hassan Hassab-Elnaby on his PhD in Manufacturing Management and Technology in the College of Business and Innovation;
- **Qingnian Goh** is a third year student working with Dr. Frank Pizza in Exercise Science in the Judith Herb College of Education, Health Sciences and Human Service;
- The fifth 3<sup>rd</sup> year Fellow is Ms. **Kelly Marbaugh** from the College of Engineering. She is doing her doctoral research with Dr. Patty Relue in Bioengineering and for this academic year is supported by a grant but she will resume her University Fellowship in AY 2013-14; and
- **Ms. Michelle Roley** is a second year doctoral student in clinical psychology working with Dr. Joe Hovey in the Department of Psychology in the College of Languages, Literature and Social Sciences.

Each spring their advisors provide COGS with progress reports for these students. They are all making significant progress toward their doctoral degrees and are active in presenting and publishing their work.

Last spring, Dean Komuniecki convened the Scholarships and Fellowships Committee to review the 20 applications for the new Fellows. The Committee selected three outstanding students and they are with us today. As Dean Komuniecki called each name, the students came forward with their advisors to be recognized.

- **Ms. Jessica Branch** is a second year doctoral student in Special Education working with Dr. Laurie Dinnebeil, the Daso Herb Chair, in the Judith Herb College of Education, Health Science and Human Service. Ms. Branch earned her B.A in Early Childhood Education in 2003 from Ohio Northern University and was an Intervention Specialist with the Hardin County Educational Service Center for four years before coming to UT to pursue her Master's of Education in Special Education. She earned her M.Ed. in May 2007 and her thesis work focused on the managing challenging behaviors of young children with disabilities. For her doctoral work, she is studying how to best embed student learning goals into high-quality early childhood learning environments.
- **Ms. Brittney Luc** is a first year doctoral student working with Dr. Brian Pietrosimone in Exercise Science in the Judith Herb College of Education, Health Science and Human Service. Ms. Luc earned her B.A. in Athletic Training from Capital University in Columbus in May 2010 and her M.S. in Exercise Science from The University of Toledo in 2012. She already has prepared two first authored manuscripts from her master's research as well as making several national presentations. Her doctoral work in the Joint Injury and Muscle Activation Lab will build on her previous research and focus on the reconstruction of the anterior cruciate ligament (ACL).
- **Mr. Kazem Majdzadeh-Arkadani** is a second year doctoral student in the College of Engineering working with Dr. Saleh Jabarin in the Department of Chemical and Environmental Engineering. He earned his B.S in chemical engineering from Isfahan University of Technology (Iran) in 2005 and his M.S. in chemical engineering from The University of Isfahan in 2009. He already has published two papers and made three conference presentations. His doctoral research at UT will focus on developing polymer nanocomposites with an emphasis on how to improve the adhesion between the nanoparticles and the polyester matrix polymer phase.

The Council joined Dean Komuniecki and Chair Piazza in congratulating all these new University Fellows as they embark on the graduate careers here at UT.

### ***Executive Reports***

#### **Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council**

On behalf of the Graduate Council Executive Committee (GCEC), Council Chair, Dr. Nick Piazza reported that since the Thanksgiving break there has been a lot of activity. First, there was the announced change in how State Share of Instruction (SSI) would be computed. The current SSI formula is primarily based on enrollment numbers. Under the new plan introduced by Governor Kasich, SSI will be based primarily on graduation and course-completion rates rather than enrollment as it has in the past.

The idea is to provide financial incentives to universities to achieve certain outcomes, rather than reward enrollment. The plan calls for 50 percent of the SSI formula to be based on graduation numbers, 30 percent on course completion rates, and 20 percent on factors like college readiness and demographics.

Most of the changes to SSI have a larger impact on undergraduate education, however, there is one mandate that should be of particular interest to graduate education. The plan also calls for rewarding universities that attract the best students into Ohio and keep them in the state for employment.

One change that affects the University of Toledo as a whole would be the elimination the exemption of regional campuses from computed graduation and completion rates. In the past, UT has been hurt because it did not operate a regional campus where underprepared and at-risk students could be enrolled and not count against UT's completion rates. This exemption will be eliminated and all institutions in the University System of Ohio will have to include students at regional campuses in their graduation and completion rates.

Chair Piazza reported that today he had received a copy of Governor Kasich's plan and that he plans to distribute that to Council members.

A second activity, in which many of us have participated, has been the Provost's strategic planning meetings. The purpose of these meetings was to update the strategic plan through the use of a modified SWOT analysis—or strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats. The Provost has collected and is now collating and summarizing the data from these meetings. It is expected that the Provost will introduce the plan at tomorrow's Senior Leadership Meeting with the roll out for the plan scheduled for December 17<sup>th</sup>.

Finally, the GCEC needs to report on a matter that came to our attention shortly after returning from break. About two weeks ago, Chair Piazza, was notified that a number of graduate programs had a hold placed on new admissions back in spring 2012. Most of the program personnel with whom he had spoken with were aware of these holds. After further investigation, it was determined that there were five identifiable graduate programs and a potential seven others on hold.

Both GC Chair Piazza and the Faculty Senate Chair, Dr. Mike Dowd, and the Chair-Elect of Faculty Senate, Dr. Linda Rouillard, met with Provost Scarborough to discuss those programs affected by the hold. Provost Scarborough said that he was unaware that these programs had their admissions on hold and promised to investigate. This investigation is ongoing and is being conducted out of the Provost's office by Dr. Tom Gutteridge.

Dean Komuniecki is also looking into this matter. Once the investigation is complete, Chair Piazza said that he and Dean Komuniecki plan to bring this matter before the Graduate Council as a discussion item, probably sometime early in the spring semester. There are two obvious issues worthy of consideration; the first, is a well-articulated, transparent, and fair process for suspending, closing, or terminating programs, and the second, is that the process be tied somehow into program review. Chair Piazza plans to meet with the Bylaws committee to see how we can insert language into the Bylaws that will accomplish this.

Chair Piazza hopes that such a discussion will result in at least a conceptual framework that will guarantee an evidence-based evaluation that requires the participation of all affected parties and the appropriate faculty governance bodies responsible for programs and curriculum.

#### Report of the Graduate Student Association

Mr. Joshua Waldman, GSA President, reported on a number of programs his organization will be implementing. The GSA is sponsoring a couple of programs scheduled to end on December 13th, the first is a food drive with non-perishable food items are being collected to support the Cherry Street Mission, and the second is, adopt-a-family, whereby donations and gift items have been collected to help a local family in need this holiday season. These programs are supported by graduate students, faculty and the Graduate College staff. Drop off boxes are located in the Student Union and in the College of Graduate Studies office. Both programs are fully supported through volunteer funds and goods.

The GSA plans to initiate a graduate student research award program and is in the planning phases to finalize a draft to present to the General Assembly. The awards may be up to \$2,000 with an initial budget of \$10,000. The Graduate Student Affairs Committee of GC will vet these awards. The awards will be presented at a semi-formal dinner to include faculty and administration.

The GSA is in the early planning phases of putting together a recruiting strategy/program that will involve sending students out to area universities to recruit prospective graduate students. We have positive relationships with liberal arts schools in Ohio and Michigan. We may work with College Associate Deans and Mr. Corey Sampsel in the COGS office to put this program together.

The Midwest Graduate Research Symposium (MGRS) is slated for April 20, 2013. To date, five universities are represented which may be a result of earlier registration than previous years. Mr. Aaron Shaw, GSA Secretary, sent invitations to 62 universities with interest as far as Mississippi. Through the success of the symposium and Mr. Shaw's efforts, the MGRS is gaining national recognition. GSA requested Council support to help insure that UT is well represented. Visit [www.utoledogsa.com/information](http://www.utoledogsa.com/information) to register.

If you are someone you know is interested in serving as a judge, please register by visiting [www.utoledogsa.com](http://www.utoledogsa.com) and clicking "judges registration" on the left hand side of the screen.

#### Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dean Komuniecki was pleased to have the opportunity to celebrate the holiday season with some light refreshments at today's GC meeting. She thanked Ms. Terri Hayes and Ms. Denise Gayer for making the arrangements. It was also a great pleasure to recognize the new University Fellows.

Since Dean Komuniecki will be presenting a summary of some of the key sessions at the Council of Graduate School Annual Meeting that she attended last week, her executive report was brief:

- Enrollment and Admissions Updates

Spring 2013 Enrollment - Reports are now being generated and as of last week, the headcount looks about the same as spring 2012, but the FTE is slightly lower; no doubt due to continuing students not yet registering. She urged Council to encourage students to register!

Fall 2013 Applications - COGS is entering the very busy application season for fall with most of the program deadlines in January and February. We have already processed 1,466 applications, which is 142 more than this time last year. So prospects are bright. She stressed the importance of admissions committees reviewing applications promptly in order to recruit the strongest students.

- Strategic Planning and Budget

The new Main Campus Strategic Plan entitled "Imagine 2017" has been drafted with the input of diverse groups of faculty, staff, academic administrators and students. It will be presented for additional input on Wednesday, December 12th to the Full Senior Leadership Team at their quarterly meeting, and it is anticipated that it will be released on December 17th. As your Dean, Dr. Komuniecki has been actively involved in the discussions for the past 2 and ½ months and is participating in five hours of sessions today, December 11<sup>th</sup>. There are no updates on the budget distributions for FY14 yet, but hopefully there will be news by the next Council meeting.

- Academic Affairs

- o As a reminder, the online orientation website is open for any new students beginning their programs in January 2013.

- o Low GPA reports will be distributed the day after final grades have been entered, so it is very important that all faculty enter their grades in a timely fashion.

- o Commencement is this Saturday, December 15, 2012 at 10:00 a.m. Dean Komuniecki looks forward to seeing many of you there to assist with the ceremony or to hood your doctoral students.

Congratulations to all the graduating students!

- COGS Fellowships, Scholarships and Awards are all due February 8, 2013.  
University Fellowships- please have your top applicants apply for this most prestigious fellowship.  
Diversity Fellowships- there are two fellowship opportunities for under-represented students including the GOAP and McNair Scholar Awards-please encourage any qualified applicants to apply for these awards. Awards for Current Graduate Students- All the descriptions and applications are available on the COGS website under the current graduate student link.
- Points of Pride  
The College of Business and Innovation was recognized as one of the top 1,000 colleges of business worldwide in 154 countries by *Eduniversal*. Only 180 B-schools in the USA were recognized this year in one of four categories. UT's College of Business and Innovation was rated excellent, the top rating, and was the only ranked college in NW Ohio (1 out of 4 in Ohio).

The Department of History in the College of Languages, Literature and Social Sciences held a graduate student research colloquium last month with presenters from BGSU and Eastern Michigan as well as UT.

### ***Information and Discussion Items***

#### Updates from Council of Graduate Schools 2012 Annual Meeting

Dean Komuniecki summarized some of the key sessions at the 52<sup>nd</sup> Annual Meeting of the Council of Graduate Schools that she attended last week, December 5 -8, 2012 in Washington, D.C. The main theme was Creativity and Innovation in Graduate Education.

- There were six to seven plenary lectures and dozens of workshops-with more than 700 graduate deans attending. All the presentations will be online within the next week but today she wanted to share some highlights.
- There was a major discussion on online learning and the role of MOOCs. A Plenary Panel discussion was moderated by Jeffrey Selingo, Editor At Large of "The Chronicle of Higher Education" and included Anand Agarwal, the President of EdX, who noted that MOOCs should be used to augment graduate education, but face-to-face interactions are critical to creative and critical thinking in graduate education. Tufts University President Emeritus Lawrence Bacom stated that professors are remembered for how they approach scholarship. They commented that 2012 was the 'year of disruption' and that they are still many unanswered questions regarding the business model, learning outcomes and sustainability of MOOCs.
- The new NSF director, Subra Suresh, discussed fiscal cliff issues and emphasized that graduate research is the essence of graduate education. He plans to maintain funding to graduate programs, particularly the Graduate Research Fellowship Program. He noted that 50% of the Nobel laureates in economics had received NSF Graduate Fellowships- a good predictor of future research promise! He also spoke to domestic students having better understanding of cultures and collaborations. The new GROW program will provide new funding for global research opportunities. He noted four key trends of current year: global challenges, borderless knowledge enterprise, shifting demographics, and numbers coming to graduate school. There are other options outside of U.S. including the recent trend for students from India and China to study at universities in their home countries.
- The opening Plenary Lecture presented by David Brooks, NPR Commentator and New York Times Columnist focused on "Transitions facing Higher Education". He noted that online education, dataism (mega data), global issues, and the 'cognitive revolution' (which includes evaluation of credit hour -time sitting in class, or certificates or other). He commented on the trend toward team learning, and the trend to focus on concrete knowledge and job skills.

He discussed ‘What constitutes a university’? It creates status and a shared ethos –a way of thinking at an actual physical university. Each university should take stock of its own ethos. As an aside, that is consistent with the idea that the Provost has to solidify and transmit our identity by better ‘branding’.

- Dean Komuniecki also attended several workshops, including the following:
- Tracking of graduate students.
  - Preparing Graduate Students for the Global Workforce.
  - Broadening Participation in Graduate Education

Discussion:

Dr. Hoss questioned how can online education be used better? Dean Komuniecki responded that one of the major points from Main Campus strategic plan is a branding of online education at UT as UTXnet. It makes sense when the discipline is appropriate. Currently, three of the eight online graduate degree programs offered are in Nursing. She noted that if there is more than a 50% change in a face-to-face program to be delivered online, then notification is required for RACGS through Dean Komuniecki and to HLC through Dr. Penny Poplin Gosetti. One example of a creative online delivery might be the PSM in Photovoltaics –taught here, lectured captured and delivered to graduate students in the UAE and other countries. Their required internships can be done in their home countries. There is demand for this. In the future, our graduate applicants will have MOOC credentials and programs will need to evaluate them. Again, Dean Komuniecki stressed that when more than 50% a program is online, COGS should be contacted to assist in coordinating RACGS requirements.

### ***Standing Committee Reports***

#### Report of the Curriculum Committee

None.

#### Report of the Membership Committee

Dr. David Giovannucci, Membership Committee member, presented the following report which summarized the committee’s recent recommendations. Motion to accept report. Report accepted.

<b>GRADUATE FACULTY MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS</b>							
<b>Fall 2012</b>							
<b>College</b>	<b>Full</b>	<b>Associate I</b>	<b>Associate II</b>	<b>Adjunct</b>	<b>Special Status</b>	<b>Returned</b>	<b>Total</b>
Business	1	1					2
Engineering	4			6			10
JHCSHS	1		2	10	11		24
Law							
LLSS	5			4			9
Medicine	4	1	1		2		8
NSM	8			1	2		11
Nursing	1		6				7
Pharmacy							
Honors							
VPA	2	1	4	3			10
<b>Total</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>15</b>		<b>81</b>

***Old Business***

None.

***New Business***

Dean Komuniecki mentioned that under the new Main Campus strategic plan, there will be five portals of entry to higher education, including COGS as the portal for graduate and professional students. She will keep GC apprised.

***Adjournment***

There being no further business the Council adjourned at 2:01 p.m.